

Final Summary of PWC Recommendation 1

Information has been taken directly from the Forensic Investigation Report Ward 2 Expenses 2020 July 24, as provided by PWC in PFC2020-1143 Attachment 2. Administration has added an Update Column to the table below.

We set out below, under the applicable headings, are our recommendations for the City's consideration.

1. Recoveries

- a) Based on our assessment of the Claims as against the Policies and consideration of all voluntary reimbursements made by Councillor Magliocca, there is no current calculated amount owing with respect to deemed ineligible expenses. There is a calculated overpayment in the amount of \$563.66; however, this amount does not include the PFC's determination of the amount of air fare upgrades and eligibility of certain hosting expenses to be reimbursed, if any.

		PWC	Admin
Details		Amounts Deemed Ineligible	Update
Air Fares			
i	The PFC ⁽⁶⁶⁾ should conduct an assessment of Councillor Magliocca's premium/business class air fare charges and determine the cost of the upgrades; and, seek reimbursement, if applicable.	TBD	\$3,294.25
Room Accommodation			
i	FCM event, Halifax, NS: May 31 – June 3, 2018 Councillor Magliocca upgraded his room to a suite at the Delta hotel. The room upgrade was \$60 extra per night, totalling \$281.52 (including taxes and fees), which the City should attempt recovery.	\$281.52 ⁽⁶⁷⁾	
ii	FCM Director Debrief, Halifax, NS: June 3-5, 2018 FCM Halifax hosted a City Gala Reception and Dinner from 6:00 – 11:30 pm on June 3, 2018. This required Councillor Magliocca to stay in Halifax the night of June 3, 2018. Councillor Magliocca extended his stay 1 additional night (June 4, 2018) in Halifax, NS, to attend a FCM Director Debrief. On June 3, 2018, Councillor Magliocca checked out of the Delta Hotel (\$194/night + taxes) and into the Marriott (\$389 & \$319/night + taxes). The FCM's 2018 Director/1st Vice President advised us that there was no FCM Director Debrief held following the FCM Annual Conference and Trade Show held in Halifax, NS.	\$633.08 ⁽⁶⁹⁾	

	<p>Councillor Magliocca thought he may have had a meeting with ██████ on June 4, 2018; however, ██████ advised us that he was not in attendance.</p> <p>The increased cost incurred in staying at the Marriott on June 3, 2018, does not appear to be reasonable. In addition, we did not identify the additional travel costs related to City business or municipal government, which is the responsibility of the Councillor to clearly establish this relationship. As such, the increased cost and the additional night of travel totaling \$633.0868 which was expensed by Councillor Magliocca as lodging is deemed ineligible.</p>		
--	---	--	--

(66) In accordance with PAC007, the PFC has the authority to consider appeals of CCCO decisions. As such, the PFC's assistance is required.

(67) Councillor Magliocca repaid this amount pursuant to his voluntary reimbursements.

(68) Total lodging cost \$860.64 at the Marriott less \$227.56 (\$194 + taxes) for stay at the Delta on June 3, 2018.

(69) Councillor Magliocca repaid this amount pursuant to his voluntary reimbursements.

Details		Amounts Deemed Ineligible	Update
Room Accommodation			
iii	<p>FCM event, Quebec City, QC: May 30 – June 2, 2019</p> <p>Based on the information that we were provided; we did not identify a City business related requirement to substantiate the additional travel costs outside of the date parameters of this FCM event, which is the responsibility of the Councillor to clearly establish this relationship. The City should attempt recovery from Councillor Magliocca the cost of 2 night's room accommodation.</p>	\$582.30 (70)	
Personal Meals			
i	<p>November 21, 2018</p> <p>Councillor Magliocca claimed a total amount of \$132.00 for meals. This is \$7.00 in excess of the maximum daily allowance and ineligible.</p>	\$7.00 (71)	
ii	<p>May 31, 2018</p> <p>Councillor Magliocca's personal decision to purchase a meal at Waterfront Warehouse when food is being provided by the FCM conference, does not appear to be reasonable and should be a personal cost.</p>	\$ 46.35	
iii	<p>June 1, 2018</p> <p>Councillor Magliocca's personal decision to purchase a meal at Sackville Street when food is being provided by the FCM conference, does not appear to be reasonable and should be a personal cost.</p>	\$14.95	
iv	<p>June 2, 2018</p> <p>Councillor Magliocca's personal decision to purchase a meal at McDonald's when food is being provided by the FCM conference, does not appear to be reasonable and should be a personal cost.</p>	\$6.89	

(70) Councillor Magliocca repaid this amount pursuant to his voluntary reimbursements.

