ISC: UNRESTRICTED TT2014-0499 Page 1 of 10

#### CALGARY TRANSIT FARE STRATEGY AND STRUCTURE

#### EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Calgary Transit is recommending updates to the current transit fare strategy and pricing structure in advance of submitting its budget for Action Plan 2015 to 2018. Currently, there is no approved discounting policy or structure that ensures that transit fares are priced consistently in accordance with customer needs and system revenue objectives. The proposed fare strategy and structure changes will establish a new fare discounting scale along with new fare options to address customer and Council requests. The purpose of the proposed fare structure is to:

- Address Council direction in: TT2014-0135 Calgary Transit Fare Strategy Review;
- Reflect recent input from transit customers, Calgarians and special interest groups;
- Reflect current fare usage and ridership;
- Provide a basis for setting future fare prices to achieve more sustainable and predictable fare revenues;
- Assist in achieving the necessary revenues from fares to meet the Revenue/Cost (R /C) ratio for funding transit service;
- Provide a greater recognition of customer incomes and ability to pay;
- Offer increased flexibility and convenience for seniors and low income customers; and,
- Reduce the potential for future fare increases to unfairly burden adult customers.

#### ADMINISTRATION RECOMMENDATIONS

That the SPC on Transportation and Transit recommend that Council:

- 1. Approve the proposed Calgary Transit Fare Structure in Attachment 1 to be used for setting fare prices.
- 2. Direct Administration to return to budget deliberations in 2014 November with proposed fare product pricing for 2015 through 2018, based on the approved Fare Structure.

#### **PREVIOUS COUNCIL DIRECTION / POLICY**

On 2014 March 10, Council approved the following recommendations contained in Report TT2014-0135:

- 1. Endorse a revised "funding philosophy" to form the basis of the fare strategy required for Action Plan 2015 to 2018 based on the following principles:
  - a. Increase the potential for transit revenue to support the approved revenue / cost (R/C) ratio of 50 to 55 percent through:
    - i. Moving towards an income-based criteria for setting fare discounts;
    - ii. Increasing revenues from other existing sources of revenue such as advertising, parking, and special services (e.g. airport, charters);
    - iii. Maintaining a consistent fare discounting and pricing structure that reflects customer needs and supports the R/C ratio target; and
    - iv. Moving towards increasing the price of selected fares to better align fare discounts.
  - b. That any transit fare changes will be made using a modest, incremental approach.
- 2. Conduct public and transit customer engagement on a revised transit "funding philosophy" based on Recommendation 1 and present a recommended fare strategy and pricing structure for inclusion in Action Plan 2015 to 2018, to the SPC on Transportation and Transit in 2014 June; and

ISC: UNRESTRICTED TT2014-0499 Page 2 of 10

#### CALGARY TRANSIT FARE STRATEGY AND STRUCTURE

- 3. Pursue longer term opportunities to use the Connect Card to offer new fare options that will increase the convenience of paying fares and attract new customers.
- 4. Pursue operational funding for public transit service from other levels of government.

Council also approved a motion arising that "the Administration be directed to conduct an evaluation of the current transit advertising contracts to identify opportunities for increased revenues including the sale of advertising space on City owned lands and report back to the SPC on Transportation and Transit no later than 2014 October."

#### BACKGROUND

To achieve the approved objectives of RouteAhead, a consistent and sustained pattern of transit investment is required. To address all aspects of the plan including an annual growth target of approximately 125,000 hours of service plus service quality improvements such as Connect (electronic fare collection), real time customer information and improved reliability, safety, security and cleanliness, Calgary Transit's operating budget would need to grow by an estimated average of \$17.7 million annually (excluding inflation) over the 30-year plan horizon.

The report "Calgary Transit Funding and Fare Strategy Review" (2014 February) concluded that Calgary Transit's fare pricing structure is not capable of providing sufficient revenues to sustain the approved R/C ratio target of between 50 to 55 percent without unfairly burdening 'Adult' fare paying customers. Increased revenue from other, non-fare sources and longer term funding support from other levels of government are also needed. If fare discounts are not rebalanced a lower R/C ratio with an increased proportion of funding from municipal taxes will be required to support transit service improvements.

Council direction given in 2014 February (TT2014-0135) is for Calgary Transit to use a revised "funding philosophy" to create a new fare pricing strategy to be included in the Action Plan 2015 to 2018 budget to support RouteAhead based service level improvements. This report provides information and recommendations on a new fare strategy and structure to address the revised fare philosophy over the next four years.

In 2014 February Calgary Transit reported that a \$17.7 million increased annual operating budget based on RouteAhead goals would require an annual growth of about \$8 million in tax based support and about \$10 million additional revenue from fares and other sources to fund various transit service improvements. These amounts were based on the approved Revenue / Cost (R/C) ratio of approximately 50 to 55 percent (i.e. a revenue contribution of 50 to 55 percent and tax support of 45 to 50 percent). In 2014 May Council set the indicative tax rate increase at 4.7 percent for the 2015 to 2018 annual budgets. Preliminary work on Action Plan indicates that property tax growth would not support transit service growth targets.

This gap in funding from municipal taxes heightens the need for a sustainable fare structure which can produce sufficient revenue to support service without discouraging ridership.

ISC: UNRESTRICTED TT2014-0499 Page 3 of 10

#### CALGARY TRANSIT FARE STRATEGY AND STRUCTURE

It is important to note that this report on fare strategy focuses on the revenue side of the transit operating equation. Efforts are underway through the Action Plan 2015 to 2018 process to look at expenditures, rationalize costs, explore efficiency measures and ensure that costs are kept as low as possible while continuing to stress high quality customer service.

#### INVESTIGATION: ALTERNATIVES AND ANALYSIS

The following investigation and analysis addresses each of the directives given to Administration by Council in TT2014-0135 – Fare Strategy Review. In response, this report addresses how Calgary Transit can respond to each of those directives:

- Increase the potential for transit fares to support the approved revenue / cost (R/C) ratio of 50 to 55 percent.
  - This as an over arching guiding principle for funding transit services.
- Move towards an income based criteria for setting fare discounts.
  - The report highlights the importance of achieving a greater balance of fairness in discounting fares while still acknowledging that age will continue to play a role in setting fares since age, in some cases impacts mobility choices.
- Increase revenues from other existing sources (advertising, parking, etc.)
  - Calgary Transit along with other City business units are currently examining how future advertising contracts can be updated and how these contracts could support improved street furniture.
- Maintain a consistent fare discounting and pricing structure based on customer needs and to support achieving the R/C ratio.
  - Fare price changes should maintain the approved fare structure and fare discount relationship to the cost of providing service.
- Move towards increasing the price of selected fares to better align fare discounts.
  - The report addresses the needs of each major customer group and promotes increasing fairness in how each customer group can contribute towards funding transit services. The report highlights how some fare programs can be modified and new fare payment options can be introduced with the Connect Card to offer greater flexibility and convenience while recognizing the need by some customers for reduced fares.
- Make modest, incremental changes to fare pricing adjustments.
  - The report recognizes the need make modest fare changes to all fares with the goal of achieving a consistent and sustainable fare structure by 2018.

The proposed fare discount structure is summarized in Attachment 1 and discussed in detail in this report.

#### **Current Fare Structure Principles**

In 2013, the average total cost of providing a transit trip was \$3.31. Current fare discounts, (expressed as a percentage of this per trip cost) are offered on the basis of:

ISC: UNRESTRICTED TT2014-0499 Page 4 of 10

#### CALGARY TRANSIT FARE STRATEGY AND STRUCTURE

- <u>Frequency of use</u> (monthly passes and day passes). The price point at which a monthly pass provides a discount versus the cost of a single ride fare (cash and tickets) is approximately 32 trips per month for Adults, 29 trips for Youth and 15 rides for low income pass holders. Calgary Transit survey results show that most monthly pass holders travel make about 50 trips per month.
- <u>Age</u> Child age 1 to 5, Youth age 6 to 17 and Seniors age 65 and above. Children, under age 6 travel free of charge. No ridership statistics are available for this group.

Youth fare customers currently comprise about 14 percent of Calgary's population and about 16 percent of Calgary Transit ridership. Calgary's youth population is forecast to decline percentage (14 to 12 percent) of the population and only a growth of 32,000 in total numbers during the next 30 years.

