

#	Page	Conclusion / Recommendations	Business Unit Response	Action Items	Status
1	29	Access Calgary operates an efficient specialized public transit system. It delivers trips at a cost equal to, or below, comparative jurisdictions examined. A major reason for this cost effectiveness is the effective management of a contracted – out service delivery model. This model is proving itself here and elsewhere and is now recognized as a best practice in specialized public transit delivery. This should not change.	Agreed	Access Calgary (AC) will continually look for ways to optimize the delivery of service to ensure customers are served.	Ongoing - No further update/action is required
2	31	A policy stating the position of The City of Calgary should be formulated related to the practice of prioritizing or restricting trips	Agreed - budget based	AC utilises trip prioritization as one way to manage demand when budget, resources or other extraordinary circumstances (e.g. extreme weather, etc.) limit the ability to provide all trips. Trips are classified into four categories; medical, work, education and personal. When there is a requirement to limit service, some personal trips are not accommodated. Stakeholders including the AC Advisory Committee agree that trip purpose is a vital consideration when allocating available service. The elimination of this demand management tool will lead to requests for additional service and thus more funding. The City accepts the risk of a challenge to this policy.	The recommendation was discussed with the Access Calgary Advisory Committee in October 2014 and unanimously agreed that with current limited resources we should continue with trip prioritization when required. No further update/action required at this time.

Access Calgary Performance Audit -
Management Response to Recommendations

#	Page	Conclusion / Recommendations	Business Unit Response	Action Items	Status
3	32	(i) Access Calgary has reached an effective compromise in defining the service area as within 1.0 km of a transit location. The size, geographical characteristics, and growth of Calgary, make it difficult and costly to provide service beyond the existing service area. (ii) If decisions are made to extend Access Calgary's service area these should be accompanied by: - options to charge premium rates for services delivered beyond the existing service area, or - increase in operating budget to cover the added costs of extending service. Otherwise, Access Calgary will continue to feel the pressure between customer demand and budget constraints.	Agreed	In 2013 December, City Council changed Access Calgary's service area policy from one kilometre within a Calgary Transit (CT) stop to providing service to the city limits. This included a direction to not charge any additional fees for these areas.	Access Calgary now provides service to the city limits and as expected demand is steadily growing. There were approximately 3,500 trips requested in 2014 which would have been outside the previous 1 km service area policy. The average distance of 24.9 km a trip and an average cost of \$50.84. No further update/action required.
4	34	Access Calgary has successfully managed its customer base through application of a sound eligibility program. This has resulted in significant cost savings to operations and successfully reduced demand. There is a downside to this success. Access Calgary has done as much as it can in this regard. Demand volume can now be expected to climb and	Agreed	AC has a best practices model which also meets the Canadian Urban Transit Association's (CUTA) - Canadian Code of Practice for Determining Eligibility. This includes balancing the requirement to assess the eligibility of an individual in a respectful and dignified manner. This model also provides applicants an appeal process in the event they do not agree with a	The current eligibility program will continue. No further update/action required.

Access Calgary Performance Audit - Management Response to Recommendations

#	Page	Conclusion / Recommendations	Business Unit Response	Action Items	Status
		there is little Access Calgary can do in using eligibility process to help curb this demand.		decision made by the eligibility specialist.	
5	38	Improving on-time arrival performance represents a significant improvement opportunity for Access Calgary in terms of both customer satisfaction and reducing cost and demand on call centre operations. Access Calgary has undertaken efforts at improving its performance on this metric. We recommend that Access Calgary make improvement in on-time arrival performance a strategic priority for operations over the next two years. Access Calgary management should develop plans and budgets to reflect this priority.	Agreed	AC has a combined on-time performance (OTP) of 90% within a 20 minute window. Peers use a 30 minute window to measure OTP which presents a more favourable picture, however not better performance. AC agrees that OTP is a key factor in customer satisfaction, however will have to come up with strategies to address customers who are not ready to board when the vehicle arrives. This has a negative domino effect downstream for drop-offs. Additional resources are required to provide AC some options to minimize delays. An option to consider is increasing the schedule window from 20 minutes to 30 minutes to respond to customer/traffic delays that impact OTP. This would be in alignment with the practice of other paratransit properties. AC will review this option with the AC Advisory Committee. Ongoing actions to monitor and improve on-time performance: Veolia software was purchased in 2014 May to provide better information on OTP of vehicles. In 2014 August, added one Operations Controller to manage service and focus on OTP. An option is to consider is increasing the schedule window from 20 minutes to 30 minutes to respond to customer/traffic delays that impact OTP. This would be in alignment with the practice of other paratransit properties. However this change would be seen by customers as degradation in service quality. AC will review this option with the AC Advisory Committee.	

