

Business Support Programs and Initiatives Lessons Learned Summary

Summary

A review of recent local, North American and international transportation infrastructure mega-projects including public transit, Light Rail Transit, subway and Bus Rapid Transit projects was conducted. Of the projects reviewed, the majority had some form of program or initiatives aimed at supporting businesses and communities impacted by construction. The types of programs and the ways they were implemented varied, but what was largely consistent across the examples was that those which were most successful included effective and timely communications programs, resourcing that allowed for stakeholders to easily access project staff and to support responsive resolution for emerging issues, and finally, programs where the intent of the support initiatives were well aligned with the needs and interests of affected stakeholders or businesses.

Historically, the focus of many transportation infrastructure mega-projects has been on project delivery objectives of completion on-time and on-budget; there was often less attention given to the social and economic impacts associated with construction and the effect these projects have on stakeholders and the communities where they were built. Today, transportation agencies, local governments and partners working to deliver these large infrastructure projects are more aware of the disruptions and impacts that construction can have on stakeholders and communities. While there are limits to what can be mitigated, there is typically greater consideration of these impacts during the construction phase of projects, more pre-construction planning and consideration, and a growing number of measures are being incorporated into projects to support impacted stakeholders, including leveraging partnerships where possible.

From our review, we have found that business support initiatives can generally be categorized into six types:

- (1) Access and construction management
- (2) Business capacity building
- (3) Marketing and promotion
- (4) Procurement
- (5) Workforce training
- (6) Financial support

While each of these types of initiatives provides some measure of support, they are often implemented to achieve different project outcomes; using different tools and expertise. Their applicability to projects depends on a number of variables including things like the structure of the contract, scale of the project, types of stakeholders impacted and amount of funding allocated. What we have observed in the projects reviewed is that multiple initiatives are often implemented in some form or combination but there is no one solution to replicate. Initiatives and programs are often developed over the course of construction and in response to changing stakeholder needs.

Despite business support programs being more common, as reflected by the greater variety and scope of program offerings, with any large infrastructure project there is finite overall funding, and business

and community support programs typically operate with a very small portion of overall project budgets. Business support programs with direct financial assistance programs that offer grant and loan programs to support impacted businesses often have the largest budgets and more consistent stakeholder impacts to consider (e.g. a number of projects seem to be built along corridors that have similar characteristics such as an existing commercial corridor populated by retail, personal service, food and entertainment businesses etc.). Other support programs that are focused on business marketing and promotions, access and construction management and business capacity building are usually more modest and benefit from using different types of initiatives to address a variety of stakeholder impacts. Regardless of budget constraints, it is important that consideration in the evaluation, design and delivery of business support programs is undertaken to ensure good overall value for investment and that the most effective support outcomes for impacted businesses and communities are realized.

Lessons Learned

Overview of Projects Reviewed

To support this Lessons Learned review, research into business support programming associated with large infrastructure projects has been undertaken in a variety of ways over several years. The work includes procured research and targeted interviews with impacted businesses, student research projects, as well as staff research into business support initiatives and programs and a staff review of post-project lessons learned assessments and stakeholder experiences with recent City infrastructure projects in Calgary and other Canadian cities.

While our research indicated a range of funding for business support programs and initiatives across projects, there were research limitations when business support program financials were assessed. In particular, it is not always known whether a project incorporated a number of other business support initiatives or measures beyond the one being researched and secondly, it is not easy to discern whether staff resourcing costs to administer these programs are reflected in the publicly available program budget information.

The following sections provide an overview of key learnings from other business support programs and initiatives.

A Strong Program Foundation: Communications, Community and Stakeholder Relationships

Across projects, there is considerable variety in the types of programs, tactics and initiatives that are developed to support businesses. This variety and range of tactics reflects the diversity of geographies and stakeholders that these large infrastructure projects impact and underscores that there is no “one size fits all” business support program that can be implemented for all projects. Having said that, business support programs or initiatives that were most successful, or perceived to be most successful by citizens, had two foundational components: a well-designed and implemented communications program and established relationships and opportunities for two-way dialogue with impacted

stakeholders. Programs that were able to deliver on these key communications and stakeholder relations measures, often had much higher satisfaction ratings from stakeholders regardless of the severity of the impacts that were experienced or the efficacy of the business support initiatives or tactics employed.

Key Lessons Learned in this area include:

- **Establish a strong communications program** - Strategic communications programs provide high quality information and use tactics to connect with strategic partners and networks to ensure project understanding.
- **Establish reliable source(s) of project information** – a communications program should remain intact, supportive and accessible for the duration of the project program so that stakeholders know how and where to find the information they need to be informed.
- **Make communications accessible** – it is critical to ensure that information about the project (e.g. construction impacts) and the support program or initiatives are straightforward, accurate and easy to understand (e.g. plain language, multi-lingual, culturally sensitive etc.)
- **Contextually aware** – The communications program should be attune to the current external climate, in-step with any wider public communications of the jurisdiction, and attune to the specific context and interests of the stakeholder businesses/participants.
- **Accurate and timely** - Communications about construction impacts should be clear, accurate, with relevant details and provided well in advance of the impacts.
- **Be honest and set the right expectations** - Communications should “paint a picture” of what construction impacts will be experienced. Potential “worst case scenarios” are better to provide than scenarios and details that are overly optimistic or ambitious (i.e. do not downplay potential impacts or their severity, do not provide overly ambitious completion dates, do not provide construction information or milestones that may be irrelevant to stakeholders etc.)
- **Share details that will help stakeholders prepare** - Communications about the impacts must provide adequate details and dates (e.g. what types of service outages will occur, specifics of the mobility network access impacts, nuisance impacts such as noise and vibrations etc.) so businesses can begin to prepare, plan for and implement adaptive strategies.
- **Celebrate and communicate progress** – share project wins/successes that are relevant to affected stakeholders.
- **Seek input and participation from affected stakeholders** - Effectively target and engage the intended business stakeholder audience for input into the development of programs and initiatives - business support programs tend to be most successful when there is higher input and participation from affected stakeholder businesses. Effective communications programs often foster greater stakeholder participation.
- **Maintain regular contact with impacted stakeholders** - Project communications channels should be established to ensure that there are regular opportunities to receive feedback and share information with stakeholders.
- **Maintain an up to date stakeholder database** – Ensure there is accurate contact information available to enable direct outreach when construction plans change and to confirm designated representatives to be sure that direction is being provided by those with authority.

Attributes for Program Success

Through the review, there were other key attributes that influenced the success and effectiveness of specific business support initiatives and the program overall, specifically where the program and initiatives were:

- Informed by stakeholder input
- Contextual for stakeholders and specific to the construction impact(s)
- Adequately resourced
- Leveraged through partnerships

Informed by stakeholder input

Business support programs that received the highest satisfaction ratings from businesses were those that were organized with ongoing opportunities for stakeholders to connect with other stakeholders, to easily access program administrators, and where stakeholders believed their input was meaningfully considered to inform decision making around the business support program or initiative.

There is a spectrum of engagement and for some initiatives it makes sense for stakeholders to have more or less impact on the decision being made. Involving stakeholders or including them in a collaborative process is one indicator of an agency's willingness to support. The value of meaningful engagement is that stakeholders feel heard, are able to communicate their interests and have an improved understanding of the decisions made. An added benefit of collaboration with stakeholders is the likelihood that the programs and initiatives implemented will have greater relevance for impacted businesses.

Key Lessons Learned in this area include:

- **Collaborative program or initiative development** - Programs that incorporate collaborative approaches often received the greatest stakeholder "buy-in" for proposed program initiatives. These programs also benefit by having more vested stakeholders who are willing and likely to work toward solutions, offer insight and even champion program initiatives or solutions.
- **Set clear parameters for what is open for input** – Programs which embody collaborative stakeholder participation are not required to adopt or pursue initiatives that may be infeasible or out of scope, simply due to stakeholder advocacy or request; these parameters should be identified and communicated at the outset to set appropriate expectations.
- **Report back on input considered** – It is just as important to report back on what you will do as it is to report back on why you could not do something.
- **Value in hearing different perspectives** – Communities and stakeholders are diverse in projects that impact different communities and types of areas. Ensuring that discussions and input into the development of the program is inclusive of different stakeholder perspectives will allow the program or initiatives to be more relevant.
- **Business forums or venues to share experiences, promote ideas and solutions** – Creating opportunities for impacted businesses to come together, learn from each other and generate ideas to support each other. Opportunities to connect (or where stakeholders may connect)

stakeholders often serves as a form of social, economic and community capacity building and resiliency.

