EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The City of Calgary has been providing quality affordable golf services to Calgarians since 1915. Golf Course Operations (GCO), a division of Recreation, manages eight (8) municipal golf courses and three (3) driving ranges at six (6) locations.

Golf Course Operations almost exclusively follows a self-supporting business model. While GCO has continued to meet commitments on the operating side of the business, capital and life cycle funding challenges remain. Capital investment is critical to enhance products and services aimed at growing the business, revitalize aging golf infrastructure, maintain quality in the facilities and services offered, and ensure the overall health and sustainability of the entire municipal golf course system.

To identify strategies for improving financial performance and sustainability, GCO undertook a systemic multi-faceted review of business operations which yielded a suite of recommendations to implement and investigate further as part of an overarching sustainability work plan. Several short-term strategies to improve operational performance have already been implemented or are currently underway. As one component of the sustainability work plan, to address capital funding requirements for the entire municipal golf system, the review identified McCall Lake Golf Course as an opportunity for redevelopment as it could provide a number of strategic financial benefits. These benefits included the elimination of the annual operating losses and the required capital funding for the site, as well as potential land sales that could provide a funding mechanism to address the remaining system-wide golf course capital requirements. Further, to meet recreation needs of surrounding communities, the McCall Lake redevelopment also identified the creation of a recreation campus on the north half of the site.

In 2012 October, Council directed Administration to further investigate the feasibility of the redevelopment of the McCall Lake Golf Course as the capital funding component for the GCO overarching sustainability work plan.

Throughout 2013 and 2014, Administration conducted additional analysis and developed the McCall Lake Redevelopment Feasibility Study as part of the necessary due diligence. This analysis explored the redevelopment potential and financial viability of a commercial/industrial area with land sales driving both objectives of meeting GCO capital requirements and funding of a new recreation campus.

Public engagement was also conducted to obtain citizen input regarding the potential redevelopment of the McCall Lake site and golf sustainability in general. Results from the public engagement suggest the majority of citizens (golfers and non-golfers alike) were not convinced the positives of redeveloping the McCall Lake Golf Course outweigh the drawbacks and that The City should explore alternatives to the McCall Lake redevelopment.

Findings from the McCall Lake Redevelopment Feasibility Study reveal that redeveloping the site would not achieve the project's objective to fully fund the required GCO capital improvements and the funding for the development of a new north recreation campus. Based on the findings from the McCall Lake Redevelopment Feasibility Study, Administration recommends that redevelopment of the McCall Lake Golf Course site does not proceed.

In light of the above findings and recommendation, an Updated Golf Course Operations Sustainability Work Plan (Attachment 2) has been developed and is being recommended for approval which continues the momentum of moving GCO towards sustainability in alignment with Council's approved Golf Course Operations Guiding Principles (CPS2013-0410) (Attachment 1) as they are relevant to all deliverables around GCO operational sustainability initiatives under investigation and being implemented by the municipal golf system.

ADMINISTRATION RECOMMENDATION(S)

That the SPC on Community and Protective Services recommends that Council:

- 1. Direct Administration to discontinue McCall Lake redevelopment planning and Outline Plan preparation;
- 2. Direct Administration to implement the Updated Golf Course Operations Sustainability Work Plan as outlined in Attachment 2; and
- Request that Attachments 6 and 7, McCall Lake Redevelopment Feasibility Study Redevelopment Analysis and Financial Analysis, be removed from this report prior to being forwarded to the 2014 July 21 Combined Meeting of Council and that Attachments 6 and 7 remain confidential pursuant to Sections 23(1)(b), 24(1)(c), 24(1)(g), 25(1)(a), 25(1)(b), 25(1)(c) of the *Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act* and that Council consider Attachments 6 and 7 in camera if requested by Council.

PREVIOUS COUNCIL DIRECTION / POLICY

In 1995, Council approved and directed that GCO operate under the mandate outlined in CS95-07:1995-1998 Golf Course Business Plan Report. Specific to the issue at hand, the mandate requires GCO to:

- 1) Return \$200,000 to general revenues annually and credit revenues above \$200,000 to the Golf Course Levy Reserve; and
- 2) Structure revenues and costs to position golf course operations as fully self-sufficient with respect to direct operating and capital costs.