Senior citizens currently make up about 10 percent of Calgary's population and about eight percent of transit ridership. The population of seniors is forecast to increase by about 250,000 in the next 30 years and by 2044 seniors will make up about 23 percent of the total population in Calgary.

In 2013 there were 25,756 annual senior citizen passes sold (13,160 to higher income and 12,596 to low income seniors). Senior citizen annual pass holders make up about 22 percent of the total seniors population. On average senior citizen pass holders make about 20 trips per month.

- Income low income youth, adults, and seniors whose household incomes fall below 100 percent of the Low Income Cut Off (LICO) level established by Statistics Canada. It is estimated that there are approximately 90,000 adults and 15,000 youth or about 10 percent of Calgary's population who would qualify for a low income transit pass. There are currently about 23,750 adults and youth (23 percent of the low income population) who have been approved to purchase low income monthly transit passes. In 2013, there were just over 132,000 low income monthly passes sold which equates to about four percent of Calgary Transit customers.
- <u>Upass for Post Secondary Students</u>- At five major post secondary schools, all full time students pay a four month semester fee for a transit pass. The fee is intended to provide the same level of transit fare revenue that would have been received from the estimated 30 percent of students who used transit for travel to and from school at the time the current agreements were signed. Since the program was introduced, transit use by students has increased significantly. The new Connect Card will provide better information upon which new agreements can be negotiated in 2016.

Attachment 2 provides a breakdown of the percent use and revenues from each fare type in 2013.

ISC: UNRESTRICTED TT2014-0499 Page 5 of 10

#### CALGARY TRANSIT FARE STRATEGY AND STRUCTURE

#### Move towards an income based criteria for setting fare discounts.

#### Youth

Youth customers, between the ages of 6 and 17 (plus high school students 18 and older) make up 16 percent of Calgary Transit ridership. These customers travel predominantly for school and work purposes at similar times as Adult customers. Youth can purchase single ride and monthly passes which are the same as Adult fares. Youth single ride and monthly pass fares are more significantly discounted compared to the cost of providing a trip (see Attachment 1). Youth single ride discounts of 44 percent and the monthly pass discount of 68 percent (based on 50 rides per month) offers Youth customers with discounts that are 2.7 and 1.6 times the Adult single ride and monthly pass fares, respectively. Attachment 6 shows that Calgary's Youth fares are lower than those charged by many other major Canadian transit systems.

Persons under age 18 seldom pay their own fares and majority live in families who have the ability to pay these fares. Youth living in low income households may purchase a low income monthly transit pass at the same price as the Adult low income pass. It is recommended that the discounts offered on regular Youth fares be reduced over the next four years.

#### Low Income Customer Fares

The discounted pass program for low income Adults and Youth provides a significant benefit to those who have a demonstrated need for financial assistance to pay transit fares so they can travel to employment, school, shopping and social / recreational activities. Adult monthly passes (available to both adults and youth in low income households) are currently discounted by 54 percent from the regular adult monthly transit pass price. This is higher than the approved 50 percent discount rate for low income transit passes.

Work is underway by Administration to expand the number of outlets where program eligibility can be granted and where the passes can be purchased. It is expected that greater low income pass sales will occur with increased accessibility given that less than 23 percent of eligible Calgarians currently utilize the program.

The value of the current low income pass subsidy (difference between the Adult and low income pass price) was about \$7 million in 2013. As noted, the low income passes are currently priced with 54 percent discount. Calgary Transit recommends moving this discount back to the approved 50 percent pass discount and maintaining this discount percentage through subsequent fare increases.

Calgary Transit is aware that the purchase of a discounted monthly pass still presents a financial hardship for many low income individuals. Requests have been made for discounted single ride fares for eligible low income customers to reduce the impact of a large purchase at the beginning of each month particularly for those who face uncertainties in their travel needs.

Persons 65 years of age and older whose household incomes fall below 100 percent LICO levels may purchase an annual transit pass for \$15. Based on the average reported transit

ISC: UNRESTRICTED TT2014-0499 Page 6 of 10

#### CALGARY TRANSIT FARE STRATEGY AND STRUCTURE

use by these seniors their average cost per trip is about \$0.07 - a 98 percent discount. Each year there are typically about 1,400 new applicants accepted into this program. The value of this subsidy in 2013 was approximately \$14.5 million (i.e., the difference between the fares paid at the lower rate versus the full fare value – it does not assume this revenue would be realized at a higher rate).

Calgary Transit recommends establishing a discounted single ride fare for eligible low income customers (Adult, Youth and Seniors) that would be priced at 50 percent of the Adult single ride fare. This provision can be introduced as a feature of the new Connect card in mid 2015. See Attachment 1.

For the low income senior citizen it is recommended that the annual pass would not be offered to any new applicants, but, the annual pass would continue to be available to those currently in the program at the current price of \$15 per year as long as they continue to live in Calgary. Based on current exit rates, the program would end within 10 years.

#### Senior Citizen Customers

Persons 65 years of age and older may purchase an annual pass currently priced at \$95. Based on the average reported transit use by seniors, these customers are paying about \$0.42 per trip. Each year there are typically about 2,000 new applicants who receive the annual seniors pass. The value of this subsidy in 2013 was approximately \$14 million (i.e. the difference between the fares paid at the lower rate versus the full fare value – it does not assume this revenue would be realized at a higher rate).

It should be noted that approximately 15 percent of senior citizens who use Calgary Transit use Adult cash and tickets or purchase Adult monthly passes. This helps to illustrate that many seniors are more comfortable financially and do not require the financial support that these significant fare discounts offer. Attachment 3 provides information on how seniors compare financially to other segments of the Calgary population. This information shows that persons in other age groups have similar or greater financial challenges.

It is proposed that a new discounted senior single ride fare be established for seniors via the Connect Card in mid 2015. The new discounted single ride fare would be priced the same as the Youth single ride fare (cash or tickets).

In the interest of consistency of service, fairness and revenue sustainability it is recommended that the senior citizen annual pass program be discontinued for regular income seniors. No new applicants would be accepted into the program after a defined date (Proposed July 1, 2015). For those 'grandfathered' in the program it is recommended that the annual pass be changed to a monthly pass and be offered in conjunction with the Connect Card. Based on current exit rates, the program would end within 10 years.

With this change, seniors currently eligible for the annual pass would be given the option to purchase the pass only for the months that they wish to travel. This would eliminate the large annual one-time purchase price and offer these customers increased flexibility and

ISC: UNRESTRICTED TT2014-0499 Page 7 of 10

#### CALGARY TRANSIT FARE STRATEGY AND STRUCTURE

convenience. It is recommended that the price of this Seniors monthly pass be increased gradually so that the current subsidization is reduced (see Attachment 1).

#### Increase Revenues from Other Existing Sources

A reserved parking program for LRT park and ride lots was introduced in 2011. Currently Calgary Transit offers reserved parking in 18 LRT lots. About 4,250 customers pay a monthly fee of \$70. About 70 percent of the available reserved parking spaces (26 percent of total LRT parking spaces) are reserved each month and parking reservations have been increasing each month. Reserved parking is in very high demand along the South, Northwest and West lines with 10 lots 'sold out' each month. There are about 6,200 customers on a waiting list for parking at these 10 lots.

The price of reserved parking has not increased in the past three years. It is recommended that the price for reserved parking should increase along with other fares. Calgary Transit is working with the Calgary Parking Authority to improve the reserved parking program, generate increased revenues (includes exploring the concept of charging out of town users more) and seek efficiencies in the management of these parking lots. Modest annual increases to the price of reserved parking should be implemented to contribute additional funds to support transit revenue and therefore lot security and maintenance.

Calgary Transit has contracts with three companies who sell advertising space on Calgary Transit vehicles, stations, shelters and benches. The bench and shelter contracts include the provision and maintenance of new infrastructure each year. The combined annual revenue from these contracts in 2013 was \$7.8 million. There are modest increased minimum annual payments in each of the contracts. In response to Council direction, Calgary Transit is undertaking a review of these contracts to see if there is potential to improve the revenues and services received from advertising when these contracts expire within the next three years. A report on this investigation will be provided in 2014 October. Preliminary indications suggest that there is limited potential increased revenue from advertising during the next four years.