Access Calgary Performance Audit - Management Response to Recommendations

#	Page	Conclusion / Recommendations	Business Unit Response	Action Items	Status
6	41	There is a seniors tsunami coming. A number of solutions need to be investigated and pursued. These would include: (i) Investigate and pursue the innovative urban design specifically in support of walkable cities that emphasize the mix of residential, commercial and recreational space. (ii) Investigate the development of seniors focused communities that similarly emphasize walkable concepts. (iii) Experiment partnering with extended care facilities providing programs and/or equipment that would allow residents to be served by the facility rather than Access Calgary. (iv) Experiment with community specialized bus transit designed to take seniors to the local mall or community centres. (v) Examine existing fixed route systems for seniors frequency of use and proceed with barrier free, accessible conversions, on	Agreed Agreed	Recommendations (i) and (ii) are anchored in the CTP, MDP, RouteAhead and CNS strategic plans for The City. (iii) In 2014, AC will explore what interest exists for partnering with care agencies for them to provide their own transportation with assistance from The City. Vehicles and driver training could be offered and the care agencies would manage their own transportation requirements. (iv) CT will explore what opportunities there are and determine the cost/benefit of delivering services in this manner (v) CT will have fully accessible bus fleet by Q1 of 2015.	As of 2014 December, all Calgary Transit buses and shuttles are accessible. Access Calgary will be exploring working on integration with CT fixed route in 2015/16. For example, a customer would take AC from their home to the nearest CTrain station and transfer to the train. The customer would disembark from the CTrain station closest to their destination and AC would transport the customer to their final destination. There has been very little interest expressed by community organizations to partner with bussing their clients. They prefer The City deliver services as they are strained for resources.

Access Calgary Performance Audit -
Management Response to Recommendations

#	Page	Conclusion / Recommendations	Business Unit Response	Action Items	Status
		a route by route basis. (vi) Use specialized public transit feeder service to those routes converted under (v) above.	For Review	(vi) Access Calgary intends to investigate and experiment and learn how best to integrate with CT fixed-route services.	The City implemented the first phase of a pedestrian strategy and Snow & Ice Control (SNIC) which will also improve access to CT. ``Snow Clearing of Pedestrian Priority Areas (PFC2015-0293)``
7	45	Access Calgary provides a good level of customer service. But it isn't as good as reported by the existing customer satisfaction measurement. The current approach generates overly positive results that may be misleading management. Access Calgary needs to adopt a more modern approach to customer satisfaction measurement. This includes measurement that occurs on regular intervals (i.e. every two years) and uses feedback tools that reduce the bias inherent in the current system including using nine point scales for numerical feedback. Better, adopt a customer experience management approach with an independent research firm regularly sampling customers that have taken a	For Review	AC is keen on getting an accurate snapshot of customer satisfaction with the service. The current scales used were set after feedback from stakeholders objected to more detailed scales citing them being harder or impossible for some customers to comprehend. AC will revisit this recommendation and request feedback from the Advisory Committee on Accessibility (ACA) and the AC Advisory Committee and poll customers on which model they prefer. In addition to the customer satisfaction survey which is conducted every two years, AC attempts to conduct informal polls with approximately 15 to 25 customers per day. This request for feedback is well received by customers.	AC is acting on the recommendation and has engaged Converge Consulting to conduct a customer satisfaction survey which is in progress and will be completed in 2015 April. Converge will provide their findings to Access Calgary in 2015 Q2.