On 2012 October 15, Council adopted CPS2012-0702 as amended, as follows:

- Approve, in principle, the elimination of the \$200,000 annual contribution to general revenues from the Business Unit Recreation – Golf, Operating Budget Program 426 and refer this recommendation to the 2013 budget adjustment process in 2012 November for consideration;
- Approve, in principle, the change of the Golf Course Operations mandate from "fully selfsufficient" to "tax supported" to align with the mandate of the rest of the Recreation Business Unit and refer this recommendation to the 2013 budget adjustment process in 2012 November for consideration;
- Approve the recommendations outlined in Attachment 2, Appendix 4 to develop a revised golf course fee structure and report back through the SPC on Community and Protective Services by 2013 May with a recommended golf fee structure;
- 4) Approve the McCall Lake Concept Plan and move forward with additional analysis in preparation for an Outline Plan as outlined in Attachment 2, Appendix 5; and
- 5) Direct that Administration Recommendation 4, as amended, and the Report and Attachments, remain confidential under Sections 23(1)(b), 24(1)(a), 24(1)(g), 25(1)(b) and 25(1)(c)(ii) of the *Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act.*

At the 2012 November 26, Special Meeting of Council re: Proposed Adjustments to Business Plans and Budgets, 2013-2014 Council, with respect to Recommendation 1 contained in Report C2012-0717, the Community Services and Protective Services Department: Recreation Business Unit, 2013-2014 Operating Budget Program 426, contained on Page 17 of Attachment 1, be adopted, as follows: Operating Budget (pg. 17), Program 426, Recreation, Adjustment #8, Page #16.

On 2013 May 8, Council approved Report CPS2013-0410 Golf Course Operations Guiding Principles for a Revised Fee Structure, as follows:

- 1) Approve the guiding principles as a framework for Golf Course Operations revised fee structure decision making; and
- 2) Direct Administration to bring a revised fee structure to Council during the 2014 budget adjustments process (2013 November) for consideration.

In 2013 November, as part of Proposed Adjustments to the 2014 Business Plan & Budget (C2013-0668), deferral of a Revised Fee Structure for Golf was included in the Omnibus Report on Referred Items (ATTACHMENT 5G) which stated fee adjustments are an integral part of an overall golf course sustainability strategy and are being reviewed comprehensively. Although the public engagement component of the program is complete, the associated analysis is well underway but remains incomplete. In order to finalize analysis and ensure a full suite of golf course fee adjustments are brought forward for consideration, the complete review of golf course fees will be deferred and forwarded as part of the 2015-2018 budget approval process.

BACKGROUND

In 2013, approximately 244,000 rounds of golf were played across all municipal golf courses. Specific to McCall Lake Golf Course, approximately 20,100 rounds were played at the par 3, and 32,500 were played at the18-hole course.

In 1995, GCO was mandated by Council to be self supporting for all directly related operating expenses and capital, plus contribute \$200,000 annually to City General Revenue. As a result, the Golf Course Levy Reserve was created which has been the sole source of funding for all capital development and serves as a buffer in years when inclement weather and other impeding factors prevent GCO from reaching budget targets. From 1995 through to 2012, the reserve was successful in providing \$3.6 million to General Revenue and \$14.0 million towards golf course capital lifecycle and improvements. In 2008, the Reserve opened with the largest balance in history. However from 2010—2011 the Golf Course Levy Reserve balance was reduced to under \$200,000 due to decreases in annual revenues primarily attributed to poor weather and also due to some trends like market shifts, and temporary closures or service interruptions at two City-operated golf courses.

