

# Urban Design Review Panel Comments

<b>Date</b>	May 12, 2021	
<b>Time</b>	2:00	
<b>Panel Members</b>	<b>Present</b> Chad Russill (Chair) Anna Lawrence Jeff Lyness Katherine Robinson Ben Bailey Gary Mundy	<b>Distribution</b> Chris Hardwicke (Co-Chair) Glen Pardoe Beverly Sandalack Jack Vanstone Noorullah Hussain Zada
<b>Advisor</b>	David Down, Chief Urban Designer	
<b>Application number</b>	DP2019-6254	
<b>Municipal address</b>	3740 32 Av NW	
<b>Community</b>	Varsity	
<b>Project description</b>	New: Protective and Emergency Services, Multi Residential Development, Office Child Care Service (60), Sign - Class B (Fascia Signs - 1), Sign - Class C (Freestanding Sign - 1)	
<b>Review</b>	Third	
<b>File Manager</b>	Courtney Stengel	
<b>City Wide Urban Design</b>	Chad Oberg	
<b>Applicant</b>	Marc Boutin Architectural Collaborative	

\*Based on the applicant's response to the Panel's comments, the Chief Urban Designer will determine if further review will include the Panel or be completed internally only by City Wide Urban Design.

## Summary

The proposed project is an integrated City of Calgary development which incorporates affordable housing, corporate accommodation, commercial retail space (envisioned by the application as a daycare). This application includes the replacement of the existing Firehall 17 and hazardous waste drop off. The site is located at the prominent corner of 32<sup>nd</sup> Avenue and 37<sup>th</sup> Street NW. As background, the applicant outlined the previous design scheme and process by which the current iteration was determined. This was very helpful to the Panel as it provided the primary decision drivers for the revised proposal.

The current proposal unstacks the previous podium-based design allowing for broader connection to the community while reducing vehicular access points. The design maintains the initial idea of connection and integration, but rather than a single building, the programmatic elements are arranged in a campus design around a large public courtyard/amenity space. The affordable housing program is located along 37th Avenue creating a strong street wall and appropriately scaled interface to the adjacent single family residential. A single access point along 37th Street is shared by the residential and commercial uses. The Firehall is placed behind the existing hall with apparatus access from 32nd Avenue. Connecting the residential and firehall footprints is the corporate accommodations and daycare programs, which act as a link in the truest sense by connecting the parking / commercial access from the north to a future public park to the south of the site.

The Panel endorses the project and acknowledges the design meets the program requirements of the various uses while being respectful to the adjacent context. The design is thoughtful and well considered overall, however, the Panel outlines some considerations for further refinement below.

- Extension of the connection from the social stair to the intersection of 32<sup>nd</sup> and 37<sup>th</sup>.
- Potential for a more direct connection (visual + access) from the parking to the courtyard.
- Careful consideration of the security and access as the social stair and adjacent roof top spaces could be a CPTED concern if not properly monitored / programmed.

Please refer to the individual elements for additional commentary from the panel.

DP2019-6254  
UDRP Comments

05/12/2021

**Applicant Response**

2021.05.19

The applicant (MBAC) would like to thank the UDRP panel for their continued support and constructive feedback. The project team is pleased that the Panel endorses the project and will endeavor to pursue design excellence on the project to acknowledge the provided commentary and ensure a well-considered project for the City of Calgary.

For the primary considerations noted above:

**1. Extension of the connection from the social stair to the intersection of 32<sup>nd</sup> and 37<sup>th</sup>.**

Response: The design team agrees with the intention to ensure broader macro urban connections within the larger domain of the development, and also acknowledge that these connections and the future development of the south parcel are not in our scope of work currently. Consultant will review pathways from social stair and courtyard area and gauge viability of providing potential for future connection to intersection of 32nd and 37th.

**2. Potential for a more direct connection (visual + access) from the parking to the courtyard.**

Response: Consultant will continue to develop plans and internal circulation to ensure visual and physical access between parking and courtyard.

**3. Careful consideration of the security and access as the social stair and adjacent roof top spaces could be a CPTED concern if not properly monitored / programmed.**

Response: Consultant will ensure best practices for CPTED and engage with City of Calgary security services to ensure programming, access, and monitoring maintain high level of visibility and safety.