#### <u>Maintain a Consistent Fare Discounting and Pricing Structure That Meets Customer</u> <u>Needs and Supports the R/C Ratio Target</u>

During the past 10 years, Calgary Transit has increased most fares by an average of about four percent per year (Attachment 4). However, not all fares have increased at the same time which has led to customers moving from one fare option to another seeking the lowest price per trip. The result has been lower than expected revenue gains from fare increases and uncertainty for customers. It is recommended that when fares are increased that all fares be adjusted concurrently. It is further recommended that any fare price changes follow an approved fare discount scale to maintain consistency and fairness for customers and to achieve revenue goals (see Attachment 1).

#### Move Towards Increasing the Price of Selected Fares to Better Align Fare Discounts

A review of Calgary Transit fare discounts shows that there are significant differences between fare option prices and the amount of revenue that each fare and customer type contributes

ISC: UNRESTRICTED TT2014-0499 Page 8 of 10

#### CALGARY TRANSIT FARE STRATEGY AND STRUCTURE

towards the cost of operating the transit system. The table in Attachment 5 summarizes 2013 transit fare discounts

Attachment 6 shows how Calgary Transit fares compare to other major Canadian cities. This information shows that Calgary Transit fares for Youth and Seniors are considerably lower than at most other systems.

It is concluded that fare revenues will be better able to support long term service objectives if there are moderate adjustments to current discounts to reflect both the customer's ability to pay and how often they use the service and if fare prices are increased in concert with inflation and the cost of service improvements. A revised fare discount structure that is used to guide fare pricing would have the following benefits:

- Fare discounts would reflect the principles of rewarding more frequent use with lower cost travel on a trip by trip basis;
- There would be a consistent approach to the pricing of fares that is more easily understood by customers;
- Fare discounts would reflect the principle of providing consistent benefits to all low income Calgarians;
- Maintaining consistent fare discounts combined with regular, modest fare increases would contribute to more sustainable and predictable transit revenues in the longer term which would enable Calgary Transit to schedule transit service improvements and service growth in response to demand while achieving the R/C ratio goal.
- Introducing the Connect Card will enable new fare options to be offered, particularly for low income and senior citizen customers within an approved discounting structure. These new fares, which can be available by mid-2015, will offer increased customer convenience, and affordability with opportunities for increased revenue.

Attachment 1 describes proposed fare program changes and how they would apply to each customer group. Attachment 1 also lists the current and proposed fare discounts for Adult, Youth, Low-Income and Senior citizen customers. Individual fare discounts are based on comparing the single ride fare (or the per trip value for monthly or annual pass use) to the average system cost of providing a transit trip. It is recommended that the proposed new discounts for each fare type would be treated as a target and that any fare increases from year to year would be moderate so as not to increase fares for any one group unreasonably. The actual proposed fares will be included in Calgary Transit's 2015 to 2018 budget submission based on projected service levels and operating costs.

#### Stakeholder Engagement, Research and Communication

Calgary Transit conducted a series of customer and public engagement events between 2014 April 30 and May 14. An estimated 1,500 people participated with about 1,450 completing an online survey and over 400 involved face-to-face discussions regarding fares. Those who participated were asked to provide input on which fares should be increased and by how much,

ISC: UNRESTRICTED TT2014-0499 Page 9 of 10

#### CALGARY TRANSIT FARE STRATEGY AND STRUCTURE

in order to generate an additional \$10 million in revenue. Attachment 7 contains a more detailed summary of the findings and feedback.

Highlights of the on-line survey findings are:

- 64 percent favour the existing balance of funding between fares and property tax (i.e. 50 to 55 percent R/C ratio).
- 46 percent favour using income as a basis of providing fare discounts compared to 13 percent who felt age should be the means of setting discounts (27 percent selected 'both' and 13 percent selected 'neither' criteria).
- Respondents suggested the most significant rebalancing of fare discounts should occur with the senior's low income passes, senior's regular passes and reserve parking charges, respectively.

The top five themes of the online dialogue were related to:

- 1. Calgary Transit efficiencies reducing the cost of providing service.
- 2. Alternate sources of funding (e.g. charging non-Calgarians more, tolls)
- 3. Distance-based fares (both in favour and against)
- 4. Frustration with the on-line tool (e.g. the inability to decrease fares)
- 5. Fare enforcement need for greater Peace Officer presence to discourage fare evasion.

#### Strategic Alignment

The proposal to revise Calgary Transit's fare strategy and fare structure by adjusting fare discounts and pricing is in alignment with Fair Calgary and User Pay Principles. Keeping fares affordable and fair for all customers while generating sufficient funds to support improved levels of transit service aligns with the objectives of RouteAhead, the 30-year transit strategic plan and with the Calgary Transportation Plan which support the urban development goals of the Municipal Development Plan and ultimately Imagine Calgary.

To achieve the RouteAhead vision requires an increased investment in transit facilities, an expanded network accompanied by higher quality, more customer focused services. A sustained and strategic investment in service hours to increase the frequency and duration of service is needed to reach a goal of providing 3.7 annual service hours per capita by 2042 (currently 2.36). This level of service goal reflects the investment needed to make public transit a more attractive travel choice. Transit service improvements are also needed to support land use goals which will ultimately result in a higher percentage of transit travel (i.e.15-20 percent of all daily trips taken by public transit, compared to 7 percent today).

#### Social, Environmental, Economic (External)

The current transit fare strategy of providing subsidized fares recognizes the economic, environmental and societal benefits for all Calgarians that are achieved by operating an effective public transit system. Transit fares must be priced to position transit service as an attractive choice for urban travel and to support low income individuals and recognizes their ability to pay. By adhering to an R/C ratio target, the general contribution needed from tax payers is clearly defined.

Calgary Transit believes that these transit service benefits can be achieved to an even greater extent by rebalancing fare price discounts so that they are more equitable for all customers.

ISC: UNRESTRICTED TT2014-0499 Page 10 of 10

#### CALGARY TRANSIT FARE STRATEGY AND STRUCTURE

Small annual fare price changes to keep pace with the cost of inflation are also required to support and maintain improved transit services.

This report has been reviewed for alignment with the most recent work by Community and Protective Services on the Seniors Age-Friendly Strategy and the Fair Calgary policy updates.

#### **Financial Capacity**

#### **Current and Future Operating Budget:**

RouteAhead proposed that to fund improved transit services Calgary Transit's annual operating budget should grow by an average of \$17.7 million (excluding inflation) per year over the 30-year plan horizon. The goal was to fund quality of service initiatives and approximately 125,000 hours of additional service each year.

Council's Action Plan 2015 to 2018 will establish a business plan and budget that will determine levels of transit service, revenue requirements and fare price changes. The proposed changes to fare discounts together with changes to several fare options will position Calgary Transit to better support its objectives related to providing improved services while achieving the R/C ratio target. By rebalancing the discounts offered to all customer groups, fares and fare increases will be more fairly distributed.

#### **Current and Future Capital Budget:**

There are no capital budget implications of this report.

#### **Risk Assessment**

The ability to achieve RouteAhead and Action Plan goals depends, in part, on the sustainability of Calgary Transit fare revenues. Modest changes to the current fare pricing structure (discounts) combined with small incremental fare increases are required to help achieve these goals. Without changes to the fare strategy and structure, funding of improved transit services will require either a higher level of municipal taxpayer support, disproportionately higher fares for some customers or delayed achievement of RouteAhead objectives.

#### **REASON(S) FOR RECOMMENDATION(S):**

Administration is requesting Council approve the recommended changes to Calgary Transit's fare strategy and structure so that service levels, operating costs and revenues required to support Calgary Transit input to Action Plan 2015 to 2018 can be determined.