Anticipating some of the changing landscape of golf operations and resultant challenges facing municipal golf, in 2010 October, GCO undertook a comprehensive and systemic multi-faceted review of its business operations. The purpose of the review, supported by consultants, was to identify strategies for improving financial performance, meeting capital requirements and enhancing long-term sustainability across the entire municipal golf system. The review spanned from 2010-2012 and comprehensive analyses work conducted included:

- 1. Operating Feasibility Assessment
- 2. Financial Scenarios and Strategy
- 3. Fee Structure Analysis
- 4. High-level analysis of operating / service delivery models
- 5. 10-Year Capital Investment Plan (\$34.5 million inclusive of \$6.7 million for McCall Lake)
- 6. McCall Lake Golf Course Potential Redevelopment Scenarios

GCO's review of business operations was presented to Council on 2012 October 15 through report CPS2012-0702 The City of Calgary Golf Course Operations – Operational Business Review and Update. Council adopted the recommendations to:

- 1. eliminate the \$200,000 annual contribution to General Revenue (\$3.6 M total contributions to date);
- change the Golf Course Operations mandate from "fully self-sufficient" to "tax supported" (for salary and wage increases which contribute less than 1.45% of GCO's operational budget – based on 2013 numbers); and
- 3. develop a revised golf fee structure.

In utilizing the Council approved Guiding Principles (Attachment 1) to establish a revised fee structure, it has become clear that the Principles serve as a framework to guide decision making related to GCO operational sustainability as a whole. Given they are now being used to guide additional sustainability work as noted in CPS2013-0410, they have been applied as a framework for all GCO decision making.

All three Council approved strategies serve to improve GCO's operating position. However, the challenge still remains for funding GCO capital requirements across the entire municipal golf system. Approximately \$34.5 million is required over 10 years across the entire municipal golf system, \$6.7 million of which was required at McCall Lake alone. As a result McCall Lake redevelopment analysis was also approved by Council in 2012 October as it was deemed the most viable option for addressing GCO capital needs within the framework of the self-sustaining model. Following Council's direction, Administration conducted an in-depth analysis on the proposed McCall Lake redevelopment throughout 2013 and 2014, refined the 2012 Concept Plan which led to a 2014 Concept Plan and a change from a Class 5 Order of Magnitude to a Class 4 Conceptual Design in alignment with The City of Calgary Corporate Project Management Framework (CPMF) Estimation & Contingency Standard.

A Historical Timeline of the above activities is summarized for reference in Attachment 3. Administration has reviewed and analyzed the McCall Lake redevelopment, along with financial and public engagement findings which are summarized in this Report and Attachments.

INVESTIGATION: ALTERNATIVES AND ANALYSIS

Following Council's approval of Report CPS2012-0702 on 2012 October 15, Administration conducted an in-depth analysis and due diligence in the form of the McCall Lake Redevelopment Feasibility Study to determine if the redevelopment could achieve GCO capital funding requirements and the creation of a new recreation campus.

The McCall Lake Redevelopment Feasibility Study consisted of the following:

- Attachment 6 (confidential): Redevelopment Analysis: Consultation with stakeholders and Approving Authorities, Identification of site limitations, constraints and risks;
- Attachment 7: Financial Analysis: Refinement of projected land sales and project redevelopment costs; and
- Attachment 5: Public Engagement Findings: Seven focus groups, Telephone Survey, Online weblink survey, two (2) open houses.

For the three aforementioned areas, a summary of the work conducted, including outcomes, is provided below. References to attachments and corresponding appendices which provide further information are also indicated.

Redevelopment Feasibility

As part of redevelopment analysis, Administration continued discussions with internal stakeholders and necessary approving authorities. In addition, reports and studies prepared for redevelopment purposes including environmental and geotechnical reports, water and transportation reports, utilities, grading and volume analysis, and land use planning and policy requirements were considered. The report information was then used to inform the design of the 2014 Concept Plan to redevelop the McCall Lake Golf Course site.

Items identified as potential site limitations or risks are as follows:

- 1. Two existing ponds would need to be filled in for the industrial/commercial development;
- 2. Birthplace forest, located in three areas, would need to remain onsite;
- 3. Approximately 1,200 trees, which are considered public trees would need to be removed;
- 4. An addition or extension of McCall Lake water body for stormwater management is required;
- 5. Offsite transportation improvements would likely be required due to current congestion along McKnight Boulevard;
- 6. Existing utilities onsite limit site grading options for redevelopment;
- 7. Calgary Airport Authority has indicated more restrictive zoning requirements may be forthcoming to accommodate larger planes, which would impact building heights that could be accommodated within the redevelopment;
- 8. Municipal Development Plan amendment would be required; and
- 9. Three of the four social recreation lease holders currently occupying 70 ac± (28.3 ha±) would need to be relocated or displaced.