Contextual for stakeholders and specific to the construction impact

Programs and initiatives that are tailored to or designed in consideration of the context and characteristics of the businesses or areas they intend to support often have success and receive higher satisfaction ratings from stakeholder businesses – regardless of an initiative’s efficacy. For example, a public marketing campaign initiative to “shop local along the alignment” may have significant benefit or value (perceived or real) in supporting small scale independent retailers and restaurateurs through a period of adjacent construction; whereas the same or similar marketing initiative employed in a different context such as when construction is in an industrial setting adjacent to manufacturing businesses - may have little to no supportive value for these businesses.

Successful programs and initiatives are those that have planned proactively and accounted for influencing factors, including, the local context and physical conditions where the project is being constructed as well as macro-economic conditions (consumer trends, interest rates, inflation, unemployment etc.), and environmental conditions (including factors influencing public health and wellness such as pandemics, etc.) Acute awareness of the intended objective(s) that an initiative seeks to support is also needed. For example, a marketing campaign for a series of retail business encouraging citizens to shop locally along the alignment, may have less value for these businesses if they have already shifted their retail efforts to on-line sales in response to other influencing factors. A more informed support program would have likely been attune to this information and tailored a marketing campaign that was more in keeping with stakeholder interests, such as encouraging customers/consumers to shop on-line.

Key Lessons Learned in this area include:

- **Need to be aware of the many factors that can impact businesses and focus on what we can control** – Macro-economic influences and local impacts should be considered.
- **Deeper understanding of operational impacts** – Getting to know stakeholders and their business operations can help to identify (and implement) more effective support initiatives to address construction impacts.
- **Maintaining a detailed (and current) stakeholder business database** – detailed and current information about stakeholders increases the ability to implement and monitor the efficacy support initiatives.
- **Balancing interests and impacts** – Understanding dependencies between solutions (e.g. expansion of short-term on-street parking for businesses may have negative impacts on residential on-street parking if this is not considered in a way that is balanced)

Adequately resourced

In addition to ensuring the team is adequately resourced to maintain regular contact with stakeholders and to resolve issues and enquiries promptly, adequate program resourcing is necessary to: 1) design and implement programs and initiatives effectively, 2) be equipped to respond to stakeholder feedback regarding initiatives and when feasible, to consider and action any adjustments or changes, and 3) have

capacity to sustain support initiatives for the duration they are planned for and even extended in the event of construction delays etc.

Key Lessons Learned in this area include:

- **Ensure staff are well versed and vested in the particular area they are supporting** - Ideally stakeholder relations staff have a deep knowledge of the areas they are supporting and if feasible a direct connection to the areas.
- **Stakeholder businesses appreciate an accessible, direct and consistent point of contact** – If feasible, staff resourcing should be organized to allow for 24/7 accessibility and direct access for impacted stakeholders (e.g. Email and phone contact of a staff member point of contact(s) who are already known to the stakeholder).
- **Develop a program framework where changes or adjustments to initiative(s) based on feedback may be considered and implemented efficiently** – A program where continued and extensive engagement with stakeholders is possible before, during and after construction.

Leveraged through partnerships

Another common aspect across most of the programs is to leverage opportunities for partnership with other existing programs or supports where possible. Partnership opportunities present the ability to maximize efficiencies, reduce program costs and draw on existing expertise. For example, a project delivery team may partner with an existing financial grant program or business capacity building program. Partnerships may be developed with an existing community agency, local government or chamber of commerce that offers programs aimed at supporting businesses. The purpose being to leverage existing programs, not recreate them.

Key Lessons Learned in this area include:

- **Partner in delivery of initiatives that are mutually beneficial** – Assisting businesses to access an existing program where capacity building support is offered may not only help the business in weathering current construction impacts, but may also help the business become more resilient to other existing or future stressors - thereby potentially also fulfilling objectives of the partner program.
- **Cost-sharing and construction coordination** – This type of partnership coordination allows for potential construction efficiencies, and improved mitigation strategies (e.g. more efficient, comprehensive and effective) to be implemented.
- **Partner to support a common interest** – e.g. safety awareness, school education, community building. Partnerships present an opportunity for the partner with the greatest capacity (e.g. expertise, experience, networks, and resources etc.) to lead or provide guidance and expertise. Programs and initiatives that can draw on experience and existing capacity - often have greater likelihood of success.
- **Room for everyone to be successful** – Delivery partners – Industry partners, when common interests can be aligned, and effectively incorporated into the program's key communications, increased partnership buy-in often results as there become shared objectives. (e.g. helping the development industry looking to build along the alignment as increased development may contribute positively to transit ridership objectives etc.)

Business Support Initiatives

Based on the research completed, business support initiatives and tactics can be organized into six general categories:

- (1) Access and construction management
- (2) Business capacity building
- (3) Marketing and promotion
- (4) Procurement
- (5) Workforce training
- (6) Financial support

Access and construction management

Initiatives that focus on alternate access, servicing and business continuity plans to mitigate construction impacts have become common practice with large-scale infrastructure construction projects. Many businesses, such as retailers, food and entertainment and personal service businesses rely on customer access and street frontage. Shipping and receiving of goods and supplies as well as waste management are essential to the operations of most businesses, and access to utilities for power, water, sanitation and telecommunications are essential services. As such, access and construction related impacts to businesses can significantly affect and disrupt their operations. Initiatives geared to providing mobility network detouring and access solutions or improving aesthetics around construction sites can be effective, as well as initiatives that provide for off-site temporary parking solutions to offset the loss of public on-street parking.

Access management and construction mitigation initiatives vary based on the characteristics of the construction project, but their objectives are generally to establish public awareness that the impacted businesses are still “open for business,” to implement mobility network access solutions that will enable continued access to businesses, and implement any other strategies or tactics that may minimize or offset disruptive construction impacts, thereby allowing businesses to continue to operate as successfully as possible from their existing locations.

Development of a regular street sweeping or window washing campaign for businesses adjacent to construction, a comprehensive wayfinding signage plan to help citizens navigate and access businesses adjacent to a construction zone, and application of construction hoarding adorned with creative or artistic graphics to improve aesthetics around a construction site are all examples of these types of initiatives.

Independent, smaller scale retail, food and personal services business are often targeted by these support initiatives given their reliance on walk-in customer traffic and the significant disruption caused when these activities are impeded by construction. In many of the lessons learned, construction activities took place along streets and corridors where these types of businesses are commonplace (e.g. commercial main streets).

Access and construction management support initiatives are generally applicable across the majority of businesses types, particularly when these initiatives can be tailored to meet business needs. But while these types of initiatives can go a long way to support businesses during construction, they may not

achieve their intended support objectives if offered in isolation without other supporting initiatives, such as effective marketing campaigns and promotions. The success of these initiatives may also be challenged by the overall scope and scale of the construction activities and their duration.

Examples of access and construction management initiatives:

- Offsetting the impacts of additional dust and debris generated by a construction site by implementing a street and sidewalk cleaning program on adjacent streets.
- Offsetting the loss of on-street commercial parking (due to construction) by leasing a nearby private parking lot for patrons of area businesses, who would have regularly used on-street parking to use.
- Use of creatively designed construction hording around a construction site as a way to animate the area and improve overall aesthetics in proximity to the construction site.
- Coordinating a schedule with a manufacturing business that is impacted by a construction site access closure, whereby project construction is temporarily ceased and the access is reopened at a set weekly time to allow the business to continue receiving their regular weekly shipment of goods.

For a project example of this initiative, please see Appendix A of this attachment.

