



**MINUTES
AUDIT COMMITTEE**

**April 18, 2024, 9:30 AM
ENGINEERING TRADITIONS COMMITTEE ROOM**

PRESENT: Councillor E. Spencer, Chair
Councillor R. Pootmans, Vice-Chair
Councillor C. Walcott
Councillor J. Wyness
Public Member K. Kim
Public Member C. McGillivray

ABSENT: Public Member J. Naicker

ALSO PRESENT: Chief Administrative Officer D. Duckworth
Chief Financial Officer C. Male
City Auditor L. Ormsby
External Auditor H. Gill
Executive Advisor C. Smillie
A/City Clerk S. Lancashire
Legislative Advisor J. Phillips

1. CALL TO ORDER

Councillor Spencer called the meeting to order at 9:30 a.m.

ROLL CALL

Councillor Pootmans, Councillor Walcott, Councillor Wyness, Public Member Kim, Public Member McGillivray, and Councillor Spencer

Absent from Roll Call: Public Member Naicker

2. OPENING REMARKS

Councillor Spencer provided opening remarks and a traditional land acknowledgement.

3. CONFIRMATION OF AGENDA

Moved by Councillor Walcott

That the Agenda for the 2024 April 18 Regular Meeting of the Audit Committee be confirmed.

MOTION CARRIED

4. CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES

4.1 Minutes of the Regular Meeting of the Audit Committee, 2024 March 14

Moved by Public Member Kim

That the Minutes of the 2024 March 14 Regular Meeting of the Audit Committee be confirmed.

MOTION CARRIED

5. CONSENT AGENDA

5.1 DEFERRALS AND PROCEDURAL REQUESTS

None

6. POSTPONED REPORTS

None

7. ITEMS FROM OFFICERS, ADMINISTRATION AND COMMITTEES

7.1 The City of Calgary 2023 Annual Investment Report, AC2024-0460

Moved by Public Member McGillivray

That with respect to Report AC2024-0460, the following be approved:

That the Audit Committee recommends Council approval of The City of Calgary 2023 Annual Investment Report.

For: (6): Councillor Spencer, Councillor Pootmans, Councillor Walcott, Councillor Wyness, Public Member Kim, and Public Member McGillivray

MOTION CARRIED

7.2 The City of Calgary 2023 Annual Financial Report, AC2024-0438

By General Consent, Committee agreed to hear Items 7.2 and 7.3 concurrently.

Moved by Councillor Wyness

That with respect to Report AC2024-0438, the following be approved:

That the Audit Committee recommend that Council:

1. Consider this report in conjunction with Report AC2024-0479 "External Auditor 2023 Year-End Report"; and
2. Approve of The City of Calgary 2023 Annual Financial Report.

For: (6): Councillor Spencer, Councillor Pootmans, Councillor Walcott, Councillor Wyness, Public Member Kim, and Public Member McGillivray

MOTION CARRIED

7.3 External Auditor 2023 Year-End Report, AC2024-0479

Moved by Councillor Pootmans

That pursuant to Sections 24 (Advice from officials) and 25 (Disclosure harmful to economic and other interests of a public body) of the *Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act*, Committee now move into Closed Meeting, at 11:05 a.m. in the Engineering Traditions Committee Room, to discuss confidential matters with respect to Item 7.3 External Auditor 2023 Year-End Report, AC2024-0479.

And further, that the following be authorized to attend the Closed Meeting: Harman Gill, Nicole Torgrimson, Sanjeev Rajani, and Simona Milojevik, External Auditors (Deloitte LLP), and Jordan Melanson, ENMAX Corporation.

For: (6): Councillor Spencer, Councillor Pootmans, Councillor Walcott, Councillor Wyness, Public Member Kim, and Public Member McGillivray

MOTION CARRIED

People in attendance during the Part 1 Closed Meeting discussions with respect to Report AC2024-0479:

Clerks: S. Lancashire, J. Booth, and J. Phillips. Chief Administrative Officer: D. Duckworth. Advice: C. Male, L. Tochor, C. Smillie, T. Rathie, N. Hiscock, A. Brown, C. An, D. Smith, and C. Bowen. External: H. Gill, S. Milojevik, S. Rajani, N. Torgrimson, and J. Melanson.

People in attendance during the Part 2 Closed Meeting discussions with respect to Report AC2024-0479:

Clerks: S. Lancashire, J. Booth, and J. Phillips. Advice: C. Smillie. External: H. Gill, S. Milojevik, S. Rajani, and N. Torgrimson.

Committee reconvened in public meeting at 11:44 a.m. with Councillor Spencer in the Chair.