**Access Calgary Performance Audit -
Management Response to Recommendations**

#	Page	Conclusion / Recommendations	Business Unit Response	Action Items	Status
		recent trip and reporting results monthly through control or run charts to identify trends and other patterns in the customer satisfaction performance of the systems.		AC will explore the recommendation to hire an external company for more frequent sampling and costs associated and what benefits can be derived.	
8	48	Access Calgary involvement in building a more accessible city needs to be increased. Although arguably beyond the scope of this review, the importance of building an integrated transit system as a fundamental means of reducing the costs of urban transit cannot be ignored. This requires a well organized and coordinated approach across organizational boundaries of the City. Access Calgary needs to be involved and needs the resources to effectively contribute. This may include support from other areas of the organization to support: Strategy development, Fixed route operator training, Increased urban and facility design input.	Agreed	CT agrees with the recommendation. The transit fleet is expected to be fully accessible by 2015 which will provide opportunities for integration between fixed-route and specialized services such as transferring customers to fixed-route. This initiative will require political support as it will create some angst among the community. CT will review the current operator training and assistance provided in serving people with disabilities. CT will continue to act as a proponent for accessibility across the city. However work will be limited due to the demand for AC operations.	CT bus fleet is 100% accessible as of December 2014. AC staff continue to participate as best as it can with limited resources on committees such as SNIC, Greenline, ACA, and other city initiatives. Operator training and disability awareness sessions continue to be conducted. No further update required.

Access Calgary Performance Audit -
Management Response to Recommendations

#	Page	Conclusion / Recommendations	Business Unit Response	Action Items	Status
9	52	Maintain the contracting-out model of service delivery. The contracting-out model has been successful at controlling costs. Using multiple suppliers has contributed to this success, allowing Access Calgary to manage costs more effectively than would otherwise be the case. Concerns about redundancy inherent in the model, multiple operators providing the same service, are simply not borne out by the evidence. Having multiple service providers also allows Access Calgary to better manage business interruption risk with any one of the operators. The entire system is not 'down' should any one provider experience operating difficulties. Access Calgary should encourage continuation of the existing model emphasizing contracting out as the foundation of the model and continuing to emphasize a mix of service providers.	Agreed	CT agrees that the current contracting out model works; However, there are some challenges with certain contractors (effectiveness and efficiency) delivering services. If these cannot be addressed, AC will pursue other options to ensure sustainable transportation for people with disabilities.	AC continues to work with service providers, providing training, setting expectations. It is also exploring options for alternate service delivery with the recent announcement from HandiBus to cease operations in 2015.

Access Calgary Performance Audit -
Management Response to Recommendations

#	Page	Conclusion / Recommendations	Business Unit Response	Action Items	Status
10	53	Access Calgary should remain part of Calgary Transit. The current organizational arrangement of Access Calgary, as an operating entity with its own clear mandate, and operating as part of Calgary Transit, is an effective and efficient arrangement in delivering services and value to the citizens of Calgary. It provides Access Calgary with a clear operating mandate while encouraging a close working relationship with the balance of Calgary Transit that promotes development of accessible fixed route systems. No change to this organizational design should be pursued.	Agreed	Having AC as division of CT, provides a voice for accessibility and allows for informed decision making on infrastructure improvements, fleet purchases and service offerings. AC is able to leverage the expertise available within CT to improve services for people with disabilities.	Agreed, no further update/action is required.

Access Calgary Performance Audit -
Management Response to Recommendations

#	Page	Conclusion / Recommendations	Business Unit Response	Action Items	Status
11	55	Core operating software needs clear lines of responsibility and accountability. Access Calgary is currently engaged in reviewing software alternatives to its existing version of Trapeze. An old version, Trapeze has been experiencing reliability issues and lacks much of the functionality of newer products. It is hoped, and expected, that more up to date software will (i) resolve current reliability issues with Trapeze, and (ii) provide additional functionality. Neither of these benefits will accrue to the organization if the software doesn't work reliably. We therefore suggest: Software as a service/computing in the cloud options be given priority in Access Calgary's current search for replacement paratransit scheduling software. If these options are not available, then an alternative strategy placing clear lines of responsibility for system performance be developed prior to acquisition of any replacement for Trapeze 8.	Agreed	CT and Information Technology are in the process of undertaking a review of the technologies currently in use with the view to improve the reliability, up-time, speed and also failover options in the event of an outage. This includes a review of the support required for AC and identifying clear lines of accountability.	Calgary Transit hired Gartner Group to review and identify a technology strategy. We are reviewing the recommendations and cost implications to plan and support the model. Giro (new scheduling software) will be implemented in Q1 2016. Super users are in training now. No further update/action is required.