Business capacity building

Businesses impacted by construction often face decreases in revenue as customers may be deterred by reduced pedestrian or vehicle access, a lack of parking or a less hospitable or welcoming streetscape environment. Business capacity building initiatives are intended to help smaller sized businesses prepare for and endure construction impacts by making available consulting services to business owners in areas such as strategic planning, financial recordkeeping, marketing and use of technology to build their capacity. They are focused on helping businesses improve their own adaptive capacity. These initiatives are often utilized in projects where construction impacts an area (e.g. streets and corridors) where there are a number of smaller scale retail, personal service and food services.

Specific support strategies may include assistance for businesses with new marketing strategies to attract customers such as website development, special events, development of deals or promotions and strategic analysis to help businesses improve their understanding of their existing customer base and/or how to seek or attract new or different customer demographics. Strategies are often geared toward helping businesses diversify their revenue sources to increase resilience. For example, assisting a restaurant to shift to or increase their takeout, delivery or catering services to make up for loss of walk-in foot traffic as a result of project construction.

Small, family-owned independent businesses with one location tend to be the most vulnerable to construction disruptions. In some cases, these businesses have relied largely on cash transactions and bookkeeping may not be automated. Business capacity building programs can be particularly helpful for these businesses, as assistance with recordkeeping may help a business document construction-related losses which for those projects that have financial support programs, may enable them to qualify for other supports such as grants or loans. Business consulting services in some projects have been funded by the business support program and in others, in combination with other government funding or

programs, grants from private foundations or funds from local chambers of commerce or community development organizations.

Smaller scale, independent business are most likely to benefit from business capacity building initiatives. These businesses often do not have the resources or supports that larger businesses may have to draw on. As such, these initiatives can help to develop proficiencies and strategies to cope with project construction impacts. Additionally, these improved skills and proficiencies may also contribute to longer term business capacity improvement and overall resilience. Business capacity building initiatives are typically well-suited to projects that impact corridors, streets or areas where smaller independent businesses are populated.

Program success for these types of initiatives relies on stakeholder business awareness and participation. Businesses need to be made aware of these programs and know how to access them well in advance of construction in order that they may be effectively developed and implemented by the participating businesses. Typical business capacity building initiatives may have less relevance for larger scale businesses, but other adaptive business practices like transportation demand management strategies (i.e. remote working) could be employed by larger businesses (e.g. office buildings) where flexible work options could be used to support business continuity and reduce congestion in areas under construction. For this type of initiative, there needs to be alignment with interests and business models for there to be uptake.

Example of a business capacity initiative:

- Hiring a retail consultant with expertise in web based on-line retail to work with interested impacted retailers in transitioning elements of their business to an on-line sales model.

For a project example of this initiative, please see Appendix A of this attachment.

Marketing and promotion

Marketing initiatives to support businesses affected by construction are used frequently. Transit agencies, governments and impacted businesses recognize the importance of marketing to inform the public that businesses are open during construction. However, the success of these campaigns can vary. This may be due to a number of factors including the type and scale of construction impacts, the effectiveness of the marketing strategy itself, the marketing medium(s) utilized, or the degree to which the campaign or strategies are tailored to impacted businesses and their business interests.

Initiatives that are conducted in partnership between the government/transit agency leading the project and local businesses or business networks is common. These partnerships enable expertise and capacity to be combined so that marketing strategies are devised using existing marketing expertise, local business knowledge and experience, and intimate awareness of how construction impacts will affect businesses. This expertise is paired with government capacity and expertise to communicate with broad audiences.

Marketing campaigns and promotions can be tailored (or targeted) to specific businesses or business areas along the alignment as well as to the needs or interests of these businesses in relation to specific construction impacts. Typically marketing and promotional campaigns are targeted to support businesses that rely heavily on direct in-person customer patronage and access (e.g. retail, food and

personal services). They are often used for construction within and along corridors, streets and areas where these types of businesses are prevalent. Marketing initiatives and campaigns that elicit a “call to action” such as to visit, explore and support businesses in an area experiencing construction may have greater impact than campaigns used to generally inform the public that businesses remain open or notify of an upcoming event in the area.

Businesses across sectors and industries can benefit from marketing and promotional initiatives. They are adaptive and flexible, allowing for targeted support to be provided. The flexibility marketing and promotional initiatives is of particular importance with large-scale transportation mega-projects where there are typically a range of construction impacts and a variety of businesses. Marketing and promotion initiatives can be focused on supporting different businesses, at different times or stages and for different reasons as construction warrants and/or business needs inform.

Certain campaigns and promotional initiatives can be relatively costly, so anticipated value in relation to expense should always be considered. For example: How many businesses might a campaign support? How will they be supported if the campaign is successful? How and what will it take to deliver a marketing campaign or promotion that meets business objectives? Are there alternative marketing or promotion mediums or approaches that might achieve the same intent?

Examples of Marketing and Promotions initiatives:

- Green Line partnering with a local Business Improvement Area to sponsor or co-promote a community street festival or market event where local area retailers including those who are currently experiencing impacts of construction can participate.
- Organizing, promoting and facilitating construction tours for the public as a way to not only educate people about the Green Line project including the impacts of construction on stakeholders and communities but also to draw people to areas that are currently experiencing construction impacts.
- Featuring/showcasing a business that is impacted by construction on a Green Line project webpage.
- Working with businesses in an impacted area to develop unified special events or sales promotions that encourage people to visit an area and shop.
- Paying for/running a radio ad with a “call to action” for citizens to shop and support impacted businesses in a specific area along the alignment.

For a project example of this initiative, please see Appendix A of this attachment.

Procurement

Procurement initiatives or strategies are used to encourage a particular behaviour or activity that benefits an impacted business, community or member of a certain socio-economic group. These can come in the form of contract requirements, incentives and penalties based on performance, or specific initiatives and how this is approached, can vary considerably from one project to another. For example, there may be requirements set out for a contractor to source local materials, supplies and/or services for the project in order that the project investment benefits local businesses and employees. This could also be implemented through an incentive (i.e. credits for performance), or through a business support

program by incorporating socially oriented procurement practices that are focused on supporting businesses impacted by project construction.

How a project may approach the incorporation of such initiatives will be informed by laws, policies, as well as trade and other agreements. Where there are funding agreements with different orders of Government, these initiatives may be implemented in response to obligations set out in those agreements. For many Canadian infrastructure projects for example, there is a requirement for projects to implement Community Employment Benefits as set out by the Government of Canada.

Procurement initiatives that are focused on construction and traffic mitigation management measures often provide benefit to stakeholders, by way of impact reduction or mitigation and are therefore typically considered as stakeholder-oriented support initiatives. These requirements are typically incorporated in project agreements with the objective that the contractor becomes directly responsible to minimize and address a range of impacts that are associated with construction. A thorough understanding of stakeholder businesses including their interests, needs and operational characteristics helps to inform contractors which mitigating measures may be most relevant and feasible to implement both from the perspective of constructability impact and value for the businesses.

Financial incentives or penalty programs may also be implemented by the transit authority or lead agency as a method to further encourage contractors to minimize construction disturbances. These programs reward contractors for incorporating mitigation strategies beyond those included within the contract. Conversely, some projects may institute financial penalties for the contractor when adherence to expected construction impact mitigation measures are not upheld. To be most effective, these programs should have review methods which reward incentives only if the initiative in fact provides benefit to impacted businesses. Furthermore, there are also certain circumstances where these initiatives, may create little value for impacted stakeholders. For instance, with contractor penalty programs, there may be occasions where a contractor deliberately chooses to forgo implementing a mitigation measure as it may be more cost effective for the contractor to simply accrue financial penalties instead. Program complexity, potential increased project costs associated with rewards and the resourcing requirements that may be necessary for monitoring such programs should be factored when considering implementation of these types of procurement initiatives.

Social procurement initiatives are intended to encourage project procurement activities, when feasible that can be supportive of a wide range of local businesses. These initiatives may range from directing the procurement of materials from local suppliers and the use of local subcontractors, to the procurement of a wide range of other goods and services necessary to support the project, from businesses located within a certain defined proximity to the construction project. If there is appropriate flexibility with these programs, so that the project team is not absolutely bound to procure from local sources (particularly if goods and services are not available and/or it is simply not feasible/reasonable from a cost perspective), there appears to be little downside to these types of initiatives.