#### **ATTACHMENTS**

- 1. Proposed Calgary Transit Fare Structure Changes
- 2. Calgary Transit Fare Media Use
- 3. Age and Income as a basis for Public Transit Fare Assistance in Calgary (Corporate Economics Report)
- 4. Recent Calgary Transit Fare History
- 5. Fare Revenue, Ridership and Discounts by Fare Type
- 6. Comparison of Transit Fares in Major Canadian Cities
- 7. Summary of Engagement on Calgary Transit Fare Structure

#### Proposed Calgary Transit Fare Structure Changes

	Customer Group	Fare Pricing	Options to Pay
Adults	Adults	Fares will grow at a slightly lower rate than the average fare until discounts are rebalanced.	No changes.
Youth	Youth	Fares will grow at a slightly higher rate than the average fare until discounts are rebalanced.	No changes.
Seniors	Seniors (65+) in the regular Calgary Transit Seniors Annual Pass Program (Grandfathered)	Fares will grow slightly as the adult fare changes.	Annual pass discontinued. New monthly and new single ride fare options will be introduced with the Connect Card – July 2015.
Sen	New Seniors (65+) after July 1, 2015	New monthly pass based on the annual pass rate. Price will increase at a slightly higher rate than the average fare until discounts are rebalanced.	New monthly and new single ride options will be introduced with the Connect Card – July 2015. Annual pass option will not be available.
	Low income Adults (Below 100% LICO)	Fares will be targeted at 50% of the adult fare for each fare option (monthly and single ride).	Monthly pass. A new single ride fare option will be introduced with the Connect Card – July 2015.
come	Low income Youth (Below 100% LICO)	(same as above)	(same as above)
Low Income	New Seniors (65+) after July 1, 2015, with incomes under 100% LICO.	(same as above)	(same as above)
	Seniors in the Calgary Transit Low Income Seniors Annual Pass Program on June 30, 2015. (Grandfathered)	No change until program conclusion.	Annual pass continued. No change until program conclusion.

By July 2015, Calgary Transit will have three fare groups (not including the 'grandfathered' Seniors Pass Program):

- Regular Adults
- Concession Youth and Seniors
- Low Income All customers falling under 100% LICO

Each fare group will have its own rate with single ride, daily and monthly fare options when using the Connect Card. Cash fares (non-Connect payments) will be accepted for Adults, and Youths only.

Fare Option	2014	2014	New	New Price Basis
	Price	Discount*	Discount**	(based on avg. trip cost)
ADULT FARES				
Cash / Single Ride	\$3.00	16%	15%	85% of single trip cost
Day Pass	\$9.00	37%	30%	70% of the cost of 4 trips
Monthly Pass	\$96.00	46%	45%	55% of the cost of 50 trips
Ticket Books (10)	\$30.00	16%	15%	85% of the cost of 10 trips
YOUTH FARES				
Cash / Single Ride	\$2.00	44%	40%	60% of single trip cost
Day Pass	\$6.25	56%	50%	50% of the cost of 4 trips
Monthly Pass	\$57.50 / \$60.00	68%/66%***	60%	40% of the cost of 50 trips
Ticket Books (10)	\$20.00	44%	40%	60% of the cost of 10 trips
SENIORS				
Single Ride	New	New	40%	60% of single trip cost
Seniors Annual Pass	\$95.00	95%	Discontinue	
Seniors Monthly Pass (grandfathered)	New	New	90%	10% of the cost of 50 trips
Seniors Monthly Pass (new seniors)	New	New	60%	40% of the cost of 50 trips
LOW INCOME			•	
Adult / Youth / Senior Single Ride	New	New	58%	42% of single trip cost (50% of single fare)
Adult / Youth / Senior Monthly Pass (incl. new seniors)	\$44.00	75%	75%	25% of the cost of 50 trips (50% of adult monthly)
Low Income Seniors Annual Pass (grandfathered)	\$15.00	98%	99%	Fixed \$15.00 for existing registrants
POST SECONDARY				
4 Month Semester U-Pass	\$117 / \$120	NA	NA	Negotiated with eligible schools based on use
AIRPORT SPECIAL FEE	- Sold only at the	Calgary International	Airport for Route 30	00 departures
Airport Boarding Pass	\$8.50	41%	25%	75% of the cost of 4 trips

\*Current Discounts are based on average trip cost = \$3.58 (estimated for 2014)

\*\* Future discounts to be based on actual average trip cost

\*\*\* Approved midyear fare change for Youth monthly pass

TT2014-0499 Calgary Transit Fare Strategy and Structure Att 1.docx ISC: UNRESTRICTED

# Calgary Transit Fare Media Use

# 2013

Fare Types	Percent Ridership	Percent Fare Revenue
Adult Fares	58%	77%
Cash / Single Fare	10%	19%
Ticket Books (10)	10%	19%
Day Pass	<1%	<1%
Monthly Pass	38%	39%
Youth Fares	16%	12%
Cash / Single Fare	1%	1%
Ticket Books (10)	2%	2%
Day Pass	<1%	<1%
Monthly Pass	13%	9%
Seniors Fares	3%	1%
Annual Pass	3%	1%
Low Income Fares	9%	4%
Adult & Youth Low Income Pass	5%	3%
Low Income Senior Annual Pass	4%	<1%
Other Fares	14%	6%
Post Secondary - Upass	7%	6%
Other (contracts, charters, events)	<1%	<1%
7th Avenue LRT Free Fare Zone	7%	0%

# Age and Income as a basis for Public Transit Fare Assistance in Calgary

This report has been prepared by Corporate Economics for Calgary Transit, May 2014





#### Seniors Use of Transit in Canada

A recent study by Statistics Canada reveals the transportation modes of seniors. In a 2011 study, <u>Profile of Seniors' Transportation Habits</u>, Martin Turcotte surveyed senior's transportation choices in Canada. His findings are summarized here:

- A large majority of seniors drive cars. In total, 75% of those over age 65 in Canada have a drivers licence, and the proportion is growing. The rate is higher for men and lower for women as the current population of seniors includes many women who never had a drivers' licence. In Calgary, 75.8% of senior men and 49.9% of senior women have a drivers licence.
- Only certain physical disabilities at certain thresholds prevent people from driving. This seems to hold true regardless of age. Critical thresholds where about 1/3 of drivers cease to drive occur at:
  - a. Blindness: Unable to recognize a friend across a street, with glasses.
  - b. Hearing: Can't hear conversation with 3 people, with a hearing aid.
  - c. Cognition: Difficulty solving day-to-day problems.
  - d. Mobility: Must use a walker.

Notably a few things are absent from this list: Diabetes, Stroke, Heart disease, COPD, Loss of limb(s) or Loss of use of limb(s).

- 3) Relatively few seniors use public transit regularly. Among senior men, 84% of trips are by driving and 9% are by being a passenger in a private vehicle. Four percent of trips are by public transit with 3% by walking, biking and accessible transit/taxi. Among women the rates are slightly different with about 10% fewer trips spent driving and 10% more trips being a passenger.
- 4) About 20% of Canadians reported using public transit at least once in the month prior to the Statistics Canada survey. The number reporting taking transit dropped from 24% to 16% from age 45 to age 85. Meanwhile, in Calgary 24.9% (2013) of seniors subscribe to the annual seniors buss pass program.
- 5) Public transit usage hovers at around 6-7% of trips from age 45 to older than 85. For men the rate is 4-5% while for women the rate is higher at 7-8%. The number of people reporting taking transit drops as people age but the rate of usage remains stable. This reveals that as people age they take fewer trips. When they do take those trips, the proportion of transit trips stays constant while the proportion of trips as a driver drops in favor of being a passenger.
- 6) There is some evidence that income plays a role in the choice to use public transit among seniors. As income drops from over \$100,000 per year to the \$20,000 per year range driving

Age and income as a basis for Public Transit Fare Assistance in Calgary

as the main source of transportation among women drops steadily from 62% to 34%. For men, driving as the main form of transportation stays steady in the 85% range only dropping to 70% when income falls to the \$20,000 / year range.

Source: http://www.statcan.gc.ca/pub/11-008-x/2012001/article/11619-eng.htm

Age does not indicate income in Calgary. The following three graphs indicate the income brackets in 2010 of 3 sample generations; youth, middle age and seniors.