Access Calgary Performance Audit - Management Response to Recommendations

#	Page	Conclusion / Recommendations	Business Unit Response	Action Items	Status
12	56	Call centre operations should remain distinct from 311. Access Calgary should retain its own call centre operations. No transfer to 311 operations should take place.	Agreed	AC has a unique role in serving people with disabilities and staff work closely with customers to provide service and respond to their needs. A dedicated Call Centre such as one operated by AC is better positioned to provide quality customer service.	Agreed, no further update/action is required.
13	56	Modern performance measurement methods are required. At least for its internal use, Access Calgary be given the opportunity to engage in modern performance measurement, management and reporting techniques, including the provision of supporting software.	Agreed	Access Calgary will investigate what modern tools are available to measure deliverables such as CRM databases, dashboards, business intelligence tools and provide recommendations for purchase.	Organization review in process aligned with move to the Westbrook Operations Centre. Access Calgary has purchased business intelligence tools which will be delivered in 2016 to more immediate reporting. No further update/action is required.
14	57	Reconsider current funding levels Numerous recommendations in this report call for increases to Access Calgary's budget to allow for service level increases. These must be considered individually. They nonetheless speak of an organization that generally needs additional funding to maintain quality of service.	Agreed	While the current management model is sound and focused on balancing cost and services, additional funding is required to increase service and improve the quality of service. Examples include more service during peak times, better schedule adherence and reduction in time changes.	The request for funding service and quality improvements was only partially approved by Council in Action Plan 2015-2018. AC may struggle to meet all the demands and customer expectations during this period. No further update/action is planned.

Access Calgary Performance Audit -
Management Response to Recommendations

#	Page	Conclusion / Recommendations	Business Unit Response	Action Items	Status
15	57	Software enhancements are required. This report also identifies a number of administrative process improvements in a variety of locations of the organization. Once the new paratransit software package is implemented, Access Calgary needs to pursue other software, including a Customer Relationship Management solution, Statistical Analysis/Data Visualization tool, and an improved tool for financial and operational reconciliations.	Agreed	A consultant will be brought in to review the current data management and recording requirements and the tools used. AC will request recommendations for new tools and software that would streamline and make the information collection and the ability to use it much more effective.	The City's IT department assigned an internal resource to review the CRM needs of Access Calgary. She recommended that AC wait until introduction of the integrated GIRO scheduling software in 2016 Q1, and then determine the gap and address it.
16	58	Pursue a role of accessibility expertise. Access Calgary continue to pursue and more clearly define its role as a source of accessibility expertise within Calgary Transit and the City of Calgary generally.	Agreed	AC struggles to meet all the current service administrative demands placed on staff. During the next business plan cycle (2015-2018) CT will undertake a review on how to increase the scope and ensure that accessibility is taken into consideration when changes in service and design are being considered.	Resources to fully meet the requirements. No further update/action is required.
17a	73	Simplify the application form. Make the application form available in Word with all accessibility options.	Agreed	A revised and shorter application form (from 14 pages to 8 pages) was rolled out 2014 January. This form must be detailed enough to support an effective eligibility process.	Complete

Access Calgary Performance Audit -
Management Response to Recommendations

#	Page	Conclusion / Recommendations	Business Unit Response	Action Items	Status
17b	73	Investigate a Customer Relationship Management system capable of booking appointments at multiple locations.	Agreed	Will review this recommendation with IT and consultant.	See # 15.
17c	74	Eligibility Application Process No Changes recommended	Agreed	Access Calgary will continue to monitor effectiveness of application process and refine as required.	No further update/action is required
17d	74	Recommended that Access Calgary monitor and consult with Edmonton as they move to contracting out model to better assess the strengths and weaknesses of this approach.	Agreed	AC has a "best in class" eligibility model, that is aligned with the CUTA model. AC will monitor and learn from the Edmonton experience.	AC consulted and visited Edmonton to review their recently implemented model. However, Edmonton staff indicated it was too early to determine how well it will work. AC will continue to monitor their model.
17e	74	The Board hearing final appeals is voluntary comprised of community members. Like many voluntary/community Boards, it can be difficult to recruit and retain membership. Access Calgary should work to retain the current appeals board structure and process. It is characterized by high credibility and low cost.	Agreed	The AC Eligibility Appeal Committee has been highly effective, however as observed by the Auditor, it is challenging from time to time to recruit members of the public with specific skill sets. AC will review options such as a per diem to encourage membership.	AC will consider paying a per diem. No further update/action is required.