Examples of procurement initiatives:

- A requirement that the project contractor develop detailed construction mitigation plans prior to construction which detail how particular impacts will be addressed.
- A requirement that the project contractor, provides documentation demonstrating that they were able to communicate with all impacted landowners and businesses adjacent to a construction site prior to construction to communicate the anticipated impacts and expected mitigation initiatives.

- A requirement that the project contractor establish a plan for how they will support local and impacted businesses during construction
- A requirement that the project contractor employ a specific proportion (e.g. %) of their overall workforce with graduates from specific apprenticeship trade programs.
- A business support program may order catering from an impacted local restaurant to serve at a project information session/open house, procure the services of an impacted local print shop to produce promotional flyers associated with a local business marketing campaign initiative, or rent the event space of an impacted business as a venue to host a business stakeholder meeting or public open house, etc.

For a project example of this initiative, please see Appendix A of this attachment.

Workforce Training

Although workforce training initiatives are not necessarily directly focused on supporting businesses impacted by project construction, a number of large scale infrastructure projects have implemented or supported existing workforce training programs as longer term community oriented socio-economic support strategies. Some measures are developed as a direct result of requirements in the project funding agreements and others are implemented as part of a broader corporate initiative or program.

Generally, workforce training programs are aimed at training local labour forces and providing employment opportunities in construction. These programs are often directed toward disadvantaged socio-economic groups with objectives to ameliorate community issues such as unemployment, poverty and crime. In addition to supporting program participants, workforce labour programs can bring benefit to businesses along the infrastructure corridor, improve community image, create a larger customer base for existing businesses and serve as a form of mitigation for those impacted by the project.

Governments and transit authorities have used opportunities to integrate with existing educational and apprenticeship construction trade programs or to establish new programs that are linked to the project at-hand. In some cases, these programs are implemented via formalization in the construction contracts and delegated to the contractor. Aspects such as the proportion of labour required from select communities, participant eligibility criteria, remuneration (wage and benefit) requirements and location of training (e.g. at the project site or at existing trade schools etc.) are all aspects of these programs which can and have been mandated in project contracts.

In the broadest sense, communities and individual citizens alike benefit from when they have the ability to be and are gainfully employed. Although workforce training programs are not necessarily focused on targeted assistance to specific businesses, if these types of programs are successful there may be longer term benefits for certain businesses or business sectors, such as the construction industry.

A larger local labour force with training and skills in certain industries such as construction, may have positive long term benefits for that industry, including having greater future availability to draw on a locally trained and skilled labour force. Furthermore, with a broadened local labour force and increases in employment, there may be economic spin-offs that occur for local businesses – particularly if there is increased consumer capacity within local communities. While it may be difficult to correlate direct economic benefit with improved community image or morale due to increased levels of community

employment, improved community morale and optimism that may be bolstered by these employment gains should not be discounted. Improved morale and community image may translate into tangible financial benefits for communities by way of increased community re-investment.

When established and administered effectively, workforce training initiatives are reported to be highly successful and prove to be extremely beneficial for individuals who participate in these programs. However, concerns have also been expressed particularly in circumstances where the implementation of workforce programs have been formalized into construction contracts, and delegated to the contractor, but where performance targets were ultimately not achievable. Concerns have arisen in cases when contractual mandates have included the proportion of labor that should come from local communities (or other specific eligibility requirements), and there are deficiencies in the amount of trained or eligible individuals available to meet contractual requirements.

These programs and initiatives are also typically offered in partnership with existing local construction apprenticeship trade schools or programs. In some occasions, construction apprenticeship programs are established as a component of the transportation project itself. In any case, establishment of these workforce training initiatives must occur well in advance of project construction commencement so that an available pool of apprenticeship candidates can have time to participate and be eligible for employment in the project.

Many construction project based workforce training programs and initiatives are undertaken by transportation agencies operating in large metropolitan regions where oversight of multiple large-scale transportation projects is planned or are already underway. As such, the significant investment in project development, administration and partnerships can be justified as these programs/initiatives are replicated and applied across multiple projects within a region.

Examples of workforce training initiatives:

- Developing community initiatives such as marketing or educational campaigns in residential areas where the Green Line project will be built such as Millican, Ogden, Douglasdale and Ramsay to encourage and bolster local community member enrollment in Green Line apprenticeship programs.
- Establishing or partnering with an apprenticeship program, where participants have the opportunity to progress from receiving basic construction work job training and certifications, to skilled trades training, and on to any relevant supporting higher education opportunities.

For a project example of this initiative, please see Appendix A of this attachment.

Financial Support

Financial support programs typically consist of low interest loan and grant programs to compensate businesses for disturbances associated with a project's construction activities. The objective of financial support programs is on business survival. Specifically, that provision of direct financial support to businesses who experience decreased or declining revenues due to project construction will enable businesses to survive through the construction period rather than close down or relocate. Direct financial assistance programs are the most challenging support strategies to implement as they are often the most complex in terms of their funding sources, implementation, administration and program evaluation.

These programs are often administered by transit agencies and municipal governments in partnership with local banks, non-profit organizations, and foundations. In these programs, loans are often dispersed either as “microloans” to support short term or immediate business needs or as higher amount loans for capital improvements. In most programs, the loans have greater flexibility and lower interest rates than typical lending agencies. In certain cases, loans are forgivable if a business can meet certain provisions, such as remaining in business at the existing location for a select period of time post project construction. Financial assistance programs may have greater benefit when other business support initiatives are also in place, particularly those which may offer support and guidance to businesses on how loans or grants may be best utilized.

There is currently one Canadian example of a financial support program in Montreal. This program provides compensation of up to a maximum amount of \$30,000 per year with some limitations. It is applicable city-wide, applies to a broader range of project types (not a single project) and is funded through both municipal and provincial funding sources.

Other forms of non-direct financial compensation initiatives that provide financial savings to businesses impacted by construction may also exist. However, these types of initiatives were not encountered as specific examples in the Lessons Learned review. These initiatives may include potential tax abatement initiatives and the removal or abeyance of various business licensing fees and/or permitting fees for impacted businesses. However, as the agencies delivering these construction projects do not typically oversee these programs, partnerships and coordination with the municipal corporation(s) who typically oversee these programs is also necessary. As such, to establish and implement these initiatives, it is critical that the implications and ultimate feasibility for these types of initiatives be reviewed not only from the project perspective but also in consideration of the perspective and implications these initiatives may have on the municipality.

These programs are also usually targeted toward smaller sized, independent retail and service sector “mom and pop” type businesses - as evidenced through the business eligibility criteria that is often associated with these programs. To be eligible for these initiatives, businesses often need to be located adjacent to or in close proximity to the construction project. If located further afield, businesses typically must be able to demonstrate that negative financial impacts will be experienced as a result of the construction project.

Loans and grants are often provided with the intent to serve as “bridge” support funding for businesses during a period where decreased revenues are being experienced. Other loans and grants are provided for businesses to make capital improvements to their businesses, which may serve to counteract certain impacts associated with project construction such as improving a businesses’ main entryway façade.

Loan and grant programs may be viewed as successful in circumstances where eligibility criteria for businesses is lenient, the steps to participate are straightforward and program accessibility for businesses to participate is high. When these aspects are not in place, there was often far less business participation. The evaluation of program success can prove to be elusive as the criteria for measuring success is often variable. Business participation levels, the ability for businesses to repay loans versus default, the longevity of businesses that received loans and the ability and decision for businesses that received loans to remain in situ during and after construction are all varied but valid evaluative criteria.

In many of the programs reviewed, there was considerable variability reported with regard to the above criteria, making it challenging to evaluate program success. Additional concerns with these programs include reports from businesses that the maximum loan amounts per business in many programs were often not believed to provide adequate support. Program ineligibility for certain impacted businesses

that differ from small scale retail, food and sector businesses, was also noted where narrow business demographics targeted by these programs may preclude other businesses from participating and receiving some form of support. Maximum loan amounts that were typically granted may be assistive to certain small businesses but may have little to no supportive impact for other larger or different businesses and given the current economic context, these amounts may not be enough to support businesses already struggling. Finally, the organizational and administrative costs associated with establishing and administering financial support programs and initiatives (including partnering with other agencies) are often substantial.