Based on the development feasibility findings Administration concludes that there are a number of site limitations, constraints and risks to consider. More detailed information is provided in Attachment 6 and is considered confidential as it contains information that could have market impacts and business implications. To fully understand if the 2014 Concept Plan should proceed, financial analysis was required to determine if the project would achieve its original goals of funding GCO capital requirements and a new recreation campus.

Financial Feasibility

A financial analysis was undertaken to determine if the 2014 Concept Plan and projected land sales would meet the goals of financial return towards GCO capital requirements and the creation of a new recreation campus.

The findings from the financial review indicated that:

- The 2014 Concept Plan did not yield the total funding requirements required for GCO capital requirements,
- No funds would be available to develop the new recreation campus, and
- As it is currently unknown if social recreation lease holders would be accommodated on the site following the redevelopment, potential support in alternate relocation would need to be considered if lease holders are displaced.

Detailed financial analysis is included in Attachment 7 and is considered confidential as it includes land sales valuations.

Administration conducted a variance analysis of the 2012 Concept Plan presented to Council on 2012 October 15 and the revised 2014 Concept Plan. The major discrepancies between the two scenarios are:

1. Reduced Amount of Land Available for Redevelopment Purposes

The McCall Lake 2012 Concept Plan illustrated a business park immediately north of the McCall Lake water body. During further discussions with the Calgary Airport Authority, it was revealed that more restrictive zoning requirements would likely be pursued to accommodate larger planes. These restrictions remove a significant portion of land available for redevelopment / sale and also limit building heights, greatly diminishing land values and redevelopment potential.

2. Adjustment of Revenue for Parcels

The 2012 Concept Plan based land sale revenues on the envisioned Urban Corridor for 32 Avenue as outlined in The City of Calgary Municipal Development Plan, which would yield significantly higher land values than what currently could be realized. As a result, land values are lower than originally projected.

3. Redevelopment Analysis

Site constraints, limitations and risks identified through additional analysis increase redevelopment costs which in turn reduce revenues that could be generated. In addition, the 2014 Concept Plan estimate includes acreage assessment fees, which are significant, that were not included in the 2012 Concept Plan estimate.

At the early onset of any project, not all project costs, limitations and risks will be known until complete and detailed analysis is undertaken. The 2012 Concept Plan was based on preliminary information and considered a high level estimate. The additional McCall Lake analysis conducted in 2013 and 2014, demonstrates both Council and Administration value the due diligence and research a project requires ensuring informed decisions are made. The analysis herein affirms the step-wise approach that was taken to carefully identify redevelopment potential and feasibility of the 2014 Concept Plan was imperative and it is now clear an alternate funding mechanism for GCO capital is required.

To ensure due diligence, in addition to the Status Quo and 2014 Concept Plan options, Administration evaluated four (4) alternative redevelopment options (considered as Class 5

Order of Magnitude estimates) to determine if project goals could be met through these scenarios:

Original Options:

- 1 Status Quo
- 2 2014 Concept Plan

Four Alternative Redevelopment Options Evaluated:

- 3 Redevelop Driving Range Only
- 4 Redevelop Driving Range & and Par 3 course
- 5 Redevelop McCall Lake Golf Course Only (Exclude existing Social Recreation leaseholder lands)
- 6 Sell Entire Parcel as Raw Land

A summary of environmental, social and economic impacts of each additional evaluated alternative scenario is included in Attachment 4. Administration notes the financial analysis of these alternative scenarios do not meet the full purposes of Golf Course Operations capital program and new recreation campus development. The additional financial analysis of the alternate development options further supports the conclusion that McCall Lake redevelopment planning and preparation be discontinued.

Without sufficient capital investment funding to support municipal golf courses, assets and infrastructure will fall into a state of disrepair over time. Opportunities to enhance products and services aimed at growing the business will also not be realized. As a result, the quality of the customer experience risks going into a state of decline leading to lost revenues and overall market share. Further, it is The City's obligation to the public to steward and maintain these assets. At this time, potential alternatives to the capital funding issue require further investigation in order to identify a clear solution. GCO will continue to implement ongoing efficiencies and optimization strategies to enhance operating performance in the short to midterm in an effort to realize cost savings and bolster revenues from operations. As outlined in Attachment 2, GCO will continue to undertake steps to enhance financial sustainability within the framework of GCO's Guiding Principles for decision making.