Access Calgary Performance Audit -
Management Response to Recommendations

#	Page	Conclusion / Recommendations	Business Unit Response	Action Items	Status
18a	90	Access Calgary should adopt a full customer experience management program with the following characteristics: administered by independent third party for confidential responses, ongoing sampling of customers drawn from recent trips, work to sample sizes of approximately 50 completions per month, integrate with complaint management and manager feedback process, control chart analysis of data by month and Pareto chart analysis of data by problem type.	Agreed	AC conducts a Customer Satisfaction Survey every two years, holds two agency meetings with staff that support people with disabilities, and conducts presentations for these agencies, care centres and group homes. In addition, a customer open house is held once a year and a newsletter is published twice a year. AC currently surveys a small percentage of customers on an ad-hoc basis to garner feedback. AC agrees that hiring an external consultant to conduct frequent customer surveys may, at least initially, provide a more comprehensive statistical understanding of how well the service meets customer expectations. AC will conduct research with other Paratransit properties and explore how best to implement such a program and identify the associated costs.	Converge Consulting Group is currently performing a customer satisfaction survey. AC is working with CT Communications to develop more effective customer handouts.

Access Calgary Performance Audit -
Management Response to Recommendations

#	Page	Conclusion / Recommendations	Business Unit Response	Action Items	Status
18b	90	A small (or cloud based) customer relationship management system should be investigated by Access Calgary capable of supporting customer service/complaint management. A similar recommendation was made under the Eligibility section. Tied into the scheduling system, this would provide a single point of customer information overcoming the use of multiple systems that integrate poorly.	Agreed	Will review this recommendation with IT and the consultant.	Study completed in Q4 2014. In progress with implementation of GIRO software in Q1 2016. No further update/action is required.
18c	91	A well defined complaint reporting system needs to be defined highlighting specific metrics and analysis that can reveal systemic trends and patterns in the data. This system needs to publish its report monthly.	Agreed	AC will acquire more sophisticated tools to make it more efficient to analyse the data and identify any patterns and trends. AC will work with IT to investigate and procure a system.	AC has purchased a business intelligence tool (GIRO - Analytics) that will be delivered in 2016 Q2. It should provide the level of reporting required for AC to be more nimble in making service improvements.

Access Calgary Performance Audit - Management Response to Recommendations

#	Page	Conclusion / Recommendations	Business Unit Response	Action Items	Status
18d	91	Based on the evidence provided by systemic analysis (above), Customer Service should identify an annual complaint reduction theme, starting with the most frequent or important complaint, and build an improvement initiative around it incorporating other functions within Access Calgary. Based on our review of Access Calgary, we believe this should focus on the customer/driver touch-point.	Agreed	AC has increased the frequency of driver checks and formalized a more stringent service provider audit process to improve the driver and customer touch points. Driver training refreshers are also being conducted with a focus on the customer interaction. A more sustainable program will be developed this year. AC will require more resources to increase service monitoring in the field.	Focus on Hand Over to caregiver is identified as an ongoing area of focus for 2015. AC will be conducting refreshers for our drivers during 2015. No further update/action is required.
19	108	Access Calgary should use multiple channels of communication with its customers. This should include web-based methods for: informing customers as to their schedule, and cancelling unwanted trips. Customers should be informed of all scheduling changes regardless of time involved. This information should be conveyed by consumer preference: Phone, email, or both.	Agreed	AC does attempt to contact customers when there are changes of more than 15 minutes to their schedule. AC will be introducing web booking in 2016 to provide customers another option to book/cancel their trips. Technology upgrades at the same time, will allow automated call outs to customers when schedule changes are required. Additional staffing is required to reduce the notification threshold from 15 minutes to anything less.	Business process review completed, identifying the need for additional staff to deliver on this objective. However, funding is unavailable at this time. The implementation of the GIRO web-booking and automated call outs modules in 2016 will assist in improving the communication. No further update/action is required.