(71) Councillor Magliocca repaid \$89.10 pursuant to his voluntary reimbursements.

Details		Amounts Deemed Ineligible	Update
v	June 3, 2018 Councillor Magliocca's personal decision to purchase meals at Bluenose II restaurant (\$23.40) and Baton Rouge (\$58.65) when food is being provided by the FCM conference, does not appear to be reasonable and should be a personal cost.	\$ 82.05	
vi	January 21, 2019 Councillor Magliocca submitted a meal for reimbursement from Baton Rouge that was purchased in downtown Montreal. Councillor Magliocca advised us that it was expensed by error as he has never been downtown Montreal. As such, the meal is deemed ineligible.	\$35.34 (72)	
vii	March 14, 2019 Councillor Magliocca's personal decision to purchase meals at Barking Parrot Bar when food is being provided by the FCM conference, does not appear to be reasonable and should be a personal cost	\$66.15	
Hosting			
i	No Attendee Names Policies PAC006 and PAC007 and the attestation/certification provided on the Expense Report or CCC Statement requires the name(s) of the party hosted. 16 hosting events did not reflect the attendee names and deemed ineligible.	\$1,478.34 (73)	
ii	Duplicate Submission A hosting event held on November 20, 2018, at BierMarket Restaurant, Ottawa, ON, was submitted and approved on 2 separate occasions. \$117.46 (excluding tip) was the 2nd expense submitted and deemed ineligible.	\$117.46 (74)	

(72) Councillor Magliocca repaid this amount pursuant to his voluntary reimbursements.

(73) Councillor Magliocca repaid \$402.98 pursuant to his voluntary reimbursements.

(74) Councillor Magliocca repaid a total of \$180.52 pursuant to his voluntary reimbursements. This represents the cost of the 1st expense submission of \$135.08 and \$45.44 with respect to alcohol on the 2nd submission.

Details		Amounts Deemed Ineligible	Update
iii	Attendees Not In Attendance 1) There were 6 hosting events where all attendees confirmed they were not in attendance totaling \$770.24 ⁽⁷⁵⁾ .	\$770.24 (76)	
	2) The PFC should contact the reported attendees who have not responded to our request or whom we were unable to locate to ascertain whether they were in attendance in order to determine eligibility of the expense.	TBD	\$1,032.19

iv	Attendees In Attendance and Social 2 attendees advised us that they were in attendance at Councillor Magliocca's hosting event; however, the purpose of the meeting was purely social. The total ineligible costs is \$240.87	\$240.87 (77)	
v	Excess of Hosting Event Maximum Allowance d) FCM Laval, QC – \$0.00 (78) e) FCM Halifax, NS - \$86.66 (79) f) FCM Quebec - \$1,207.80 (80)	\$1,294.46 (81)	
Sub-Total		\$5,657.00	\$4,326.44
Less: Councillor Magliocca's Voluntary Reimbursements Councillor Magliocca's Voluntary Reimbursements following his review of the draft Councillor Magliocca's Voluntary Reimbursement 2021 March 11		(\$4,477.38) (\$1,743.28)	 (\$3,762.88)
Total		(\$563.66)	\$563.66
Net Total		0	

(75) The 6 hosting events are number 1, 2, 3, 4, 7 and 9, as reflected in the table contained in the Hosting section of this Report.

(76) Councillor Magliocca repaid \$752.37 pursuant to his voluntary reimbursements.

(77) Councillor Magliocca repaid \$230.30 pursuant to his voluntary reimbursements.

(78) Prior to the determination of ineligible expenses due to lack of disclosure of attendee names, the total hosting expenses submitted in excess of the maximum allowance was \$234.78. Once these ineligible amounts are taken into consideration, to prevent double counting, the calculated excess amount is no longer applicable for recovery purposes.

(79) Prior to the determination of ineligible expenses due to lack of disclosure of attendee names, the total hosting expenses submitted in excess of the maximum allowance was \$518.78. Once these ineligible amounts are taken into consideration, to prevent double counting, the calculated excess amount for recovery is \$86.66.

(80) Prior to the determination of ineligible expenses due to lack of disclosure of attendee names, attendees not in attendance and attendees in attendance but the event was social, the total hosting expenses submitted in excess of the maximum allowance was \$1,480.12. Once these ineligible amounts are taken into consideration, to prevent double counting, the calculated excess amount for recovery is \$1,207.80.

(81) Councillor Magliocca repaid \$2,346.91 pursuant to his voluntary reimbursements.