4

Age and income as a basis for Public Transit Fare Assistance in Calgary

Source: 2011 National Household Survey – Statistics Canada http://www12.statcan.gc.ca/nhs-enm/2011/dp-pd/dt-td/Rpeng.cfm?TABID=1&LANG=E&APATH=3&DETAIL=0&DIM=0&FL=A&FREE=0&GC=0&GK=0&GRP=0&PID=106649&PRID=0&PTYPE=1 05277&S=0&SHOWALL=0&SUB=0&Temporal=2013&THEME=98&VID=0&VNAMEE=&VNAMEF=

As can be seen from the graphs, incomes in Calgary are very similar between households regardless of age. What is not so obvious is the effect expenditures have on the picture.

Household expenditures change as people age. Young people starting out typically need to acquire accommodations, transportation and furnishings. Later come children and the need to provide for them. By the time someone becomes a senior daily expenses typically decrease. The children have left home, mortgage and loans are paid off and the house is already furnished. Medical expenses increase, but there are assistance programs and tax write-offs which offset some of this.

As an indication of how much after-expense income is available as people age in Calgary we computed the percent of households in each age and income category that are spending more than 30% of their income on housing.

Percent of Ca	lgary hous	eholds spe	ending moi	re than 30%	6 of incom	e on housii	ng	
	under	10 k to	20 k to	30 k to	40 k to	60 k to	80 k to	
	10k	20 k	30 k	40 k	60 k	80 k	100 k	100 k +
Age group of household head								
Under 25 years	92%	91%	85%	78%	43%	12%	4%	1%
25 to 29 years	93%	88%	83%	71%	46%	22%	8%	1%
30 to 34 years	86%	92%	83%	70%	48%	30%	13%	2%
35 to 39 years	87%	89%	81%	68%	52%	33%	14%	2%
40 to 44 years	88%	88%	82%	66%	53%	30%	11%	2%
45 to 49 years	91%	83%	83%	71%	47%	28%	10%	2%
50 to 54 years	90%	83%	81%	58%	41%	22%	10%	2%
55 to 59 years	92%	81%	72%	54%	36%	18%	8%	1%
60 to 64 years	90%	76%	58%	42%	29%	12%	5%	1%
65 to 69 years	79%	78%	55%	33%	23%	9%	4%	1%
70 to 74 years	88%	74%	57%	31%	18%	6%	2%	0%
75 years and over	95%	74%	44%	22%	15%	6%	2%	0%

Source: 2011 National Household Survey – Statistics Canada

In total, almost 25% of households in Calgary are spending more than 30% of their gross income on housing. Income and age play roles in this.

In the table above we have highlighted all incidence where more than 50% of households in each age & income bracket are spending more than 30% of their gross income on housing. The choice of 50% is arbitrary but allows us to reveal a pattern in the data. As can be seen from the table, the

Age and income as a basis for Public Transit Fare Assistance in Calgary

majority of all households, regardless of age, earning less than \$30,000 per year spend more than 30% of income on housing. As income rises both youth and seniors cease spending such a high proportion of income on housing while middle age people (typically those households with young children) continue to struggle financially.

In Calgary, financial difficulties arise from lack of income and from having to share income among more people. The income of seniors in Calgary is very comparable to other age groups in Calgary and it appears that their after expenses income compares favorably to younger generations. It would appear that income, among all age groups, would be a good basis for fare assistance in Calgary to address a low ability to pay. Age, however, does not appear to specifically address ability to pay among adults in Calgary.

# TT2014-0583 **ATTACHMENT 2**

#### TT2014-0499 **ATTACHMENT 4**

Adult										
Fare Option	2005	2006	2007	2008	2009	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014
Cash / Single Ticket	\$2.00	\$2.25 <sup>1</sup>	\$2.25	\$2.50	\$2.50	\$2.75	\$2.75	\$2.75	\$3.00	\$3.00
Ticket Book (10)	\$17.50	\$19.50	\$19.50	\$21.00	\$23.00	\$24.00	\$24.00	\$27.50	\$30.00	\$30.00
Day Pass	\$5.60	\$5.60	\$6.75	\$6.75	\$7.50	\$8.25	\$8.25	\$8.25	\$9.00	\$9.00
Monthly Pass	\$70.00	\$70.00	\$75.00	\$75.00	\$83.00	\$85.25	\$90.00	\$94.00	\$94.00	\$96.00
Youth (6-17	7, 18 and	l 19 with	valid H	igh Scho	ool ID)					
Fare Option	2005	2006	2007	2008	2009	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014
Cash / Single Ticket	\$1.40	\$1.40	\$1.50	\$1.50	\$1.75	\$1.75	\$1.75	\$1.75	\$1.75	\$2.00
Ticket Book (10)	\$12.00	\$12.00	\$13.00	\$13.00	\$15.00	\$15.00	\$15.00	\$17.50	\$17.50	\$20.00
Day Pass	\$3.60	\$3.60	\$4.50	\$4.50	\$5.25	\$5.25	\$5.25	\$5.25	\$5.75	\$6.25
Monthly Pass	\$47.00	\$47.00	\$50.50	\$50.50	\$52.50	\$54.25	\$54.25	\$57.50	\$57.50	\$60.00
		d14 V	auth (	Papiar						
Low Incon Adult		-								l
Monthly Pass	\$35.00	\$35.00	\$37.50	\$37.50	\$41.50	\$41.50	\$40.00	\$40.00	\$44.00	\$44.00
Youth Monthly Pass	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	\$44.00	\$44.00
Senior Annual Pass <sup>2</sup>	\$15.00	\$15.00	\$15.00	\$15.00	\$15.00	\$15.00	\$15.00	\$15.00	\$15.00	\$15.00
Seniors (A	ged 65+	)		•						
Fare Option	2005	2006	2007	2008	2009	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014
Regular Annual Pass	\$35.00	\$35.00	\$35.00	\$35.00	\$35.00	\$35.00	\$35.00	\$55.00	\$95.00	95.00
Average F	are									
	\$1.53	\$1.45	\$1.48	\$1.56	\$1.61	\$1.52	\$1.55	\$1.66	\$1.61	\$1.58

# **Recent Calgary Transit Fare History**

Shaded text denotes price change
Senior's low income annual pass price last adjusted in 1995

Fare Option	2014 Fare		Fare Per Ride		Discount From Trip Cost*	Percentage of 2013 Ridership	Percentage of 2013 Fare Revenues
7th Avenue Free Fare	\$	-	\$	-	100%	7%	0%
Seniors - Low Income	\$	15.00	\$	0.03	99%	4%	0.1%
Seniors - Regular Income	\$	95.00	\$	0.15	95%	3%	1%
U-Pass / 4 months	\$	117.00	\$	0.66	82%	7%	6%
Low Income Monthly Pass – Adult & Youth @50 rides	\$	44.00	\$	0.88	75%	5%	3%
Youth Monthly Pass @50 rides	\$	57.50	\$	1.15	68%	13%	9%
Youth Day Pass	\$	6.25	\$	1.56	56%	0.01%	0.01%
Fare Discounts Average >50%			Ave	erage =	79%	39%	19%
Youth Ticket Book (10)	\$	20.00	\$	2.00	44%	2%	2%
Youth Cash Fares	\$	2.00	\$	2.00	44%	1%	1%
Adult Monthly Pass @ 50 Rides	\$	96.00	\$	1.92	46%	38%	39%
Airport Special Fare @ 4 Rides	\$	8.50	\$	2.15	41%	0.1%	0.1%
Adult Day Pass	\$	9.00	\$	2.25	37%	0.2%	0.2%
Fare Discounts, Average >9%	%, <5	50%	Ave	erage =	42%	41%	42%
Adult Ticket Book (10)	\$	30.00	Ś	3.00	16%	10%	19%
Adult Cash Fares		2.00		2.00	4.50/	4.00/	400/

# Fare Revenue, Ridership and Discounts by Fare Type

Adult Ticket Book (10)	\$ 30.00	\$	3.00	16%	10%	19%
Adult Cash Fares	\$ 3.00	\$	3.00	16%	10%	19%
City / Special	\$ 3.00	\$	3.00	16%	0.2%	0.2%
Fare Discounts = 16%		Ave	erage =	16%	20%	38%