ROLL CALL

Councillor Pootmans, Councillor Walcott, Councillor Wyness, Public Member Kim, Public Member McGillivray, and Councillor Spencer

Absent from Roll Call: Public Member Naicker

Moved by Public Member McGillivray

That Committee rise and report.

MOTION CARRIED

Moved by Councillor Wyness

That with respect to Report AC2024-0479, the following be approved:

That the Audit Committee recommend that Council:

1. Receive this report and attachments for the Corporate Record and consider them in conjunction with Report AC2024-0438, The City of Calgary 2023 Annual Financial Report;
2. Recommend that Council receives Report AC2024-0479, External Auditor 2023 Year-End Report, and the attachments, for information and the Corporate Record; and
3. Recommend that Attachment 2 and the Closed Meeting discussions be held confidential pursuant to Sections 24 (Advice from officials) and 25 (Disclosure harmful to economic and other interests of a public body) of the *Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act*, to be reviewed by 2029 April 18.

For: (6): Councillor Spencer, Councillor Pootmans, Councillor Walcott, Councillor Wyness, Public Member Kim, and Public Member McGillivray

MOTION CARRIED

7.4 2023 Whistle-blower Program Internal Benchmark Report, AC2024-0511

By General Consent, Committee modified the lunch recess to begin following the conclusion of Item 7.4.

Moved by Councillor Walcott

That with respect to Report AC2024-0511, the following be approved:

That the Audit Committee:

1. Receive this report for the Corporate Record; and
2. Recommend that Council receive this report for the Corporate Record.

For: (6): Councillor Spencer, Councillor Pootmans, Councillor Walcott, Councillor Wyness, Public Member Kim, and Public Member McGillivray

MOTION CARRIED

Committee recessed at 12:03 p.m. and reconvened in public meeting at 1:02 p.m. with Councillor Spencer in the Chair.

ROLL CALL

Councillor Pootmans, Councillor Walcott, Councillor Wyness, Public Member Kim, Public Member McGillivray, and Councillor Spencer

Absent from Roll Call: Public Member Naicker

7.5 Safety Management Audit, AC2024-0488

Moved by Councillor Walcott

That with respect to Report AC2024-0488, the following be approved:

That the Audit Committee:

1. Receive this report for the Corporate Record; and

2. Recommend that Council receive this report for the Corporate Record.

For: (6): Councillor Spencer, Councillor Pootmans, Councillor Walcott, Councillor Wyness, Public Member Kim, and Public Member McGillivray

MOTION CARRIED

7.6 City Auditor's Office 1st Quarter 2024 Report, AC2024-0489

By General Consent, Committee postponed Report AC2024-0439 to be dealt with in Closed Meeting.

Moved by Councillor Pootmans

That pursuant to Sections 20 (Disclosure harmful to law enforcement), 24 (Advice from officials), and 25 (Disclosure harmful to economic and other interests of a public body) of the *Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act*, Committee now move into Closed Meeting, at 1:59 p.m. in the Engineering Traditions Committee Room, to discuss confidential matters with respect to the following Items:

- 7.6 City Auditor's Office 1st Quarter 2024 Report, AC2024-0489
- 7.7 ENMAX Corporation 2023 Annual Report, AC2024-0413
- 10.1.1 External Auditor (Verbal), AC2024-048110.1.2 External Auditor (Verbal), AC2024-0284
- 10.1.2 Audit Forum (Verbal), AC2024-0480
- 10.1.3 City Auditor (Verbal), AC2024-0482

And further, that the following be authorized to attend the Closed Meeting with respect to Items 7.6, 7.7, and 10.1.1: Harman Gill, Nicole Torgrimson, Sanjeev Rajani, and Simona Milojevik, External Auditors (Deloitte LLP).

And further, that the following be authorized to attend the Closed Meeting with respect to Item 7.7: Eric Markell, Mark Poweska, Sheri Primrose, Jade Lee, Jennifer Saldana, and Megan Young, ENMAX Corporation.

For: (6): Councillor Spencer, Councillor Pootmans, Councillor Walcott, Councillor Wyness, Public Member Kim, and Public Member McGillivray

MOTION CARRIED

Committee reconvened in public meeting at 3:03 p.m. with Councillor Spencer in the Chair.

ROLL CALL

Councillor Pootmans, Councillor Walcott, Councillor Wyness, Public Member Kim, Public Member McGillivray, and Councillor Spencer

Absent from Roll Call: Public Member Naicker

Moved by Councillor Pootmans

That Committee rise and report

MOTION CARRIED

People in attendance during the Closed Meeting discussions with respect to Report AC2024-0489:

Clerks: S. Lancashire, J. Booth, and J. Phillips. Advice: C. Male, L. Tochor, J. Bradley, L. Ormsby, C. Smillie, R. Visscher, and A. Brown. External: H. Gill, S. Milojevik, S. Rajani, and N. Torgrimson.