Access Calgary Performance Audit - Management Response to Recommendations

#	Page	Conclusion / Recommendations	Business Unit Response	Action Items	Status
19b	108	Once web-based functions are introduced, Access Calgary must conduct a process capability study to properly assess capacity alignment with incoming call demand. Performance objectives need to be established. Performance analysis and reporting must use up to date tools using capability analysis to guide decision making.	Agreed	AC does have performance targets for call answer, call length, etc. However, they are lower than what industry recommends due to budget constraints. Web and phone bookings to be introduced in 2016 should help improve the call wait times. During the introduction of this technology, tools to assess web based performance will be developed and targets will be set on industry best practices.	AC continues to measure KPIs and look for improvements on an ongoing basis. The GIRO online booking module will improve response times and the customer experience. Due 2016 Q2. No further update/action is required
19c	109	Capturing the purpose of the trip for planning and scheduling with the customer is desirable. Trip purpose, however, should not be used as a means of priority setting beyond that which can be negotiated over the phone with the customer at the time of booking. Access Calgary needs to amend its budget figures to ensure trips are delivered to customers regardless of purpose.	Agreed	As stated in the response to recommendation #2, AC uses trip prioritization as one way to manage demand when budget, resources or other extraordinary circumstances (e.g. extreme weather, etc.) limit the ability to provide all trips. Stakeholders, including the AC Advisory Committee, agree that trip purpose is a vital consideration when cutting service. AC will require significant funding to provide all trips requested.	Reviewed with Access Calgary Advisory Committee in October 2014 and agreed that with current limited resources we should continue with trip prioritization. No further action required at this time.

Access Calgary Performance Audit -
Management Response to Recommendations

#	Page	Conclusion / Recommendations	Business Unit Response	Action Items	Status
19d	109	Access Calgary must replace its existing Trapeze 8 technology. This should not be done within the existing divided responsibility framework. Implementation of replacement technology, therefore, should be assigned to Access Calgary, or the successful vendor. The latter option implies a software as service (SaaS) model, also referred to as cloud computing, where both hardware and software are located with the vendor. This is becoming an increasingly popular option with IT departments generally.	Agreed	AC is in the process of signing a contract with GIRO. Implementation is scheduled in Q1 of 2016. IT will undertake project to determine AC requirements and what options are available for vendor or dedicated hosting of services.	In process of training and learning GIRO software. Creating training/knowledge repository in WIKI site to assist in transition to new software. No further update/action is required
19e	110	Group bookings of 4 should only be cancelled when two or more cancellations are experienced. Group bookings of more than 4 should be cancelled whenever the number of passengers drops below 4. Acrobat and web-based trip cancellation (when implemented) should recognize return trips and advise the customer of the option to cancel return trips.	Agreed	The current Group Policy requires bookings to consist of 4 customers or 3 customers and 1 attendant. Due to a limitation in the Trapeze software the entire group is cancelled if it occurs through ACROBAT. However, the group booking is kept if the customer contacts AC by phone to cancel. AC will be moving to another scheduling software platform that offers more effective group booking features which will resolve the issue.	Will be resolved with new GIRO scheduling software to be implemented Q1 2016. No further update/action is required

Access Calgary Performance Audit -
Management Response to Recommendations

#	Page	Conclusion / Recommendations	Business Unit Response	Action Items	Status
20	117	Trips Accommodated. Access Calgary budgets and operational planning should incorporate the 100% standard in this performance metric. In other words, a 0% failure rate.	Review	Requiring AC to accommodate all (100%) trips requested will require funding. Customer demand for trips will increase the burden on service providers, staff and thus increase costs and reduce productivity on runs.	AC already provides 99.9% of trips requested. AC will continue to monitor to see if additional budget for more trips is required. We will aspire to 100% but set a budget constrained target. No further update/action is required
21	119	Arrival Time PerformanceImproving arrival time performance should be a strategic initiative of Access Calgary. The performance objective should be 0.0%. An actual performance level of 95% should be sought within the next 2 years.	Review	AC uses a 20 minute pickup window and achieves approx. 90% on-time pickup and drop-offs. Of note, most other cities use a 30 minute window and thus measure their on-time performance based a wider window. AC is working with staff and service providers to maintain the schedule and to try improving schedule adherence. It should be noted that there are factors that impact on-time performance such as severe weather, high traffic volumes, construction, road conditions and accidents. In addition, delays occur when customers are not ready to depart when the AC vehicle arrives to pick them up. Efforts are on-going to educate customers and raise awareness of the negative impact on other customers. Additional funding will be required to increase the on-	On Time Performance continues to be an area of focus. However, without spending additional monies on a significant number of backup vehicles it is difficult to realize such an ideal goal. Will continue to monitor and make adjustments within available budget. We will aspire to 100% but set a budget constrained target. No further update/action is required