	Calgary, AB	Edmonton, AB	Ottawa, ON	Toronto, ON	Montreal, QC	Winnipeg, MB	Vancouver, BC	Hamilton, ON	Mississauga, ON
Fare Categories					2014				
Adult Cash	\$3.00	\$3.20	\$3.40	\$3.00	\$3.00	\$2.55	\$4.00	\$2.55	\$3.25
Adult Tickets - each	\$3.00	\$2.40	\$3.00	\$2.70	\$2.55	\$2.20	\$3.15	\$2.00	\$2.80
Adult Monthly Pass	\$96.00	\$89.00	\$98.75	\$133.75	\$79.50	\$84.70	\$124.00	\$87.00	\$120.00
Low Income Monthly Pass	\$44.00	\$35.00	\$35.00	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$43.50	N/A
Adult Day Pass	\$9.00	\$9.00	\$7.95	\$11.00	\$10.00	N/A	\$9.75	N/A	N/A
Youth Cash	\$2.00	\$3.20	\$1.80	\$2.00	\$2.00	\$2.05	\$2.75	\$2.55	\$3.25
Youth Tickets - each	\$2.00	\$2.10	\$1.50	\$1.85	\$1.55	\$1.53	N/A	\$1.65	\$2.25
Youth Monthly Pass	\$57.50	\$69.00	\$92.50	\$108.00	\$47.25	\$58.90	\$52.00	\$71.00	\$101.00
Youth Day Pass	\$6.25	\$9.00	\$7.95	\$11.00	\$10.00	N/A	\$7.50	N/A	N/A
Seniors Low Income Annual Pass / Seniors Annual Pass	\$15 / \$95	\$54 /\$125	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$205.00	\$534.00
Seniors Monthly Pass	N/A	\$14.00	\$40.00	\$108.00	\$47.25	\$42.35	\$52.00	\$20.50	\$53.00
Comparative Data					2012				
Average Fares	\$1.53	\$1.31	\$1.67	\$1.98	\$1.36	\$1.46	\$1.84	\$1.62	\$1.98
Revenue / Cost Ratio	53%	43%	51%	75%	54%	59%	54%	48%	49%
Hours Per Capita	2.1	2.6	2.6	3.5	3.5	2.0	2.2	1.4	1.7
Service Area – sq kms	896	700	466	632	501	225	1,800	235	179
	Sh	aded text	denotes	values hig	gher than	Calgary			

# **Comparison of Transit Fares in Major Canadian Cities**

#### Summary of Engagement on Calgary Transit Fares

#### Introduction

An estimated 1,500 people were engaged online and in face-to-face discussion between 2014 April 30 and May 14. They were asked to provide "input on which fares should be increased, and by how much, in order to generate \$10 million." They were also asked to consider the balance of Calgary Transit's funding sources and the primary basis of the fare discounts. To help inform their choices, they were able to adjust sliders and shown the impact on fares and revenue.

#### **Online Findings**

Respondents were initially asked whether the balance of funding between fares and property tax (currently at 49 percent from fares) was correct. Sixty-four (64) percent of on-line respondents believed that the balance was correct. For those who responded that the balance should shift, 55 percent believed taxpayers should pay more and 45 percent believed that transit customers should pay more (Figure 1).



Respondents were then asked if income, age, both or neither was an appropriate basis for discounts (Figure 2). Forty-six (46) percent of respondents chose income compared to 13 percent who selected age. However, there was a related theme in the online discussion around distance-based fares as a basis for determining fares rather than income or age.

Figure 2 - Basis for di	scounts
income	46%
age	13%
both	27%
neither	13%

TT2014-0499 Calgary Transit Fare Strategy and Structure Att 7.docx ISC: UNRESTRICTED

The next element of the online engagement was the fare choices tool. The tool asked respondents to change individual fares to achieve a fare revenue gain of \$10 million. The tool was able to calculate the revenue resulting from the suggested price changes based on current ridership with each fare type. The on-line choices made by respondents are not an endorsement of higher fares - they illustrate how respondents might rebalance fares. Figure 3, below, shows how the average of the fare prices suggested by respondents would translate into discounts from the average cost for Calgary Transit to provide a trip. Figure 3 shows how the discounts resulting from respondents' input compares to the actual discounts for each 2014 fare.

Category	Actual Fare Discount vs Avg Trip Cost	Respondents Average Fare Discount
Adult Single Ride	16%	11%
Adult Monthly Pass	46%	44%
Youth Single Ride	44%	35%
Youth Monthly Pass	68%	64%
Low Income Monthly Pass	74%	72%
Senior's Low Income Annual Pass	98%	88%
Senior's Regular Annual Pass	88%	69%

Figure 3 - Actual Fare Discount and Discounts from Respondents
--

The greatest differences between the current discounts and the discounts resulting from the respondent input are highlighted above and generally indicate fares being suggested that are higher than those currently charged. Also, most respondents, including those who indicated that they have a reserved parking space, suggested higher fees for reserved parking.

#### Key Stakeholder Groups

Anticipating that some groups might participate less online and have demonstrated interest in past fare discussions, seniors and low-income customers were engaged face-to-face.

#### Seniors

Thirty two of online respondents identified themselves as seniors. While this is not representative of Calgary Transit ridership, those seniors made fare selections that were generally consistent with the larger group. They were most likely to suggest increases to seniors fares and park and ride fees.

Recognizing that seniors would participate less on-line, an open house was held at the Kerby Centre. The most frequently raised concern was about the impact that fare increases would have on senior's disposable income particularly considering many are on fixed incomes. Fare increases would also impact their quality of life if they had to restrict their use of Calgary Transit for financial reasons. Others stated that \$95 was too much for their ridership habits (i.e. the per-trip cost was too great).

#### Low-Income customers

Low-income customers were also a key stakeholder. Thirty one percent of on-line respondents identified themselves as low-income (they encompass 10 percent of Calgary's population and seven percent of transit customers). Many of the people who identified themselves as being

TT2014-0499 Calgary Transit Fare Strategy and Structure Att 7.docx ISC: UNRESTRICTED

low-income may not have a low-income transit pass; however as a group, similar to senior citizen respondents, they were most likely to suggest increases to seniors fares and park and ride fees.

In person, low-income advocates expressed the desire for a low-income pass based on a sliding scale up to a maximum of 50 percent of the adult fare.

#### Themes from comments and face-to-face engagement

Over 400 comments were received from the discussion section of the on-line engagement, twitter and Facebook. Others were engaged in person in face-to-face meetings or at the open house. The five main themes that emerged from the discussions and comments were:

- 1. Calgary Transit efficiencies. The most frequently mentioned theme was around reducing costs through efficiencies. For example, one respondent said "This is assuming that Transit does zero to look at themselves and find efficiencies. All one has to do is look at the city wide route map and see there is a significant amount of route duplication all requiring extra buses. The 302 spends a good portion of it's time sitting at time points during the day and even during rush hour. This tells me that the scheduled can and should be tightened up which would reduce bus requirements and costs. Throw out the entire city route maps and redesign them from scratch. You'd be surprised at how many successful changes can be made when not looking at currently exists." (sic)
- 2. Alternate sources of funding. Discussion participants suggested raising revenue through ideas such as tolls and charging non-Calgarians more. For example "The only way I could really see having a higher expense for out of town customers is to toll the roads coming into the city during rush hour. Problem is I could see people shortcutting like crazy to get around it."
- 3. Distance-based fares. Rather than basing fares on income or age, some participants in the discussion suggested distance (i.e. zones). For example "Higher fares for people traveling from the outskirts and cheaper fares for inner city. Absolutely!" or "I like the idea in theory but many of the zone-based systems I have experienced, I find that the rates for far distances become quite excessive and prohibitive. Let's take the principle of the zone-system but really make it our own. None of the zone-systems I have experienced are systems that I would like to mimic."
- 4. Frustration with the tool. The theme of the discussion was frustration with the online tool itself. "Give us the option to reduce fares, change the tax/revenue balance, alter the senior/student/low income eligibility criteria. Also add a section for ideas that we can submit (rather than just comments on the page). You've presented a loaded question: "We want your input on which fares should be increased, and by how much, in order to generate \$10 million." E.g.: "Who should we charge more to?" How about changing your revenue model and decreasing fares? How do we provide input on those options?" (sic)
- 5. Fare enforcement. The fifth most commonly mentioned item was targeting fare evasion as a source of revenue. "Why not implement a turnstile system and target fare evasion." (sic) Or "Find a way to properly enforce transit fares. NO other city has the problem Calgary does, in that a lot of people do not pay to use transit every day. This is the largest loss of revenue. Most other cities have turn styles, maybe this isn't the answer, but find a way to make it work. This also solves a large problem of vagrants on the train that are a nuisance." (sic)