Stakeholder Engagement, Research and Communication

As part of the feasibility study, Administration offered several public engagement opportunities from 2014 January to April in order to gather citizen and stakeholder input and perspectives regarding the proposed redevelopment of the McCall Lake Golf Course and golf sustainability in general. This work included seven focus groups, two open houses, a telephone survey, an online weblink survey that mirrored the telephone survey, and comments captured through 311.

The public engagement was developed with three goals in mind:

- provide additional background information to citizens on the overall issue of golf sustainability
- share the research and work that has led to the potential redevelopment of the McCall Lake Golf Course

• provide opportunities for citizen input on golf sustainability and possible alternative solutions to the redevelopment of McCall Lake

The public engagement opportunities were communicated through a media release in 2014 January and posted on The City's website to draw awareness to the different channels available for citizens to provide input.

Summary of findings:

The public engagement findings provide different perspectives regarding the proposed redevelopment of the McCall Lake Golf Course. While many respondents understand the reasons and benefits for the proposed redevelopment, overall, the majority of respondents feel the drawbacks of redeveloping the McCall Lake golf course outweigh the positives.

Top drawbacks identified for redeveloping McCall Lake include the loss of a City-operated golf course, lack of tee-time availability and overcrowding at other City-operated golf courses, loss of green space/environmental impacts, and negative social impacts for citizens' quality of life.

Some participants perceive the redevelopment to be a "band-aid" solution that would not address the long-term sustainability needs of City-operated golf courses. The large majority of people expressed hope that The City would explore alternatives to the closure.

The public engagement findings indicate that citizens are concerned about the negative implications for redeveloping the McCall Lake golf course, with the loss of valuable green space being a primary concern raised across all engagement streams.

The findings highlight several citizen concerns should the redevelopment proceed and that there is a desire for The City to explore alternatives to the redevelopment. A more detailed summary of the public engagement findings and related reports is provided in Attachment 5. In conjunction with the redevelopment and financial analysis, the public engagement findings are an important component of the McCall Lake Redevelopment Feasibility Study.

Social Recreation Lease holders

The Social Recreation Leases at the McCall site currently include: Calgary Slo-Pitch Society, Calgary Industrial Softball Association (CCIAC), Calgary Canadian Irish Athletic Club, and the Calgary Rifle and Pistol Club (CRPC). Several of these groups have been lease holders and operators of the site for 25-30 years. A letter provided by Calgary Slo-Pitch Society voicing concern over the redevelopment can be found in Attachment 5.

Save McCall Lake group (SMLG)

At the 2014 April 14 focus group session with the SMLG, a report and presentation were provided by SMLG members in attendance. This information is provided in Attachment 5.

Golf Management Advisory Committee (GMAC)

GMAC is comprised of a cross section representation of golf course users who act as the voice for GCO customers. A letter responding to and opposing the proposed McCall Lake development from GMAC can be found in Attachment 5.

Strategic Alignment

GCO as part of Recreation's opportunities and services provided to Calgarians aligns with Council's Fiscal Plan for Calgary under "Investing in great communities and a vibrant urban fabric". GCO's long-term sustainability requirements align with this Fiscal Plan priority, in particular, with "investing in lifecycle maintenance of existing community infrastructure". Positioning GCO with further alignment under the Recreation Master Plan supports its mandate to develop and manage a comprehensive recreation service delivery continuum, which is the most effective way to provide Calgarians affordable, accessible and relevant recreation opportunities.

Social, Environmental, Economic (External)

<u>Social</u>

Over GCO's 100 years of service provision, golf has been woven into Calgary's municipal recreation landscape and now provides a major source of recreation opportunities for citizens (i.e. average of 245,000 rounds annually). Having such a service available to them is a key component of citizens' satisfaction with recreational opportunities and overall quality of life in Calgary. In addition, mainstream golf services which support healthy lifestyles, GCO provides a variety of services, programs and special events that strengthen families and social connections. For many, the affordability of municipal golf is the difference between a citizens' ability to participate in the sport or not being able to participate at all.

