



MINUTES

AUDIT COMMITTEE

**HELD 2017 SEPTEMBER 14 AT 9:30 AM
IN THE COUNCIL CHAMBER**

PRESENT:

Councillor E. Woolley, Chair
Councillor R. Pootmans, Vice-Chair
Councillor S. Chu
Citizen Representative, Mr. M. Dalton
Citizen Representative, Mr. S. Qureshi

ALSO PRESENT:

Chief Financial Officer E. Sawyer
A/Chief Financial Officer C. Male
City Auditor K. Palmer
Executive Assistant C. Smillie
External Auditor H. Gill
Legislative Assistant D. Williams

This meeting was conducted in accordance with the Procedure Bylaw 44M2006, as amended.

RECOGNITION

Councillor Woolley, on behalf of the Audit Committee, thanked Shivon Crabtree for her dedication and tremendous work over the last two years. In recognition of her valuable contributions and her service, as a Citizen Member, to the Audit Committee and The City of Calgary I would like to present her with a token of appreciation – to be provided at a later time.

1. CONFIRMATION OF AGENDA

CONFIRM AGENDA, Moved by Councillor Chu, that the Agenda for the 2017 September 14 Regular Meeting of the Audit Committee be confirmed.

CARRIED

2. CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES

2.1 MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE AUDIT COMMITTEE, 2017 JULY 27

CONFIRM MINUTES, Moved by Mr. Qureshi, that the Minutes of the Regular Meeting of the Audit Committee held on 2017 July 27, be confirmed.

CARRIED

3. ITEMS FROM ADMINISTRATION AND COMMITTEES

3.1 SUB-COMMITTEE ON EXTERNAL AUDITOR SELECTION (VERBAL), AC2017-0668

RECOGNITION

Councillor Woolley, on behalf of the Audit Committee, thanked Citizen Members, Ms. Shivon Crabtree, Mr. Shahid Qureshi, Councillor Pincott and Councillor Pootmans for their collaboration of work on the Sub-Committee on External Auditor Selection.

APPROVE, Moved by Mr. Qureshi, that That with respect to Verbal Report AC2017-0668, and the appointment of Deloitte LLP as the External Auditor for The City of Calgary for 2018 – 2022, the Audit Committee:

1. Thank the members of the Sub-Committee on External Auditor Selection for their service in overseeing the selection process; and
2. Recommend that the Sub-Committee on External Auditor Selection be disbanded as the work of the Committee is now complete.

CARRIED

3.2 CALGARY CONVENTION CENTRE AUTHORITY AUDIT COMMITTEE ANNUAL REPORT, AC2017-0476

SPEAKERS

1. Darren Demchuk, Calgary Convention Centre Authority, Audit and Finance Committee Chair
2. Tom Bornhorst, Calgary Convention Centre Authority, Chair
3. Maria Tobias-Antal, Calgary TELUS Convention Centre, Vice President Ways and Means

APPROVE, Moved by Mr. Dalton, that the Recommendation contained in Report AC2017-0476 be approved, as follows:

That the Audit Committee receives this Report for information.

CARRIED

3.3 CALGARY HOUSING COMPANY AUDIT AND RISK MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE ANNUAL REPORT, AC2017-0478

DISTRIBUTION

At the request of Sarah Woodgate and with the concurrence of the Chair, the Legislative Assistant distributed copies of a PowerPoint presentation entitled "Calgary Housing Company" dated 2017 September 14, with respect to Report AC2017-0478.

SPEAKERS

1. Sarah Woodgate, Calgary Housing Company, Director
2. Murray Tait, Calgary Housing Company, Member

REFER, Moved by Councillor Pootmans, that Report AC2017-0478 be referred to the Calgary Housing Company Audit and Finance Committee, to return to the Audit Committee at the 2017 December 14 Meeting, with a report providing more comprehensive details as requested by the Chair of Audit in his letter of 2017 March 30.

CARRIED

3.4 UTILITY BILLING AUDIT, AC2017-0661

APPROVE, Moved by Councillor Chu, that the Recommendations contained in Report AC2017-0661 be approved, as follows:

1. That the Audit Committee receives this Report for information; and
2. That the Audit Committee recommend that Council receive this report for information.

CARRIED

3.5 9-1-1 CALL CENTRE AUDIT, AC2017-0664

DISTRIBUTION

With the concurrence of the Chair, the Legislative Assistant distributed copies of Page 21 of 21 of the Attachment to Report AC2017-0664.

Councillor Woolley left the Chair at 10:32 a.m. and Councillor Pootmans assumed the Chair.

Councillor Woolley resumed the Chair at 10:34 a.m. and Councillor Pootmans returned to his seat in Committee.

APPROVE, Moved by Mr. Qureshi, that the Recommendations contained in Report AC2017-0664 be approved, as follows:

1. That the Audit Committee receives this Report for information; and
2. That the Audit Committee recommend that Council receive this report for information.