Urban Design Element	
<b>Creativity</b> <i>Encourage innovation; model best practices</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Overall project approach as it relates to original ideas or innovation</li> </ul>	
UDRP Commentary	The social stair is a compelling and unique approach to providing multiple use opportunities through a single element. Potential consideration for further connection of the social stair to the north side of the site – formally connecting the north and south through a natural desire line and pathway link.
Applicant Response	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Consultant will continue to push development of social stair to ensure connectivity and develop internal plan logic to account for travel from courtyard to parking area.</li> </ul>
<b>Context</b> <i>Optimize built form with respect to mass and spacing of buildings, placement on site, response to adjacent uses, heights and densities</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Massing relationship to context, distribution on site, and orientation to street edges</li> <li>Shade impact on public realm and adjacent sites</li> </ul>	
UDRP Commentary	<p>The built form and placement of program is responsive to the site condition and adjacent context. The new design, which separates incompatible uses and vehicle access points, creates a more hospitable environment for all site users, allowing each use to function as intended without substantial impact on the operation of the other.</p> <p>Consideration of the adjacent context and how people may travel to the site other than by car would be recommended. Connection for the building program to the street and even beyond to other modes of transportation (LRT) would be beneficial to establish connection opportunities with the desire lines of the site.</p>
Applicant Response	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Consultant team will continue to review and explore potential future connections of the existing site to broader community through terminus and ability or pathways to expand in alignment with development of the area.</li> <li>The design team agrees with the intent of connection to the broader community and will endeavor to provide ability for integration into future development off of project site.</li> <li>The design team's intent is to create a flexible framework and site design that can be added onto and integrated into the broader context as adjacent developments continue.</li> </ul>
<b>Animation</b> <i>Incorporate active uses; pay attention to details; add colour, wit and fun</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Building form contributes to an active pedestrian realm</li> <li>Residential units provided at-grade</li> <li>Elevations are interesting and enhance the streetscape</li> </ul>	
UDRP Commentary	<p>The building forms are restrained, but well considered with brick being a unifying material expressed in differing ways on the residential and firehall building forms.</p> <p>Although used on other portions of the project, the creative use of brick on the Firehall massing (curved edges used as mech screening) delineates this use from those adjacent.</p> <p>The transparency of the link and adjacent social stair contribute to active frontages on both the north and south. Grade oriented units along 37<sup>th</sup> Street is viewed as an appropriate response to the frontage.</p>
Applicant Response	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>No response required.</li> </ul>
<b>Human Scale</b> <i>Defines street edges, ensures height and mass respect context; pay attention to scale</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Massing contribution to public realm at grade</li> </ul>	
UDRP Commentary	The project will require careful consideration of human scaled detailing. The heights of walls and types of screening were discussed. These will be integral to ensuring the notions desired by the design can be realized.
Applicant Response	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Noted. Consultant team will ensure diligent detailing and development to ensure connectivity and transparency are maintained.</li> </ul>
<b>Integration</b> <i>The conjunction of land-use, built form, landscaping and public realm design</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Parking entrances and at-grade parking areas are concealed</li> <li>Weather protection at entrances and solar exposure for outdoor public areas</li> <li>Winter city response</li> </ul>	

UDRP Commentary	<p>Potential to develop the hazardous material drop off with landscaping to potentially screen the development from the adjacent ENMAX sub-station.</p> <p>The integration of the landscaped area in the parking lot needs detailed consideration so that the area will thrive over time in this climate. This area has the capability to create a stronger neighborhood connection to the site and reduce the feel of the visual impact of the parking area. The Panel encourages the development of this area to include all year round accessible sidewalks, additional lighting to encourage pedestrian use and significant detail to ensure the success of the design.</p> <p>Review typical residential interface between building and adjacent soft landscaping / patio areas to animate beyond sidewalks and grass.</p>
Applicant Response	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Consultant team will review household hazardous waste drop off with landscape and work to screen area from adjacent parcels.</li> <li>Consultant team will work with landscape and civil engineering to design central landscape area so that it maintains intention of a green buffer within the parking lot, and ensure that site access, planting, and lighting, all work together to encourage pedestrian use and year-round accessibility.</li> <li>Consultant team will continue to develop design and endeavor to create engaging residential interface at ground level suites.</li> </ul>
<p><b>Connectivity</b> Achieve visual and functional connections between buildings and places; ensure connection to existing and future networks.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Pedestrian first design, walkability, pathways through site</li> <li>Connections to LRT stations, regional pathways and cycle paths</li> <li>Pedestrian pathway materials extend across driveways and lanes</li> </ul>	
UDRP Commentary	<p>The idea of using the desire lines and notions of goat paths the delineate the ordering of the site while providing for connectivity based on pedestrian movement patterns can be further developed.</p> <p>Two opportunities exist to increase pedestrian desire lines:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1) Access from the parking and through the central landscaped area and to the buildings, and</li> <li>2) Angled extension from the social stair to the intersection of 32<sup>nd</sup> and 37<sup>th</sup>.</li> </ol>
Applicant Response	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Consultant team will review pedestrian desire lines. In parking area, intention is to maintain amount of greenery which may be diminished if additional access paths are provided.</li> <li>The design team agrees with the intention to ensure broader macro urban connections within the larger domain of the development, and also acknowledge that these connections and the future development of the south parcel are not in our scope of work currently.</li> </ul>
<p><b>Accessibility</b> Ensure clear and simple access for all types of users</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Barrier free design</li> <li>Entry definition, legibility, and natural wayfinding</li> </ul>	
UDRP Commentary	<p>The natural wayfinding from the north through to the courtyard can be further developed to be a more direct and visual connection. Exterior lighting has been incorporated into the overall site strategy, but further refinement as to the lighting and how it will promote an active site from all sides and at all times is crucial to ensuring the wayfinding is clear and that CPTED concerns are not missed.</p> <p>Location of an elevator to access the roof area may need to be reviewed based on how the access / programming was represented. More direct visual connection from and to the social stair. Currently, the elevator location would require a well-developed and comprehensive signage package.</p>
Applicant Response	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Consultant team will further develop site lighting and wayfinding to ensure clear navigation through site and CPTED considerations.</li> <li>Location of elevator is currently optimized to consider access and functionality with program. Access and operation of area will be reviewed to encourage use of elevator and rooftop access.</li> </ul>
<p><b>Diversity</b> Promote designs accommodating a broad range of users and uses</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Retail street variety, at-grade areas, transparency into spaces</li> </ul>	