Examples of financial support initiatives:

- A low interest loan in the amount of \$25,000 provided to an independent convenience store that is located immediately adjacent to a construction site where access to this business has been impacted considerably due to a required prolonged (e.g. 7 months) street closure. To be eligible for this loan, the business would have been required to demonstrate that they have experienced decreased revenues, based on financial records prior to construction.
- A \$15,000 grant provided to a small retail clothing store located adjacent to a construction site to make storefront improvements, such as exterior signage and lighting improvements as a way to offset the adjacent construction impacts and improve overall storefront presence and visibility.

For a project example of this initiative, please see Appendix A of this attachment.

Discussion and Applicability for Green Line

The alignment runs through areas that vary from suburban low density areas to high density urban areas and the city's downtown core, within which there is a wide range of stakeholders and a diversity of business types that will be considered as we build out the program and determine applicability of specific initiative types. Phase 1 of the Green Line LRT project covers a length of 20 km, and passes through 15 communities, with hundreds of businesses operating within one block of the Green Line LRT alignment between 126 Avenue S.E. and 16 Avenue N. The project is made up of various infrastructure components – stations, bridges, tunnels, surface running and elevated track, as well as buildings, roadworks, pathways and utility relocation works – each of these will have different construction impacts.

The communities and areas that Green Line will connect with and benefit includes low density residential communities, industrial areas, regional recreation and commercial destinations as well as established communities, main streets and the city's downtown core and high density neighbourhoods. Some of the stakeholders in proximity to the alignment are residents living in houses, apartments and care homes, large industrial operations, local, small-scale retail and service providers, as well as mixed use commercial, residential and high density office areas.

When we reflect on the lessons learned through our research and the applicability to the development of Green Line's approach for supporting businesses, there are some initiatives that are entirely applicable, others that may have some opportunities worth exploring further or that do not appear to have broad applicability to the project. To evaluate which type of business support program initiatives may be most applicable to Green Line, a detailed review of programs and initiatives and the projects

they were associated with was undertaken. The objective of this review was to learn about the details of various business support initiatives, the characteristics of the transportation projects they were associated with and the context within which these projects and support initiatives were delivered. Consideration was given to type and scale of project, construction timelines, means and methods of construction, business and community context/characteristics along the alignment, overall project budget, and budget allocation to initiatives. The following questions were used to allow for a more consistent comparison between initiatives:

- Who benefits from these initiatives?
- Which types of businesses are they typically targeted to?
- What are these initiatives used for?
- In what context do these initiatives work?
- Are there any shortcomings?

Assessment of Applicability to Green Line

Access and Construction management: Given the diversity of businesses along the Green Line alignment, many construction and access management initiatives can be replicated and implemented cost effectively. These initiatives can also be easily monitored and modified and even abandoned easily in response to changing construction conditions, stakeholder feedback, or simply if they are no longer working to address their intended purpose effectively. In some instances, to implement certain initiatives Green Line will rely on support from City Partners and City business units and departments when partnerships are necessary to implement initiatives. In addition to these initiatives, transportation management, access and construction mitigation, business continuity planning and stakeholder liaison and communications provisions will continue to be considered and advocated for as part of Green Line's procurement strategy. It is anticipated that good opportunities to minimize construction impacts on our business and community stakeholders will be made possible when access and construction management initiatives can be implemented in combination with procurement provisions.

Marketing and promotions: Most types of businesses across sectors can benefit from marketing and promotional activities as they are adaptable and have the potential for broad applicability across Green Line. Marketing campaigns and promotional support initiatives are often the most effective when created in partnership with local businesses or local business representatives. As several Business Improvement Areas along the alignment currently exist (Crescent Heights Village, Chinatown, Calgary Downtown Association, Beltline, Victoria Park, and Inglewood), partnerships with these associations will be leveraged to support the development of area specific marketing and promotional campaigns.

Building on opportunities for shared and collaborative marketing and promotional initiatives for businesses impacted by Green Line construction, a number of other agencies and programs in Calgary also exist with interests that are focused on supporting businesses and the local economy (e.g. City of Calgary - Business and Local Economy, Resilient Calgary, and Downtown Strategy, Calgary Economic Development, Calgary Chamber of Commerce, Tourism Calgary). Opportunities for partnerships and assistance with marketing and promotional initiatives with these groups may also exist and will be explored.

Business capacity building: Business capacity building initiatives in support of large-scale transportation projects can be successful in helping independent and smaller size businesses (retail, food, personal

services) that are impacted by construction to survive fluctuations in revenue and attract customers. These initiatives are often provided free of charge in one-on-one or workshop formats. With recent widespread shifts toward on-line virtual meetings and seminars, there may be newfound opportunities for Green Line to offer these initiatives widely in a relatively cost-effective manner.

Helping Calgary businesses develop adaptive capacities and resiliency by becoming more equipped to endure impacts associated with Green Line construction as well as other future shocks or disruptions is positive. There is current momentum and corporate and community support for helping local businesses and a number of existing resources have been assembled on The City's Business Hub, including business continuity planning resources developed by The City (CEMA) and additional resources through the Business and Local Economy program. Green Line will continue to explore partnership opportunities with these and other private programs or organizations, to seek out possible opportunities for efficient delivery of these types of support initiatives for stakeholders.

Procurement: In keeping with our current business practices in support of Green Line's early works utility relocation projects, we would anticipate a similar approach will be taken to incorporating traffic management, construction mitigation, business continuity planning and communications requirements as part of Green Line's procurement strategy to reduce or minimize construction impacts will also be taken.

In addition, and aligned with the City's social procurement objectives, the establishment of a Community Benefits Plan is a requirement for Green Line as part of our federal partnership funding for the project and will be implemented through project procurement. The framework for the Community Employment Benefits Plan sets out objectives for the sourcing of goods from local businesses.

Workforce Training: Transit agency/government implemented workforce training programs are more common in larger metropolitan areas than Calgary, where the transit agency often oversees numerous large scale transportation projects across a region on an ongoing-basis (e.g. Metrolinx in Toronto-Hamilton). In these circumstances, the considerable investment to establish and administer these types of permanent programs is warranted, as efficiencies are realized as programs are replicated and applied in support of multiple projects. These permanent programs are often supported by staff within these agencies in positions akin to Green Line Stakeholder Relations and Business Support program staff. Alternatively, in other projects without established permanent programs, apprenticeship programs are implemented via formalization in the construction contracts and delegated to the contractor.

The framework for the Community Employment Benefits Plan also sets out training and employment objectives for targeted groups and businesses via an Apprenticeship Program and a Diversity & Inclusion Plan. The Apprenticeship Program Plan is intended to provide construction apprenticeship opportunities for each trade required on the project and includes a focused program for women and local Indigenous peoples. As Green Line's redefined procurement strategy advances, it is anticipated that this current procurement framework and objectives for realization of the Community Employment Benefits Plan will remain, with the potential for refinement or update if warranted.

Financial Support: Of all the business support initiatives reviewed, financial support initiatives proved the most challenging to evaluate for utility. Across examples, there was inconsistency between what

program elements are reported and little consensus as to what aspects and outcomes constitute a successful program. In spite of these inconsistencies, there are some commonalities that were found which have helped to inform whether applicability of financial support initiatives to the Green Line project is warranted.

Financial support programs were found to be challenging to implement and complex in terms of their funding sources, implementation, administration and program evaluation. Partnerships between the transit agency and/or municipal governments with local banks, non-profit organizations, and foundations are usually necessary. The budgets associated with these programs were often significant (e.g. \$4mil (USD) St. Paul, \$50mil (USD) Seattle, \$10mil (USD) annually Los Angeles – Crenshaw/LAX metro) and the organizational and administrative costs associated with these programs are also assumed to be high.

These programs are usually targeted toward smaller sized, independent retail and service sector type businesses. However, due to a range of factors (external and internal such as program design and delivery), there was no guarantees of business stakeholder participation. Business participant satisfaction with the programs was also varied. Insufficient loan amounts to provide adequate support and low program uptake, often due to various unintended barriers to entry due to program design were commonly cited. Therefore, when we assess the learnings from these other projects and consider a number of factors with regard to applicability to Green Line, financial support initiatives are not believed to be a practical or cost-effective form of business support to pursue at this time. Particularly when there are other types of initiatives that may also offer support to impacted businesses that are also likely less expensive and complex to implement as a means of support.