Moved by Public Member Kim

That with respect to Report AC2024-0489, the following be approved:

That the Audit Committee:

1. Receive this report for the Corporate Record;
2. Recommend that Council receive this report for the Corporate Record; and
3. Recommend that Attachment 2 to Report AC2024-0489 and the Closed Meeting discussions be held confidential pursuant to Sections 20 (Disclosure harmful to law enforcement) and 24 (Advice from officials) of the *Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act*, to be reviewed by 2039 April 18.

For: (6): Councillor Spencer, Councillor Poetmans, Councillor Walcott, Councillor Wyness, Public Member Kim, and Public Member McGillivray

MOTION CARRIED

7.7 ENMAX Corporation 2023 Annual Report, AC2024-0413

People in attendance during the Closed Meeting discussions with respect to Report AC2024-0413:

Clerks: S. Lancashire, J. Booth, and J. Phillips. Law: L. Bonnett and C. Kendrew. Advice: C. Male, L. Tochor, L. Ormsby, C. Smillie, and A. Brown. External: H. Gill, S. Milojevik, S. Rajani, N. Torgrimson, E. Markell, M. Poweska, S. Primrose, J. Lee, J. Saldana, and M. Young.

Moved by Public Member McGillivray

That with respect to Report AC2024-0413, the following be approved:

That Audit Committee:

1. Receive this report and presentation for the Corporate Record; and
2. Direct that Attachments 5, 8, 9, 15, 16, 17 and the Closed Meeting discussions be held confidential pursuant to Sections 24 (Advice from officials) and 25 (Disclosure harmful to economic and other interests of a public body) of the *Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act*, to be reviewed by 2039 April 18.

For: (6): Councillor Spencer, Councillor Pootmans, Councillor Walcott, Councillor Wyness, Public Member Kim, and Public Member McGillivray

MOTION CARRIED

8. ITEMS DIRECTLY TO COMMITTEE

8.1 REFERRED REPORTS

None

8.2 NOTICE(S) OF MOTION

None

9. URGENT BUSINESS

None

10. CONFIDENTIAL ITEMS

10.1 ITEMS FROM OFFICERS, ADMINISTRATION AND COMMITTEES

10.1.1 External Auditor (Verbal), AC2024-0481

No report given.

10.1.2 Audit Forum (Verbal), AC2024-0480

Administration in attendance during the Closed Meeting discussions with respect to Confidential Verbal Report AC2024-0480:

Clerks: S. Lancashire, J. Booth, and J. Phillips. Advice: C. Male, L. Tochor, L. Ormsby, C. Smillie, and A. Brown.

Moved by Councillor Wyness

That with respect to Confidential Verbal Report AC2024-0480, the following be approved:

That the Audit Committee direct that the Closed Meeting discussions be held confidential pursuant to Section 24 (Advice from officials) of the *Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act*.

For: (6): Councillor Spencer, Councillor Pootmans, Councillor Walcott, Councillor Wyness, Public Member Kim, and Public Member McGillivray

MOTION CARRIED

10.1.3 City Auditor (Verbal), AC2024-0482

Administration in attendance during the Closed Meeting discussions with respect to Confidential Verbal Report AC2024-0482:

Clerks: S. Lancashire, J. Booth, and J. Phillips. Advice: L. Ormsby and C. Smillie.

Moved by Councillor Walcott

That with respect to Confidential Verbal Report AC2024-0482, the following be approved:

That the Audit Committee direct that the Closed Meeting discussions be held confidential pursuant to Section 24 (Advice from officials) of the *Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act*.

For: (6): Councillor Spencer, Councillor Pootmans, Councillor Walcott, Councillor Wyness, Public Member Kim, and Public Member McGillivray

MOTION CARRIED

10.2 URGENT BUSINESS

None

11. BRIEFINGS

None

12. ADJOURNMENT

Moved by Public Member Kim

That this meeting adjourn at 3:07 p.m.

MOTION CARRIED

The following Items have been forwarded to the 2024 April 30 Regular Meeting of Council:

CONSENT AGENDA

- The City of Calgary 2023 Annual Investment Report, AC2024-0460
- The City of Calgary 2023 Annual Financial Report, AC2024-0438
- External Auditor 2023 Year-End Report, AC2024-0479
- 2023 Whistle-blower Program Internal Benchmark Report, AC2024-0511
- Safety Management Audit, AC2024-0488
- City Auditor's Office 1st Quarter 2024 Report - AC2024-0489

The next Regular Meeting of the Audit Committee is scheduled to be held on 2024 June 13 at 9:30 a.m.

CONFIRMED BY COMMITTEE ON

CHAIR

CITY CLERK