Access Calgary Performance Audit -
Management Response to Recommendations

#	Page	Conclusion / Recommendations	Business Unit Response	Action Items	Status
				time performance and reliability.	
22a	132	The basic operating model works well. Contracting out has successfully helped lower costs. The mix of operators lowers the service interruption risk associated with relying on a single operator. This model should remain in use. No changes are recommended.	Agreed	CT agrees that the current contracting out model works, however, there are some challenges with certain contractors (effectiveness and efficiency) delivering services and if these cannot be addressed, AC will pursue other options to ensure sustainable transportation for people with disabilities.	Will continue to review costs and make appropriate changes to deliver effective service. No further update/action is required.
22b	132	Access Calgary needs to work closely with Calgary HandiBus Association (CHBA) in establishing operating arrangements that work for both. This must focus on: Amending the cost structure, Eliminating the legacy elements that are negatively impacting productivity and performance.	Agreed	CT is reviewing its relationship and cost structure with HandiBus. The current funding agreement along with HandiBus' increasing costs and inability to be nimble and flexible are of concern and have been shared with the Chair of HandiBus and their management. HandiBus has embarked on a sustainability study which may provide some options on how to move forward.	Calgary HandiBus Association has decided to cease operations in 2015 based on the findings of their sustainability study. AC and CHBA are implementing actions to effectively maintain service delivery.

Access Calgary Performance Audit -
Management Response to Recommendations

#	Page	Conclusion / Recommendations	Business Unit Response	Action Items	Status
22c	132	Access Calgary should build on its existing program and develop a blended learning driver training program. This program should encompass a back end Learning Management System to track certifications and recertification requirements	Agreed	AC will investigate best practices and available software. Individual employee files kept at the service providers' offices are not shared electronically with AC because of varying software or FOIP. Records can be shared upon request for information relating to the training and development that the service provider employees have taken. Compilation of these records needs to be organized at AC with a suitable software or database.	In 2015 CT will explore E-learning for staff and contractors. AC will develop a driver database to track service provider employee training and ensure drivers have a current AC certification to deliver service.
22d	133	Access Calgary is consistent with best practice in developing and deploying a custom travel training program. The program, however, lacks the resources to be effective. Delivering travel training to between 8 to 10 individuals per month is simply insufficient to provide the kind of impact needed. Like driver training, travel training needs to take a blended approach to expand its reach. This is especially useful in train the trainer programs.	Agreed	AC will investigate opportunities with agencies and in the community. More clarity of what "blended approach" means would be helpful. If the desired meaning is having our full time Travel Trainer reaching out to service organizations on a more regular basis to provide materials and support to their staff/volunteers, it is feasible and additional resources will be required to manage the workload.	AC has approached a couple academic agencies and offered Train the Trainer sessions, however there has not been any uptake, due to lack of funding and resources to support such an initiative. AC will continue to reach out to other external groups to develop train the trainer program.

Access Calgary Performance Audit -
Management Response to Recommendations

#	Page	Conclusion / Recommendations	Business Unit Response	Action Items	Status
22e	133	On time arrival performance needs to be made the primary strategic priority for Access Calgary over the mid term (2 years). Reworking the system to achieve an on-time arrival performance of 95% should have flow through impacts on maximum on board time and on-time drop off performance.	Review	Response provided to Recommendation 21	Inclusion of same day scheduling role in Operations Control Centre (OCC). Shift structure in OCC changed. No further update/action is required.
22f	134	Handover issues – improper handovers, not escorting to the proper caregiver. During winter months, drivers leaving door open Drivers don't handle harnesses The inclusion of driver service cards within buses and accessible vans, detailing what drivers can and cannot do, may also assist. Expanded outreach, working with customer agencies (previously recommended) may also assist.	Agreed	AC has ongoing education and discussions with service providers ensuring proper handover and that customer comfort procedures are followed. AC will raise these at refresher training for all drivers to stress the importance of these items. Drivers do not handle harnesses as they are very few in use and each one is unique. If not secured properly it poses significant safety and liability concerns. The caregivers are best suited and familiar with the customer's harness. Driver information cards are being made available which remind them of the dos and don'ts. AC has on-going dialogue and engagement with agencies and works with committees that support people with disabilities to identify and address concerns.	Field supervisors focusing on Hand Over's for 2015. Refresher training to occur yearly. AC will be working with Rich Designs to provide basic harness training for drivers for emergency situations i.e. collision and to ensure the harnesses are applied correctly. No further update/action is required

Access Calgary Performance Audit -
Management Response to Recommendations

#	Page	Conclusion / Recommendations	Business Unit Response	Action Items	Status
				The AC Advisory Committee also meets monthly to review concerns, address service and policy concerns and review performance. AC also participates on the City's Advisory Committee on Accessibility.	
23a	145	A streamlined interface between Para transit software and financial software encompassing billing, revenue tracking is required	Agreed	Administrative Processes – CT's Electronic Fare Collection project is expected to be extended to AC in 2016. This will provide more options for customers to manage their method of payment.	Will occur with the Connect card.