Conclusion

Based on this review, we are confident that business support initiatives related to Access and Construction Management, Marketing and Promotions, and Business Capacity Building have broad applicability for the Green Line LRT project. There are opportunities to support small and medium local businesses through procurement and workforce training initiatives that have been identified as part of the Community Employment Benefits requirements in the funding agreement for the project. These will continue to be considered and advocated for during the development of the redefined procurement strategy. Initiatives related to Financial Support are more complex to develop and implement, and can have broader impacts for The City beyond a single project. At this point, the team will focus on five of the six initiatives as those which are considered most applicable support initiatives for Green Line business stakeholders.

As we continue to build the program and as more detailed construction information becomes available, we will use this information together with our understanding of the project and our knowledge of various business support programs to ensure that we are working to implement initiatives that will provide the greatest benefit and value to those stakeholders most impacted by Green Line LRT construction.

APPENDIX A

Business Support Program Initiative Case Studies

Initiative: Access and Construction Management

Project: The Broadway Subway Project

Summary: A current Skytrain expansion project in Vancouver. The Broadway Subway Project is a 5.7 km extension of the Millennium Line, from VCC-Clark Station to Broadway and Arbutus. The project will have 6 new underground stations.



Initiative Description: Access and construction management are playing a central role in the Broadway Subway Project. Ensuring that walking and wheeling (e.g. pedestrians, bikes, scooters, etc.) access to all buildings along the construction alignment, including to businesses is a program priority initiative and project requirement. Maintaining vehicular access to sites is also a priority.

- Specific construction methodologies have been selected in consideration of their access impacts on adjacent stakeholders. Tunnel boring for the underground portions of the alignment have been selected over cut and cover excavation.
- To maintain vehicular access and pedestrian access to adjacent businesses at underground station locations where cut and cover excavation is necessary, temporary bridging over the underground excavation areas are being installed to maintain traffic and pedestrian access and flow.
- Replacement parking strategies are in place to provide alternate locations for public parking when existing on-street parking stalls will need to be removed/closed to make way for construction.
- The project team is engaging with local businesses to project maintain visibility and access, mitigate construction impacts where possible, and providing timely information about traffic, parking and access.
- The project contractor is working with businesses and project partners, the City of Vancouver and TransLink, on a thorough wayfinding plan that includes parking and access mapping.
- To date, close to 2,000 surveys of businesses along the corridor have been completed. Feedback is being used to inform traffic and construction management and mitigation plans.

Initiative: Business Capacity Building

Project: Metro's Crenshaw/LAX Transit Project

Summary: This project began construction in 2014 and extends light rail transit service from the existing Metro E Line at Crenshaw and Exposition Boulevards in Los Angeles merging with the Metro C Line at the Aviation/LAX Station in the City of El Segundo. The line is 14 kilometers long with 8 stations and will serve the cities of Los Angeles, Inglewood and El Segundo when it is completed this year.

Initiative Description: In recognition of the importance of the importance that small businesses have on Los Angeles' economy and a well-supported public transportation system. Metro developed a pilot Business Solution Center (BSC) that provides hands-on business assistance and support services to small businesses along the Crenshaw/LAX corridor during construction. In addition to the BSC, a pilot Business Interruption Fund (BIF) has also been developed which is a financial support program for businesses impacted by construction. By 2019 the BIF was extended to other Metro transportation projects in the region and had assisted over 340 local businesses providing over \$20mil (USD) in funds.



- Small businesses can access the BSC for business and technical assistance including business development services and referrals to partnering business resource providers.
- Offered services are focused on, but not limited to:
 - hands-on business development and advice
 - coaching and technical assistance including referrals to expert professionals in the areas of accounting management and access to financial capital; branding, marketing, and social media.
 - Connecting businesses to specialized business services areas (i.e. cosmetology and restaurateurs); and information technology (i.e. website design and IT assessments).
- As of reporting from 2019, over 300 businesses accessed hands on training and over 1000 referrals were provided.
- Over 700 outreach activities to connect with businesses in support of these programs have taken place.
- 76% of business that connected with the BSC program remained in business 6 months after initial contact with the program.
- 20 business established websites for the first time to support their businesses.

Initiative: Marketing and Promotion

Project: MAX Yellow line: Portland Oregon

Summary: An LRT project in completed in 2004 with an alignment that begins in the downtown core and runs 9.3 km along Interstate Avenue, a key arterial road with a significant amount of small businesses.



Initiative Description: Overall this project has been lauded as exemplary for the ways in which businesses/stakeholders were supported during construction. A number of support initiatives were employed, including financial support, business capacity building, stringent contractor construction requirements and marketing and promotional campaigns.

Specific marketing and promotion campaigns included:

- Providing signage targeted at both pedestrians and vehicles, featuring the names of businesses, opening hours, parking, as well as entrance and detour directions.
- Development of The MAX Business Support program to attract more businesses to the corridor. Marketing strategies employed by the transportation industry TriMet the on behalf of the businesses included:
 - funding public advertisements on posters and buses
 - mail-outs of advertisements and coupons,
 - on-site promotions, sponsorship of special media and social events along the corridor
 - featuring stories about businesses and their owners in local papers
 - distributing flyers to assist with customer wayfinding
- Many of the businesses along the corridor took advantage of assistance offered by TriMet in developing new logos for the businesses in order to make their advertisements more eye-catching and effective.
- In recognition that it was challenging for customers to access restaurants along the alignment where construction was taking place, TriMet also implemented a highly successful Lunch Bus program that picked up customers in a central location downtown and ferried customers around to these businesses for lunch.

Initiative: Procurement

Project: Metro Tunnel

Summary: A metropolitan rail infrastructure project that is under construction in Melbourne, Australia. It includes the construction of twin 9-kilometre rail tunnels and five new underground stations through central Melbourne to connect two existing suburban lines and improve efficiencies for the city's existing central rail network hub.

Initiative Description: Through project procurement, a range of detailed initiatives have been incorporated for the project contractor as project requirements to safeguard measures on the Metro Tunnel Project for the benefit of the community and businesses in the form of Environmental Performance Requirements (EPRs). EPRs define the outcomes that must be achieved during the design, construction and operation of the project



An acoustical shed constructed over an underground station area to minimize noise and dust impacts on adjacent businesses/residences.

- Specific EPRs have been developed to ensure that the appointed contractors reduce and manage impacts and pro-actively engage with businesses.
- Business continuity plans outlining how contractors will manage impacts and provide support are required. These plans detail how the following measures will be undertaken:
 - Timely and regular communications with businesses including works notifications.
 - Maintaining access to businesses for customers, vehicles and deliveries.
 - Managing noise, dust, vibration and overall business amenity.
- Business Support Guidelines are also component of the procurement requirements for the project contractor. The project has implemented measures to support businesses in the various precincts by:
 - Promoting individual businesses and precincts through various communications channel.
 - Developing activation opportunities such as tailored events, leveraging existing events and pop-ups.
 - Developing partnerships with key stakeholders and organizations such as local councils, tourism organizations and business precinct associations.
 - Offering upskilling opportunities for businesses including engagement of specialists and one-on-one advice to businesses.
 - Developing Business Plans to assist businesses and the contractor to further understand how to best support businesses during construction.

Initiative: Workforce Training

Project: Eglinton Crosstown LRT

Summary: An under construction LRT project between east and west Toronto overseen by Metrolinx. A 19km alignment with 10km underground and 25 stations and stops.



Initiative Description: The Metrolinx Community Benefits (MCB) program was developed in support of this project in recognition that major infrastructure investments should also provide benefits for the communities where it is built.