Municipal golf services promote active healthy lifestyles, make Calgary a more attractive place to live, enhance quality of life, and build a sense of community. GCO is committed to ensuring long-term sustainability and the ongoing provision of customer focused, affordable golf services to Calgarians into its one hundredth year of service

Environmental

There are no evident environmental implications to the recommendations in this report.

Economic

Municipal golf facilities provide green space relief and affordable recreational opportunities which contributes to making Calgary an attractive place for visitors and businesses alike.

Financial Capacity

Current and Future Operating Budget:

The recommendations approved by Council on 2012 October 15 (CPS2012-0702), along with ongoing work, will allow GCO to continue to provide quality, affordable recreational golf services to Calgarians. These strategies will improve GCO's operating budget position. Ongoing work includes several initiatives to optimize operational efficiencies, see Attachment 2.

Current and Future Capital Budget:

Based on the findings from the McCall Lake Feasibility Study, alternative sources of capital funding should be investigated. GCO unfunded capital requirements will be put forward to the Culture Parks and Recreation Infrastructure Investment Plan (CPRIIPS) to be included as part of the 2015 – 2018 Action Plan deliberations. Over time, quality of service impacts due to lack of capital investment funding is anticipated and acknowledged. To investigate alternate sources for

capital funding while moving forward on a continued operational basis, an Updated Golf Course Operations Sustainability Work Plan is outlined in Attachment 2.

Risk Assessment

In the short-term, a lack of immediate funding for capital requirements will delay GCO's ability to address infrastructure needs aimed at sustaining quality municipal golf course facilities. Investigation of alternative capital funding opportunities is required to identify a long term sustainability solution. Without reasonable capital investment, over time GCO will be unable to maintain current levels of service and opportunities to enhance products and services aimed at growing the business will also not be realized. As a result, the quality of the customer experience risks going into a state of decline leading to lost revenues and overall market share. GCO will continue to rely on revenues to support operations, however, there is the potential for an operating shortfall to be experienced in any given year due to impacts of inclement weather or other factors. A shortfall however, would be offset through the Golf Course Levy Reserve. Subject to funding available in the Reserve, modest financial support through the Recreation business unit may or may not be required.

REASON(S) FOR RECOMMENDATION(S):

From the outset of the project, the proposed redevelopment of McCall Lake was driven by redevelopment revenue potential to support the capital requirements for the entire municipal golf system and a new recreation campus. The Feasibility Study indicates that the original project goals will not be met through the redevelopment of McCall Lake. Additionally, numerous constraints and risks have been identified through the analysis, highlighting a variety of challenges for redevelopment of the site. For these reasons it is recommended that the planning and preparation to redevelop McCall Lake does not continue.

To address ongoing municipal golf sustainability needs, GCO will continue to work within the framework of GCO Guiding Principles to achieve operational sustainability and identify a source of capital funding by undertaking the initiatives as outlined in Attachment 2. In the meantime, GCO will continue to rely on revenues to support operations and aim to optimize and seek efficiencies.

As Attachments 6 and 7, McCall Lake Redevelopment Feasibility Study – Redevelopment Analysis and Financial Analysis, contains potential land sales information that could have market impacts and business implications it is recommended that Attachments 6 and 7 remain confidential pursuant to Sections 23(1)(b), 24(1)(a), 24(1)(c), 24(1)(g), 25(1)(a), 25(1)(b), 25 (1)(c) of the Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act.

ATTACHMENTS

- 1. Golf Course Operations Guiding Principles
- 2. Updated Golf Course Operations Sustainability Work Plan
- 3. Golf Course Operations Historical Timelines
- 4. McCall Lake Redevelopment Feasibility Study Alternate Redevelopment Options
- 5. McCall Lake Redevelopment Feasibility Study Public Engagement Findings
- 6. McCall Lake Redevelopment Feasibility Study Redevelopment Analysis (Confidential)
- 7. McCall Lake Redevelopment Feasibility Study Financial Analysis (Confidential)