TT2014-0499 Calgary Transit Fare Strategy and Structure Att 7.docx ISC: UNRESTRICTED

IN EN	R	Y OF CALGARY ECEIVED RING TRADITIONS ROOM	REVISED TT2014-0499 ATTACHMENT 1		
ITEN		IUN 1 8 2014 Proposed Calg <u>Customer Group</u> TA014 - 0499	ary Transit Fare Structure Change Fare Pricing	Options to Pay	
	Adulta	CLERK'S OFFICE Adults	Fares will grow at a slightly lower rate than the average fare until discounts are rebalanced.	No changes.	
	Youth	Youth	Fares will grow at a slightly higher rate than the average fare until discounts are rebalanced.	No changes.	
	Seniors	Seniors (65+) in the regular Calgary Transit Seniors Annual Pass Program (Grandfathered)	Fares will grow slightly as <mark>other</mark> fares change.	Annual pass discontinued. New monthly and new single ride fare options will be introduced with the Connect Card – July 2015.	
		New Seniors (65+) after July 1, 2015	New monthly pass based on the annual pass rate. Price will increase at a slightly higher rate than the average fare until discounts are rebalanced.	New monthly and new single ride options will be introduced with the Connect Card – July 2015. Annual pass option will not be available.	
	come	Low income Adults (Below 100% LICO)	Fares will be targeted at 50% of the adult fare for each fare option (monthly and single ride).	Monthly pass. A new single ride fare option will be introduced with the Connect Card – July 2015.	
		Low income Youth (Below 100% LICO)	(same as above)	(same as above)	
	Low Income	New Seniors (65+) after July 1, 2015, with incomes under 100% LICO.	(same as above)	(same as above)	
		Seniors in the Calgary Transit Low Income Seniors Annual Pass Program on June 30, 2015. (Grandfathered)	No change until program conclusion.	Annual pass continued. No change until program conclusion.	

By July 2015, Calgary Transit will have three fare groups (not including the 'grandfathered' Seniors Pass Program):

- Regular Adults
- Concession Youth and Seniors
- Low Income All customers falling under 100% LICO

Each fare group will have its own rate with single ride, daily and monthly fare options when using the Connect Card. Cash fares (non-Connect payments) will be accepted for Adults, and Youths only.

TT2014-0499 Calgary Transit Fare Strategy and Structure Att 1.docx ISC: UNRESTRICTED

Page 1 of 2

REVISED TT2014-0499

**ATTACHMENT 1** 

#### Proposed Calgary Transit Fare Discount Structure

Fare Option	2014 Price	2014 Discount*	New Discount**	New Price Basis (based on avg. trip cost)
ADULT FARES				
Cash / Single Ride	\$3.00	16%	15%	85% of single trip cost
Day Pass	\$9.00	37%	30%	70% of the cost of 4 trips
Monthly Pass	\$96.00	46%	45%	55% of the cost of 50 trips
Ticket Books (10)	\$30.00	16%	15%	85% of the cost of 10 trips
YOUTH FARES				
Cash / Single Ride	\$2.00	44%	40%	60% of single trip cost
Day Pass	\$6.25	56%	50%	50% of the cost of 4 trips
Monthly Pass	\$57.50 / \$60.00	68%/66%***	60%	40% of the cost of 50 trips
Ticket Books (10)	\$20.00	44%	40%	60% of the cost of 10 trips
SENIORS				
Single Ride	New	New	40%	60% of single trip cost
Seniors Annual Pass	\$95.00	95%	Discontinue	
Seniors Monthly Pass (grandfathered)	New	New	90%	10% of the cost of 50 trips
Seniors Monthly Pass (new seniors)	New	New	60%	40% of the cost of 50 trips
LOW INCOME				
Adult / Youth / Senior Single Ride	New	New	60%	40% of single trip cost (50% of single fare)
Adult / Youth / Senior Monthly Pass (incl. new seniors)	\$44.00	75%	75%	25% of the cost of 50 trips (50% of adult monthly pass)
Low Income Seniors Annual Pass (grandfathered)	\$15.00	98%	99%	Fixed \$15.00 for existing registrants
POST SECONDARY				
4 Month Semester U-Pass	\$117 / \$120	NA	NA	Negotiated with eligible schools based on use
AIRPORT SPECIAL FEE	- Sold only at the	Calgary Internationa	Airport for Route 30	00 departures
Airport Boarding Pass	\$8.50	41%	30%	70% of the cost of 4 trips

\*Current Discounts are based on average trip cost = \$3.58 (estimated for 2014)

\*\* Future discounts to be based on actual average trip cost

\*\*\* Approved midyear fare change for Youth monthly pass

TT2014-0499 Calgary Transit Fare Strategy and Structure Att 1.docx ISC: UNRESTRICTED

Page 2 of 2

# TT2014-0583 ATTACHMENT 2



On Saturday, June 14<sup>th</sup>, 2014; twenty people with disabilities and supporters gathered together to talk about the 50 year Provincial Transportation Strategy. https://www.transportation.alberta.ca/ABTransStrategyhome.htm

We had an hour and a half to facilitate the discussion. We then split the hour and half meeting into 2 parts:

Part 1 We facilitated a talk about people telling us where they are from and asked "What is transportation like where you live?" People reported to live in southern rural communities, Lethbridge, Medicine Hat, Calgary, Red Deer, Grande Prairie and shared their experiences of what transportation was like in the communities they live.

Part 2: In the second part, Alan Windhorst then shared a short film and PowerPoint point about the draft vision, goals and suggested actions for the Alberta's 50 year plan. The draft report can be found on the Alberta Transportation Website.

The following 7 pages are people's input and what was said in part two of the 50-year Alberta Transportation Strategy.

1

# Part 1: Tell us where you are from and what is transportation like where you live?

# 1. Calgary:

- Calgary Transit, so far, so good.

# 2. Calgary:

- Transportation is pretty good for me, but people who use wheelchairs and other devices it is not that great.

## 3. Calgary:

- We could do a lot better with waiting times, Sunday and winters are really unpredictable. People with disabilities and low-in come; make it better.

## 4. Calgary:

- Great city if you own a car or know someone who can drive you. Or if using Access, huge problem of affordability and availability.
- Low-income transit pass \$\$ at \$44 a month is expensive
- And access, not a lot of buses.

# 5. Lethbridge:

- Handibus can be not so well.
- Have to make appointments in advance to go to Edmonton. Could be better.
- I use a walker, some of the ramps and drop off points, they won't put the ramp down sometimes depends on the driver. As I use a walker. I've fallen and injured myself.

# 6. Calgary:

- C-trains, you have to go fast getting on and off. Trains and buses leave too fast, they don't stop long enough.

# 7. Calgary/Whitecourt:

- I am moving at the end of the month to Whitecourt. Right now I take the LRT and use the low-income transit bus pass. I buy a new one every month.
- Annual bus pass/on-line smart card would help more convenient, not going far away/purchasing pass.

# 8. Lethbridge and surrounding rural communities:

- We don't have a low-income transit pass, we pay full price. With limited income, disabilities, seniors and new-immigrants; Public transit does not reflect how people need to go and cabs are expensive.
- There is no transportation system in rural communities; having to rely on staff or services like "Access-A-Ride" but have to work book a work week in advance-can't just come out.
- Smaller communities just don't have public transportation.
- Greyhound does not exist for Doctor appointments. Not spontaneous, planned. Can't be part of community.
- Handibus drivers get cranky if I don't give enough notice.
- I struggle just to get my bus pass out of my jacket, with my walker, especially in winter.

# 9. Medicine Hat:

- Greyhound use to go to Lethbridge. Now we need someone to take us. Now we take the Greyhound from Medicine Hat to Calgary, then we go to Lethbridge.
- There is now a shuttle service.
- I don't know much about special transit. I pay \$ 65 a month- \$ 2.75 a ride, but bus drivers move before I sit down.
- Drivers can be unfriendly
- Service does not reflect where we need to get to; I can't go to Tiger games now. It is a \$ 12 bus ride- no new transit until the new arena is done even though there are lots of houses around.
- Now new transit manager is a little better.
- They (buses) run late to pick them up.
- Can't get to work by 6 as transit service starts at 6:45 am and I can't get to Tiger Games.