- The MCB program framework targets: employment, apprenticeship, and local supplier opportunities.
- Program is oriented to provide a range of employment, training, and apprenticeship opportunities for historically disadvantaged communities and equity seeking groups.
- Information about employment, training, apprenticeship, and procurement opportunities are made readily available to residents, businesses and social enterprises.
- MCB program is applied across Metrolinx's other Toronto LRT projects (e.g. Finch West, etc.)
- Program is implemented by Project Co. as part of the project agreement, compliance is monitored by Metrolinx.
- Partnership with Government Ministry of Training, Colleges and University, and Community Partner organization established to support and provide inputs the program.
- Program initiatives in place to also encourage Project Co procurement of goods and services from Toronto based social enterprises.
- Metrolinx role to ensure that the community benefits commitments made by Project Co in the agreement maximize employment, training and apprenticeship opportunities and monitors and enforces provisions respecting the plan.
- Metrolinx employs a dedicated liaison to support the program and partners and also informs the program about any job opportunities at Metrolinx
- MCB plan includes communications measures to enhance awareness in communities about jobs and apprenticeships, Project Co team provides staff to support skills development workshops (professional and trade skills) and are guest speakers at high school 'Transit in your community' engagement programs.

Initiative: Financial Support

Program: Montreal – Financial assistance to institutions located in an area affected by major public works construction

Summary: In 2019 with provincial funding support, the City of Montréal launched a financial assistance program for certain types of small scale businesses (retail, restaurants, personal service, etc.) affected by construction impacts associated with major public works projects.

Initiative Description:

- This program is intended for construction work on sewer and water mains and transportation projects, such as subway expansions by the Société de Transport Montréal. It is a retroactive program back to projects in 2016/17
 - This program does not apply to the REV LRT project in Montreal which is under construction, but commenced prior to this program. It will be applicable for other Société de Transport Transit projects such as subway expansions where impacts on businesses are experienced
 - Financial assistance of up to \$40,000 per fiscal year is calculated based on a merchants' actual loss.
 - The loss of gross profit of businesses is calculated by comparing the gross profit recorded during any financial year during the construction site with that made during comparable financial years before the construction site. The first 5% of the gross profit loss recorded for a financial year is not covered by the grant program.
 - The construction impacts must be for a minimum planned or actual duration of at least six months.
- Construction impacts access to challenges to the business – e.g. vehicular traffic access, etc.



APPENDIX B

Business Support Program Project Case Study

Project Case Study:

MAX Yellow Line, Portland

Summary: An LRT extension project in completed in 2004 with an alignment that begins in the downtown core and runs 9.3 km along Interstate Avenue, a key arterial road with a significant amount of small businesses.



Initiatives: Overall this project has been lauded as exemplary for the ways in which businesses/stakeholders were supported during construction. A number of support initiatives were employed, including **financial support, business capacity building, stringent contractor construction requirements and marketing and promotional campaigns.**

Project	Details	Business Support Initiatives						Overall Program Success Rating
		Access + Construction Management	Business Capacity Building	Marketing + Promotion	Procurement	Workforce Training	Financial Support	
MAX Yellow Line	City: Portland Type: LRT Length: 9.3 km Agency: TriMet	✓	✓	✓	✓		✓	High Success

Highlights and Key Take Away

1. Comprehensive planning, clear communication with stakeholder businesses and communities, extensive documentation and timely reviews of lessons learned were attributes of this program.

2. The City of Portland identified the strength of the working relationships between the construction contractor, TriMet (Transit Agency) staff, and the community as a key factor responsible for the success of the program.
3. Businesses and residents identified by that the 'hands-on' approach applied by TriMet was a key component of the success of the community
4. Community Outreach – Stakeholder Relations a key contributor for project success:
 - Conventional outreach - websites (with Spanish information section), door-to-door canvassing, telephone campaigns, mailings, and advertising in local papers and newsletters ensured that a broad stakeholder base was reached.
 - For more in-depth discussions, TriMet provided the public with opportunities to attend project-specific meetings, and four designated community relations staff were dedicated to the project.
 - The community relations staff were available to the public 24/7 and were representative of the community, with each staff member either living in or having connections to the area.
 - The construction supervisors met one-on-one with affected businesses, and designated phone operators were available to answer questions, address complaints or deal with construction-related emergencies

Initiative Details

Access and Construction Management

- Required staging of construction in “reaches”, (i.e. sections approximately four city blocks in length) that would need to be fully completed in approximately eight weeks before beginning work on the next section. If there were any time gaps in construction phasing, all streets and sidewalks were required to be restored in the interim.
- TriMet was adamant about providing pedestrian access to businesses, thus business entrances had to be accessible to pedestrians at all times, and storefront construction could only be done before or after business hours.
- Construction activities were prohibited on public holidays, allowing businesses to maximize their seasonal income (Richardson, 2014).
- Supporting business signage and wayfinding plan established in support. Signage identified business names and hours of operation.

Business Capacity Building

- MAX Business Support Program was implemented by TriMet.
 - Facilitated technical workshops to support businesses.
 - Assistance offered to businesses to help them develop new logos in order to make their advertisements more eye-catching and effective.

Marketing and Promotions

For Businesses TriMet funded:

- Public advertisements on posters and buses
- Mail-outs of advertisements and coupons
- On-site promotions
- Sponsorship of special media and social events along the corridor
- Featuring stories about businesses and their owners in local papers
- Distributing flyers to assist with customer wayfinding.
- TriMet also implemented a *Lunch Bus* program that ferried customers around to the businesses along the alignment.

Procurement

See Access and Construction Management initiatives above that would have been implemented by procurement agreement.

Financial Support

Financial assistance offered in the form of business loans and storefront façade improvement funds.

Loans

In partnership with banks and City of Portland loans of up to \$25K granted with low 3% interest rates to mitigate revenue losses for 6-12 months while construction occurred in front of business.

Loan eligibility based on annual revenue, proximity to construction, construction period, documented losses, types of service provided by business,

Grants

Storefront façade improvement grants to assist business owners to renovate and improve their storefronts, and to make them more appealing to customers.

APPENDIX C

Major Public Transit Infrastructure Project Scan

Table 1 – Inventory of Business Support Initiatives

Project	Details	Business Support Initiatives						Overall Program Success Rating
		Access + Construction Management	Business Capacity Building	Marketing + Promotion	Procurement	Workforce Training	Financial Support	
MAX Yellow Line	City: Portland Type: LRT Length: 9.3 km	✓	✓	✓	✓		✓	High Success
Central Link	City: Seattle Type: LRT Length: 25.3 km	✓	✓	✓		✓	✓	Moderate Success
Central Corridor Light Rail Project	City: St. Paul/Minneapolis Type: LRT Length: 18 km	✓	✓	✓	✓		✓	Moderate Success
Phoenix Valley Metro Light Rail	City: Phoenix, Tempe, Mesa Type: LRT Length: 32.2 km	✓	✓	✓	✓		✓	Moderate Success
Canada Line	City: Vancouver Type: LRT (Skytrain) Length: 19.2 km			✓	✓			Moderate Success
Broadway Subway Project	City: Vancouver Type: LRT (Skytrain) Length: 5.7 km	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓		In Progress
Surrey Langley Skytrain	City: Surrey Type: LRT (Skytrain) Length: 16 km							(Project Planning/ Funding Phase)
West LRT	City: Calgary Type: LRT Length: 8.2 km				✓			Moderate Success
MAX Purple (17 AV SE)	City: Calgary Type: BRT				✓			Moderate Success

Project	Details	Business Support Initiatives						Overall Program Success Rating
		Access + Construction Management	Business Capacity Building	Marketing + Promotion	Procurement	Workforce Training	Financial Support	
MAX Teal	City: Calgary Type: BRT				✓			Moderate Success
MAX Orange	City: Calgary Type: BRT Length: 20 km				✓			Moderate Success
MAX Yellow	City: Calgary Type: BRT				✓			Moderate Success
Valley Line Southeast	City: Edmonton Type: LRT Length: 13.5 km	✓			✓	✓		In Progress
Valley Line West	City: Edmonton Type: LRT Length: 13 km	✓		✓	✓	✓		In Progress
Saskatoon BRT	City: Saskatoon Type: BRT Length: 38 km				✓			In Progress
Southwest Transitway (stage 2)	City: Winnipeg Type: BRT Length: 7.6 km	✓			✓			Moderate Success
Kitchener Waterloo ION Light	City: Kitchener-Waterloo Type: LRT Length: 14.5 km	✓	✓		✓	✓		High Success
Hurontario LRT	City: Mississauga - Brampton Type: LRT Length: 18 km	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓		In Progress
Eglinton Crosstown	City: Toronto Type: LRT Length: 19 km	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓		In Progress
Finch West LRT	City: Toronto Type: LRT Length: 11 km	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓		In Progress

