



MINUTES

AUDIT COMMITTEE

HELD 2015 JULY 16 AT 9:30 AM

IN THE ENGINEERING TRADITIONS COMMITTEE ROOM

PRESENT: Councillor R. Pootmans, Chair
Councillor E. Woolley, Vice-Chair
Councillor J. Magliocca
Citizen Representative, Mr. B. Day
Citizen Representative, Mr. B. Fitzsimmons
Citizen Representative, Mr. R. Ghosh

ALSO PRESENT: Acting Chief Financial Officer B. Koay
City Auditor K. Palmer
Executive Assistant P. Frank
External Auditor T. Nakka
Legislative Assistant J. Dubetz

This meeting was conducted in accordance with the Procedure Bylaw 44M2006, as amended.

Councillor Pootmans, on behalf of members of the Audit Committee, thanked Mr. Paul Frank, Executive Assistant, for his exemplary service to the Audit Committee. Mr. Frank was seconded from the Law Department two years ago, and is in attendance at his last meeting of the Audit Committee prior to returning to the Law Department.

Councillor Pootmans announced Ms. Corrie Smillie as the successful candidate for the role of Executive Assistant to the Audit Committee. He offered his congratulations to Ms. Smillie and his thanks to the City Clerk's Office for their accommodation in allowing her to overlap her former duties with her new duties.

1. CONFIRMATION OF AGENDA

CONFIRM AGENDA, Moved by Councillor Magliocca, that the Agenda for the 2015 July 16 Regular Meeting of the Audit Committee be confirmed.

CARRIED

2. CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES

2.1 MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF AUDIT COMMITTEE, 2015 JUNE 18

CONFIRM MINUTES, Moved by Mr. Ghosh, that the Minutes of the Regular Meeting of the Audit Committee, held on 2015 June 18, be confirmed.

CARRIED

3. NEW BUSINESS

3.1 ETHICS PROGRAM ASSESSMENT, AC2015-0560

DISTRIBUTION

At the request of Administration and with the concurrence of the Chair, the Legislative Assistant distributed copies of corrected Pages 15 and 16 to Attachment 1, contained in Report AC2015-0560 Ethics Program Assessment.

SPEAKERS:

1. Elaine Wong, Partner, Advisory Services, KPMG
2. Mark Renneburg, Manager, KPMG.

AMENDMENT, Moved by Mr. Fitzsimmons, that with respect to Administration Recommendation 2 contained in Report AC2015-0560, the Attachment be amended, as follows:

- On Page 15, Management Response Table, last column, by deleting the words “Audit Committee, with Executive Assistant as lead”, and by substituting with the words “City Clerks”; and
- On Page 16, Management Response Table, last column, by deleting the words “Audit Committee, with the Executive Assistant as lead”, and by substituting with the words, “Director, Human Resources (with support by City Clerks Office)”.

And further, that the Administration Recommendations be amended by adding a Recommendation 3, as follows:

- “3. That the Audit Committee direct Administration to bring a report to the 2015 November 12 Regular Meeting of Audit Committee, with respect to work in progress.”

CARRIED

APPROVE, AS AMENDED, Moved by Mr. Ghosh, that the City Auditor Recommendations contained in Report AC2015-0560 be approved, **as amended**, as follows:

1. That Audit Committee receive this report for information;
2. That Audit Committee recommend that Council receive this report for information, **after amendment to the Attachment, as follows:**
 - **On Page 15, Management Response Table, last column, by deleting the words “Audit Committee, with Executive Assistant as lead”, and by substituting with the words “City Clerks”; and**
 - **On Page 16, Management Response Table, last column, by deleting the words “Audit Committee, with the Executive Assistant as lead”, and by substituting with the words, “Director, Human Resources (with support by City Clerks Office)”;** and
3. **That the Audit Committee direct Administration to bring a follow-up report to the 2015 November 12 Regular Meeting of Audit Committee, with respect to work in progress.**

CARRIED

3.2 INTEGRATED RISK MANAGEMENT MODEL UPDATE, AC2015-0451

DISTRIBUTION

At the request of Administration and with the concurrence of the Chair, the Legislative Assistant distributed copies of a PowerPoint presentation entitled "Integrated Risk Management Model Update", dated 2015 July 16, with respect to Report AC2015-0451.

APPROVE, Moved by Mr. Day, that the Administration Recommendations contained in Report AC2015-0451 be approved, **after amendment**, as follows:

1. That Audit Committee receive this report for information; and
2. That the Audit Committee recommends that Council receive this report for information.

CARRIED

3.3 CONTRACT PROCUREMENT - REQUEST FOR TENDERS PROCESS
EFFICIENCY AUDIT, AC2015-0558

APPROVE, Moved by Councillor Woolley, that the City Auditor Recommendations contained in Report AC2015-0558 be approved, as follows:

1. That Audit Committee receive this report for information; and
2. That Audit Committee recommend that Council receive this report for information.

CARRIED

3.4 TRANSPORTATION PLANNING AUDIT - PROJECT PRIORITIZATION,
AC2015-0561

APPROVE, Moved by Mr. Ghosh, that the City Auditor Recommendations contained in Report AC2015-0561 be approved, as follows:

1. That Audit Committee receive this report for information; and
2. That Audit Committee recommend that Council receive this report for information.