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Corner treatments and project porosity</li> </ul>	
UDRP Commentary	The integration of uses is an exemplary example of providing a variety within one site. The Panel acknowledges this is inherent in the intention for the project from the City of Calgary, but the design further defines and reinforces these notions.
Applicant Response	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• No response required.</li> </ul>
<b>Flexibility</b> <i>Develop planning and building concepts which allow adaptation to future uses, new technologies</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Project approach relating to market and/or context changes</li> </ul>	
UDRP Commentary	The centrally located link element is key to maintaining flexibility in the overall project as the Panel views the uses in this area of the project as being the only ones that are likely evolve over time.
Applicant Response	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Noted. Consultant team will endeavor to ensure flexibility and adaptability over time of central link.</li> </ul>
<b>Safety</b> <i>Achieve a sense of comfort and create places that provide security at all times</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Safety and security</li> <li>• Night time design</li> </ul>	
UDRP Commentary	<p>Stair – roof top access control as currently designed is key. Potential for further incorporation of residential and fire hall occupancies on the roof to provide additional passive monitoring of the spaces.</p> <p>The social stair being an access to the roof is not necessarily a requirement to facilitate public / private integration. The roof element could be further explored as a semi-public space that is only for the occupants of the building, leaving the grade elements / social stair as those spaces that can be used by the general public. This would eliminate a number of security / access control issue that would need to be resolved in the current iteration.</p>
Applicant Response	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Noted – the use of the roof as semi-public and stairs and courtyard as public is a good programmatic consideration. How use is delineated and controlled will be further reviewed with User Group for potential for controlled access to amenity.</li> <li>• Consultant team will review access and CPTED measures with City of Calgary security.</li> </ul>
<b>Orientation</b> <i>Provide clear and consistent directional clues for urban navigation</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Enhance natural views and vistas</li> </ul>	
UDRP Commentary	The project is orientated well, given the adjacent context. Further development of the connection to the adjacent streets is recommended to strengthen the navigation into the site – specifically the exterior courtyard and social stair.
Applicant Response	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The design team agrees with the intention to ensure broader macro urban connections within the larger domain of the development, and also acknowledge that these connections and the future development of the south parcel are not in our scope of work currently.</li> <li>• The design team's intent is to create a flexible framework and site design that can be added onto and integrated into the broader context as adjacent developments continue.</li> </ul>
<b>Sustainability</b> <i>Be aware of lifecycle costs; incorporate sustainable practices and materials</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Site/solar orientation and passive heating/cooling</li> <li>• Material selection and sustainable products</li> </ul>	
UDRP Commentary	Although not specifically presented or discussed, the Panel assumes the applicant will meet with Sustainable Infrastructure with Corporate Analytics and Innovation to determine which level of certification under which of the various programs is appropriate for the project. This determined target is recommended to be fully integrated with the design as it evolves.
Applicant Response	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Confirmed. Project is targeted for LEED and WELL certification through coordination with City of Calgary sustainability.</li> </ul>
<b>Durability</b> <i>Incorporate long-lasting materials and details that will provide a legacy rather than a liability</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Use of low maintenance materials and/or sustainable products</li> <li>• Project detailed to avoid maintenance issues</li> </ul>	
UDRP Commentary	Materials used are highly durable and their thoughtful use is appreciated.
Applicant Response	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• No response required.</li> </ul>