Project	Details	Business Support Initiatives						Overall Program Success Rating
		Access + Construction Management	Business Capacity Building	Marketing + Promotion	Procurement	Workforce Training	Financial Support	
Confederation Line	City: Ottawa Type: LRT Length: 12.5 km	✓		✓	✓			In Progress
Réseau Express Métropolitain	City: Montreal Type: LRT Length: 67 km	✓		✓	✓			In Progress
Blue Line Subway Extension - STM	City: Montreal Type: Subway Length: 5.8 km	✓			✓	✓	✓	In Progress

Table 2 – Summary of Key Take Away

Project	Agency	Key Take Away
Max Yellow Line		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Business loans and grants for storefront improvements • Lenient eligibility criteria for loans • Detailed inventory/record keeping of stakeholder businesses • Construction phasing required as a means to maintain access to businesses • Successful marketing and promotional campaigns including the “Lunch Bus” program • Well organized, highly resourced community relations support team with vested interests in community and ‘hands-on’ approach
Central Link		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Many businesses that received financial support still closed or relocated elsewhere • A forgivable loan program for business to re-establish on the corridor was offered, but this did not guarantee the return of customers to the area and businesses still suffered • Relatively low business participation in business support program initiatives—likely attributable to the program’s lack of accessibility (e.g. linguistic and cultural barriers) to a wider range of stakeholder businesses
Central Corridor Light Rail Project		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Range of initiatives with varied success • Loan program was onerous for businesses to apply for, size of the loans not adequate amount to support • Program language barriers • not adequate funding to support certain initiatives throughout construction • contractor incentive program preformed moderately, businesses felt that the contractor still lacked compassion • well organized and appointed stakeholder communications and engagement supports instituted

Phoenix Valley Metro Light Rail		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Small business loan qualification too strict, limiting uptake • Contractor incentive program – majority of funding for contractor incentives was awarded, but it proved difficult to evaluate contractor performance by panels. In many cases where awards were granted, businesses were still unsatisfied with performance • Communications and outreach support for stakeholders organized by geographic zones along the alignment, and designated staff were established as a single (and direct) point of contact for stakeholders during construction
Canada Line	Translink ProTrans BC (operator)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Marketing Campaign (in response to business concerns re: construction methodology change from tunnel boring to cut-and-cover along majority of the alignment along Cambie Street • Marketing campaigns in support of businesses along the alignment “e.g. businesses are open along the Canada Line” • Campaigns were reactive and as a result may have had less success
Broadway Subway Project	Broadway Subway P.Co Translink (operator)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A comprehensive communications and community and business relations program will be in place to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Provide timely information about the Project, including construction, traffic and parking information. - Work with local businesses and residents to mitigate construction impacts where possible, and help manage issues as they arise. - Work with the community to promote alternative travel choices during construction. - Work with local businesses to maintain visibility and help customers access their shops and services • Construction Access Management for Businesses • Parking and loading zone management plan - City and Province are committed to ensuring adequate parking supply for businesses and residents through wayfinding towards off-street parking opportunities as well as reconsidering on-street parking regulations on nearby streets. • Street Use Merchandise and patios – assistance • Business Visibility – signage Assistance • Walking and Rolling (Sidewalk) Access to be maintained • Transit detouring • Motor vehicle detouring assistance • Tunnel Boring methodology selected due to lessons learned re: impacted businesses from Canada Line construction • Bridging over station boxes to maintain access • Program partnership between Province and City of Vancouver
Surrey Langley Skytrain	Translink	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • This project is still seeking funding, no formal programs have been developed.

West LRT	Calgary Transit	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No formal program
MAX Purple (17 AV SE)	Calgary Transit	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No formal program
MAX Teal	Calgary Transit	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No formal program • City of Calgary public engagement to inform construction phasing • Input collected during the final phase were considered as construction plans developed and before pedestrian bridges, connections to and from stations and landscaping were finalized.
MAX Orange	Calgary Transit	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No formal program
MAX Yellow	Calgary Transit	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No formal program • City of Calgary public engagement to inform construction phasing • Input collected during the final phase were considered as construction plans were developed and before pedestrian bridges, connections to and from stations and landscaping were finalized.
Valley Line Southeast	TransEd Partners and City of Edmonton	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No formal program • The Project Agreement required the following public commitments: • Provide notices about construction before and during to businesses, landowners and tenants • Access planning with industrial businesses • Commitments to minimize construction noise and vibrations • Coordination and communication with festivals and events to minimize construction impacts
Valley Line West	Marigold Infrastructure Partners and City of Edmonton	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Partnership Support: City has established 5 citizen working groups along the alignment to provide input and feedback at all project stages including construction • City is also committing to continue working with businesses to address access impacts and other potential impact mitigations
Saskatoon BRT	Saskatoon Transit	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No formal program
Southwest Transitway (stage 2)	Winnipeg Transit	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No formal program. • Construction and Access Management and Communications with stakeholders on a regular basis as part of the Project Agreement (procurement) • Partnership support in collaboration with the City of Winnipeg
Kitchener Waterloo ION Light	ION for Grand River Transit	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No formal program • Community Engagement Strategy – incorporated as part of the Project Agreement • Communications before and during construction with businesses (public meetings, one-on-one and small groups)

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Business outreach – direct contact with businesses (determining appropriate specific business contacts) • Informational materials and ongoing dialogue with key businesses and key business groups critical. In addition, business-related promotional efforts developed in conjunction with businesses and business-related groups to help overcome impacts during construction. • Tactics: Business Workshop Series: Preparing for Rapid Transit Construction • Construction Events: Midnight Madness, Movie Nights, Block Parties • Construction Update meetings • Music in the Zone: public art - musicians playing in the construction zone (day/night) • Area walks
Hurontario LRT	Metrolinx and Infrastructure Ontario (IO)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Metrolinx Community Benefits Program • Metrolinx Community Benefits Program brings people from the community to the table right from the start, providing opportunities to local residents such as employment, training, apprenticeship and local supplier and social procurement opportunities. • Project promotion of: • City of Mississauga Small Business Supports • City of Brampton Business Supports • COVID-19 Help for Businesses in Ontario • Establishment of project LRT community offices in both cities
Eglinton Crosstown	Metrolinx	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Metrolinx Community Benefits Program • Metrolinx Community Benefits Program brings people from the community to the table right from the start, providing opportunities to local residents such as employment, training, apprenticeship and local supplier and social procurement opportunities • Partnerships with Province
Finch West LRT	Metrolinx	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Metrolinx Community Benefits Program • Metrolinx Community Benefits Program brings people from the community to the table right from the start, providing opportunities to local residents such as employment, training, apprenticeship and local supplier and social procurement opportunities • Partnerships with Province
Confederation Line	OC Transpo	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • the Project Agreement outlined a series of obligations for how the winning proponent would support the City to communicate and engage with stakeholders including businesses in coordination with the City, provide regular updates to the immediately affected property owners and neighbourhoods on design and construction works related issues with particular attention to communicating

		<p>the scope, schedule and status of the Design and Construction Works and reasonable advance notice of the schedule, where possible. This includes processes to proactively address any design and construction works related inquiries and issues (e.g., public inquiries and complaints re noise, hours of work, dust, etc.)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Stakeholder Relations support geographically assigned (Stage 1) • Now in construction and community liaison model (where stakeholder relations staff are assigned to a geographic element of the project) has been very successful. • Regular presentations and communications with all affected stakeholders are ongoing
Réseau Express Métropolitain	Société de transport de Montreal	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Businesses impacted by this project not eligible for Montreal Business Support Compensation program
Blue Line Subway Extension - STM	Société de transport de Montreal	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Businesses impacted by this project may be eligible for Montreal Business Support Compensation program (TBC)