CARRIED

3.5 CITY AUDITOR'S OFFICE 2ND QUARTER 2015 REPORT, AC2015-0559

APPROVE, Moved by Mr. Fitzsimmons, that the City Auditor Recommendations contained in Report AC2015-0559 be approved, as follows:

1. That Audit Committee receive this report for information; and
2. That Audit Committee recommend that Council receive this report for information.

CARRIED

3.6 AUDIT COMMITTEE 2ND QUARTER STATUS REPORT, AC2015-0616

APPROVE, Moved by Councillor Woolley, that the Administration Recommendation contained in Report AC2015-0616 be approved, as follows:

That Audit Committee receives this report for information.

CARRIED

3.7 ATTAINABLE HOMES CALGARY CORPORATION AUDIT & ACCOUNTABILITY COMMITTEE ANNUAL REPORT, AC2015-0627

SPEAKERS

1. Lisa Oldridge, Chair, Attainable Homes Calgary Corporation Audit and Accountability Committee
2. David Watson, President and Chief Executive Officer, Attainable Homes Calgary Corporation
3. Adam Legge, Chair, Attainable Homes Calgary Corporation Board of Directors
4. Wendy Hennel, Finance Manager, Attainable Homes Calgary Corporation
5. Marissa Toohy, Communications, Attainable Homes Calgary Corporation

APPROVE, Moved by Councillor Woolley, that the Attainable Homes Calgary Corporation Recommendation contained in Report AC2015-0627 be approved, as follows:

That Audit Committee receives this report for information.

CARRIED

4. URGENT BUSINESS

No items of Urgent Business were added to today's Meeting.

IN CAMERA, Moved by Councillor Woolley, that in accordance with Section 197(2) of the *Municipal Government Act* and Sections 16(1), 23(1) (b) and 24(1) (a), (b), & (c) of the *Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act*, the Audit Committee move in camera, at 11:46 a.m., in order to consider several confidential matters.

CARRIED

The Audit Committee moved into public session at 12:33 p.m. with Councillor Pootmans in the Chair.

RISE AND REPORT, Moved by Councillor Woolley, that the Audit Committee rise and report.

CARRIED

5. IN CAMERA ITEMS

5.1 CITY AUDITOR'S OFFICE – BUDGET ADJUSTMENTS (TABLED), AC2015-0525

APPROVE, Moved by Councillor Woolley, that with respect to Report AC2015-0525 the following be approved:

1. That Audit Committee approve the City Auditor's vision for the City Auditor's Office.
2. That Audit Committee direct that the Report, Recommendations, Attachment and In Camera discussions remain confidential under Sections 24(1) (a), (b), & (c) of the *Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act* until the end of Q4 2015.

CARRIED

5.2 CIVIC PARTNER AUDIT REPORT - IN CAMERA, AC2015-0572

APPROVE, Moved by Councillor Magliocca, that the Administration Recommendations contained in Report AC2015-0572 be approved, as follows:

That Audit Committee recommends that Council:

1. Adopt Administration Recommendation 1; and

2. Direct that this report and all attachments remain confidential under Sections 23(1) (b), 24(1) (b), and 16(1) of the *Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act (Alberta)* until such time as six years from this date.

CARRIED

5.3 AUDIT FORUM - VERBAL REPORT, AC2015-0617

There were no Audit Forum items to discuss.

5.4 EXTERNAL AUDITOR - VERBAL REPORT, AC2015-0618

The External Auditor had nothing to report.

5.5 CITY AUDITOR – VERBAL REPORT, AC2015-0562

APPROVE, Moved by Mr. Day, that with respect to the Verbal Report AC2015-0562, the following be approved:

That the Audit Committee:

1. Receive the City Auditor - Verbal Report, for information; and
2. Keep the Verbal Report and In Camera discussions confidential pursuant to Sections 24(1)(a)(b) and (c) of the *Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act*.

CARRIED

5.6 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER - VERBAL REPORT, AC2015-0619

The Chief Financial Officer had nothing to report.

5.7 CHAIR OF AUDIT COMMITTEE - VERBAL REPORT, AC2015-0620

The Chair of Audit Committee had nothing to report.

6. URGENT BUSINESS IN CAMERA

No items of Urgent Business, In Camera, were added to today's Meeting.

7. ADJOURNMENT

ADJOURN, Moved by Councillor Woolley, that this meeting adjourn at 12:35 p.m.

CARRIED

CONFIRMED BY COMMITTEE ON

CHAIR

LEGISLATIVE ASSISTANT

THE FOLLOWING ITEMS HAVE BEEN FORWARDED TO THE 2015 JULY 27 REGULAR MEETING OF COUNCIL:

CONSENT:

ETHICS PROGRAM ASSESSMENT, AC2015-0560

INTEGRATED RISK MANAGEMENT MODEL UPDATE, AC2015-0451

CONTRACT PROCUREMENT - REQUEST FOR TENDERS PROCESS EFFICIENCY AUDIT,
AC2015-0558

TRANSPORTATION PLANNING AUDIT - PROJECT PRIORITIZATION, AC2015-0561

CITY AUDITOR'S OFFICE 2ND QUARTER 2015 REPORT, AC2015-0559

IN CAMERA:

CIVIC PARTNER AUDIT REPORT - IN CAMERA, AC2015-0572

The next Regular Meeting of the Audit Committee has been scheduled to be held on 2015 September 10 at 9:30 AM.