Access Calgary Performance Audit -
Management Response to Recommendations

#	Page	Conclusion / Recommendations	Business Unit Response	Action Items	Status
23b	145	Access Calgary should prepare a revenue/cost implication of accepting the low income seniors pass.	Agreed	AC does accept the Low-Income Transit Pass. However, does not accept the yearly Senior Transit Pass (STP) which was meant to be utilized on the conventional system and not on Access Calgary services. CT recently published a Fare Report identifying the challenge with highly discounted senior fares. Accepting the STP would require even more funding to offset the lost revenue.	In 2014 AC had 10,145 registered customers who are seniors. Seniors take about 30% of the trips AC provides. Current Revenue = \$1,075M (approx). At least 50% of seniors on Access Calgary are likely to qualify for Old Age Security and therefore eligible for the \$15 Seniors Yearly Pass. The balance of seniors would qualify for the \$95 Seniors Yearly pass. AC would require an additional budget of in range of \$300,000 to \$500,000 per year to accept the Seniors Transit Pass. No further update/action is required

Access Calgary Performance Audit -
Management Response to Recommendations

#	Page	Conclusion / Recommendations	Business Unit Response	Action Items	Status
23c	145	Access Calgary needs to create a proper performance measurement and management system that identifies key performance indicators.	Agreed	AC tracks a high number of daily, monthly and quarterly Key Performance Indicators that assist in measuring the quantity, quality, efficiency and effectiveness of the operation and organization. The collection of information is primarily managed on complex spreadsheets and some basic database reporting. A more sophisticated system to manage data, provide dashboards and timely reports are required. CT is embarking on what the needs are in terms of technology and AC reports and tools will be flagged as a requirement.	AC reports and business intelligence tools have been flagged as a requirement for CT which is set to be implemented within the next 1-2 years. Additionally GIRO will provide AC with some Business Intelligence tools in 2016 as this is part of phase two of the software implementation. No further update/action is required

Access Calgary Performance Audit -
Management Response to Recommendations

#	Page	Conclusion / Recommendations	Business Unit Response	Action Items	Status
23d	146	Consider moving to Lean/Quality based, customer driven performance standards. Because of the inconsistency of the Quality approach with existing City of Calgary practices, Access Calgary could become a test for the Quality approach within the City. Lean/Quality Based, Customer Driven Performance Standards is a two phased approach comprised of linkages between Operational Metrics and Customer Measures. Furthermore, a process can be meeting operational targets, but if the customers are not happy, it doesn't matter what those targets are. The customer is the ultimate measure of how well a company is performing.	Review	AC will seek clarity from the consultant. AC has to understand how the current key indicators and performance measurement standards which are in line with industry would change to improve customer satisfaction.	Converge Consulting Group will provide input from Customer Satisfaction survey. No further update/action is required.
23e	146	Access Calgary should proceed with its branding strategy and be given the appropriate budget to see it come to fruition.	Agreed	CT and AC are in the initial stages of developing a branding strategy.	Has been developed and proceeding through internal reviews to insure corporate branding alignment.

Access Calgary Performance Audit -
Management Response to Recommendations

#	Page	Conclusion / Recommendations	Business Unit Response	Action Items	Status
23f	147	Access Calgary should develop a clear partnering strategy that explicitly identifies opportunities and priorities driven by potential for demand reduction. As part of this strategy, Access Calgary must be given the flexibility to experiment with these options.	Agreed	AC has and continues to identify areas where partnerships and recovering the cost for service is feasible. Examples include services that fall under the purview of the provincial government. Moving forward with these initiatives requires Council support as there will some objections from the public on the changes required to effectively manage costs.	AC is working on integration with CT fixed route. For example, a customer would take AC from their home to the nearest CTrain station and transfer to the train. The customer would disembark from the CTrain station closest to their destination and AC would transport the customer to their final destination. This initiative needs further discussion with the community at large and will require political support to make it viable.