CARRIED

4. URGENT BUSINESS

No items of Urgent Business were added to today's Meeting.

IN CAMERA, Moved by Mr. Dalton, that in accordance with Section 197 of the *Municipal Government Act* and Sections 16, 19 and 24 of the *Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act*, the Audit Committee move In camera, at 10:44 a.m., in order to consider the In Camera agenda.

CARRIED

The Audit Committee moved into public session at 11:14 a.m. with Councillor Woolley in the Chair.

RISE AND REPORT, Moved by Mr. Dalton, that the Audit Committee rise and report.

CARRIED

5. IN CAMERA ITEMS

5.1 CITY AUDITOR'S OFFICE 2018 BUDGET PROPOSAL, AC2017-0687

DISTRIBUTION

At the request of the Administration and with the concurrence of the Chair, the Legislative Assistant distributed copies of Report AC2017-0687 and that it remain confidential pursuant to Section 24 of the *Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act*.

APPROVE, Moved by Mr. Qureshi, that with respect to Report AC2017-0687, the following be approved:

That the Audit Committee:

1. Support the City Auditor's proposal of a reduction of \$77,000 from the CAO 2018 base operating budget, as part of Council's approval of the 2017 November 27-30 Adjustments to 2018 Business Plan and Budget; and
2. Recommend that this Report and In Camera discussions remain confidential under Section 24 of the *Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act* until January 1, 2018; and
3. Refer this item to the Administration to be considered in the 2017 November 27-30 Adjustments to 2018 Business Plan and Budget.

CARRIED

5.2 AUDIT COMMITTEE ANNUAL SELF-ASSESSMENT (2016-2017), AC2017-0637

DISTRIBUTION

With the concurrence of the Chair, the Legislative Assistant distributed copies of Page 1 of 18 of the Confidential Attachment to Report AC2017-0637 and that it remain confidential pursuant to Sections 16 and 19 of the *Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act*.

APPROVE, Moved by Councillor Pootmans, that with respect to Report AC2017-0637, the following be approved:

That the Audit Committee:

1. Receives this Report and Attachment for information; and
2. Keep this Report, Attachment and the In Camera discussion confidential pursuant to Sections 16 and 19 of the *Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act*.

CARRIED

5.3 UPDATE OF EXTERNAL AUDITOR PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT TEMPLATE, AC2017-0642

APPROVE, Moved by Mr. Dalton, that with respect to Report AC2017-0642, the following be approved:

That the Audit Committee:

1. Approve Recommendation 1 contained in Report AC2017-0642; and
2. Directs that this Report, Attachments and In Camera discussion remain confidential pursuant to Section 24 of the *Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act*.

CARRIED

5.4 AUDIT FORUM (VERBAL REPORT), AC2017-0639

APPROVE, Moved by Councillor Chu, that with respect to Verbal Report AC2017-0639, the following be approved:

That the Audit Committee:

1. Receives the Audit Forum (Verbal Report) for information; and
2. Directs that the Verbal Report and In Camera discussions remain confidential pursuant to Sections 16 and 24 of the *Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act*.

CARRIED

5.5 CITY AUDITOR (VERBAL REPORT), AC2017-0640

APPROVE, Moved by Councillor Chu, that with respect to Verbal Report AC2017-0640, the following be approved:

That the Audit Committee:

1. Receives the City Auditor (Verbal Report) for information; and
2. Directs that the Verbal Report and In Camera discussions remain confidential pursuant to Sections 16 and 24 of the *Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act*.

CARRIED

5.6 EXTERNAL AUDITOR (VERBAL REPORT), AC2017-0641

APPROVE, Moved by Councillor Pootmans, that with respect to Verbal Report AC2017-0641, the following be approved:

That the Audit Committee:

1. Receives the External Auditor (Verbal Report) for information; and
2. Directs that the Verbal Report and In Camera discussions remain confidential pursuant to Sections 16 and 24 of the *Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act*.

CARRIED

6. URGENT BUSINESS IN CAMERA

No items of Urgent Business, In Camera, were added to today's Meeting.

7. ADJOURNMENT

ADJOURN, Moved by Councillor Pootmans that this meeting adjourn at 11:19 a.m.

CARRIED

CONFIRMED BY COMMITTEE ON 2017 DECEMBER 14.

CHAIR

LEGISLATIVE ASSISTANT

THE FOLLOWING ITEM HAS BEEN FORWARDED TO THE 2017 NOVEMBER 13 REGULAR MEETING OF COUNCIL:

CONSENT:

UTILITY BILLING AUDIT, AC2017-0661

9-1-1 CALL CENTRE AUDIT, AC2017-0664

The next Regular Meeting of the Audit Committee has been scheduled to be held on 2017 December 14 at 9:30 AM.

UNCONFIRMED