# 10. Medicine Hat:

- Glenda and I share a bus pass as I work out of town. I go to Elkwater where my work is, about an hour and ½ drive away (near Cypress Hills).
- Share a bus pass when I am not home. (Affordability?)

- Transit driver service and let us go on even though the pass is expired 2 days ago.
- We walk a lot of places. (Because it is expensive and service is limited)

# 11. Lethbridge:

- Sundays the service does not start until 8 am. You gotta walk, no late buses.
- Got to get groceries. I have to walk. There a service; does not start
- Have to wait an hour if I miss the bus.
- Have to stop life by 6 pm.

# 12. Calgary:

- The ACE Card (Access Calgary Extra) card is a 'spontaneous taxi card' to help go places. The Driver only knows the balance when it bounces. People sitting on edge of chair hoping to get home.
- It is an electronic card that advocates fought hard to keep when the City took over 'special needs taxi' taxi service. Not all Access Calgary users get is as you have to be medically fragile, unsafe travelling at night or have a dementia or you get lost easily.
- The card monthly balance use to be \$90, but it was cut to around \$40 when the city took over. More advocates fought to increase the monthly amount to \$65 due to the size of Calgary. It is good solution in smaller rural areas where there is no public transportation and only taxis.
- It is an opportunity to use technology.
- But there is no phone number on the card to find out your balance.
- It is a challenge- it would be helpful to find out the balance before you take a trip.

# 13. Calgary:

- Steps to a c-train are too steep. No ramps in places. Ramp designs are no universal Take a long time. The new c-train designs also have less seats, and you have to stand more.
- People don't get up so you can sit down.
- In Edmonton and in Calgary there is a campaign to be nice to people, be clean and not hog the seat with your backpack.

# Alan

- Alberta Transportation has heard many municipalities don't have enough \$ and need funding for public transit capital like LRT and buses, as well as funding to operate them.

# 14. Calgary:

- There are 4 doors on c-trains, but you can only use the 2 inner doors. It should be every door. Why aren't all doors accessible?
- Brentwood LRT, no ramp one day. Told to take bus. Could not get on the LRT.
- Access Calgary waits on the phone, for a ½ hour to get an answer on my own personal cell phone, and the window of 20 minutes is not reasonable.
- And why are alterations to a scheduled trip going on a wait list/cannot make an alteration, why?
- Routes do not connect well from a BRT/LRT stop. It's a good long walk to catch the buses and make sure connections meet on time.

# 15. Grande Prairie:

- Shows free bus pass. All I have to do is how ID and my medical services card 2 times a month. It's easy to apply.
- Transit is free because they had a very good mayor fight for people.
- Transit is free in Grande Prairie if you live on AISH, seniors have a different process.
- And in Banff, transit is free if you are a senior, person with a disability or live on low-income.

# 16. Lethbridge:

- Drunk people on the bus. Sometimes they bug me. People are mean to me. I know the driver's names and I know the supervisor but I get sick of having to ask the driver to help. (Safety and being a target on bus).
- In rush hour they try different buses.
- Drivers are grumpy.

# 17. Lethbridge:

- Bigger buses and sometimes they are smaller buses.
- There are different sized for different vehicles and even natural gas buses to help us use less polluting vehicles.
- Provincial Green trip funding helps with mass transit and getting cars off the road.

# 18. Calgary:

- Buses don't come frequently and often take the train as I had bad experiences in winter using buses. Really tough.

5

- I use the U-Pass as I go to university and the price is included in our student fees.
- I am reliant on people to take me to the less accessible places in our City and outside of our City.
- I would like to be in nature more and to go the mountains or inside the Calgary parks.
- I usually walk or trike, but even using my trike I cannot ride downtown.
- If transit is different, different ways to use alternative transportation.
- Feel very marginalized.

#### 19. Lethbridge:

- Winter, ramps cannot lower ramp as snow in the way.
- Buses are not full, yet the drivers say they are full and they go right past you. Or they say they are full and they are not. I walked two blocks and it was pretty windy with my walker.
- During rush hour impossible to get on due to full capacity, cannot get on.

#### 20. Calgary:

- There are over half a million people in Alberta with disabilities. 1 in 7 Albertans. Accessible, affordable public transportation around our province is needed.
- It seems like there are two separate laws, one for cars and on for buses. It is not equal. On buses, we are treated like sardines. We need 1 law, not 2 different laws and we need priorities for safety and to us to use private cars less and off the road.

# Part 2: Alberta Transportation Strategy Update by Alan Windhorst:

Alan Windhorst is the 'Senior Manager of Transportation Corridors Alberta Transportation' and has worked in the government department for the last seven years. Alan talked to us about the videos, radio & TV Ads telling Albertans to give input on the development of the 50-year Strategy, which asked about what needs to be the priorities for the Alberta Government. We saw the short video titled 'Learn more about the Transportation Strategy for Alberta' and it can be seen on this website.



https://www.transportation.alberta.ca/ABTransStrategyhome.htm

# Here is what the website also says:

The Government of Alberta is developing a Transportation Strategy for Alberta that will provide a vision for Alberta's transportation system over the next 50 years. The Strategy will cover all forms of transportation, connections and ways to move people and products. It will also provide an overarching direction to help guide decisions on transportation investments, policies and programs. The Strategy is being developed based on input obtained from Albertans during two phases of public consultations held in early 2014.

During phase one, (January and February 2014) public consultation sessions were held in 18 communities throughout the province to seek input on the Strategy's development. Written feedback was also submitted to Alberta Transportation for review. Input from phase one formed the foundation of the draft Strategy that was made available for review and comment during phase two.

During phase two, (April and May 2014) Albertans participated in an online public consultation about the draft Strategy. Albertans read the draft Strategy and provided their thoughts through a survey and/or an in-depth workbook. A facilitator's handbook was made available for interested parties to host their own discussions and submit their input to Alberta Transportation. A comment box was provided on Alberta Transportation's website to submit comments on the draft Strategy. If we have any questions or would like additional information on the development of the Strategy, please contact TransStrategy@gov.ab.ca or 780-641-9328 (dial 310-0000 first for toll-free access anywhere in Alberta).

Alan then showed us three draft slides titled 'Proposed Vision, Recommended Goals, and Suggested Actions' and said there are also printed copies of the draft Strategy, titled "Connecting Albertans with Each Other and the World: A Long-Term Transportation".

To see a list of all suggested actions, look at pages 8 to page 13 or the report. Full report

https://www.transportation.alberta.ca/Content/docType5513/Production/Draft%20Strate gy.pdf

**Our Proposed Vision:** 

An integrated, cost-efficient, multi-modal transportation system that is safe, affordable, and accessible to all Albertans.

Alan then showed us the draft recommended goals:

- 1. Competitiveness, market access and economic growth.
- 2. Active communities
- 3. Connected communities.
- 4. Safety and Security
- 5. Innovation and Technology
- 6. Environmental Stewardship
- 7. Long-term sustainability.

Alan then shared with us the part of the draft plan for suggested actions for accessible transportation. However some of our commentary also includes issues about safety, affordability and sustainability. Found in various parts of the report from pages 8-13.

- Suggested actions in the draft Strategy related to accessible transportation include:
- Encourage municipalities to implement processes and build infrastructure that make their community accessible for all.
- Implementing a barrier- free access policy and legislation to ensure all Albertans can physical access transportation services.
- Working with municipalities to promote and or improve public transit.
- Implementing best practices in providing reliable, accessible, and affordable and age friendly transit.

Alan said many partners, including the federal government, the province, municipalities and industry, will have to work together to help address these actions - it needs a coordinated effort.

Thank you to all the participants, facilitators for providing input into "Let's Talk about Transportation"



## TT2014-0583 **ATTACHMENT 2**

For questions or more information about this summary, contact the Disability Action Hall at 403.717.7630 or <u>actionhall@calgaryscope.org</u>

.