



**MINUTES
AUDIT COMMITTEE**

**September 6, 2019, 9:30 AM
IN THE COUNCIL CHAMBER**

PRESENT: Councillor E. Woolley, Chair
Councillor J. Gondek, Vice-Chair
Councillor G-C. Carra
Councillor J. Farkas
Citizen Representative L. Caltagirone
Citizen Representative M. Dalton
Citizen Representative M. Lambert

ALSO PRESENT: Acting Chief Financial Officer, C. Male
City Auditor K. Palmer
Executive Assistant C. Smillie
External Auditor H. Gill
Acting City Clerk K. Martin
Legislative Advisor J. Palaschuk

1. CALL TO ORDER

Councillor Woolley called the Meeting to order at 9:33 a.m.

2. OPENING REMARKS

Councillor Woolley provided opening remarks and introduced Shahid Qureshi, a former member of the Audit Committee.

3. CONFIRMATION OF AGENDA

Moved by Councillor Carra

That the Agenda for the 2019 September 6 Regular Meeting of the Audit Committee be confirmed.

MOTION CARRIED

4. CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES

4.1 Minutes of the Regular Meeting of the Audit Committee, 2019 July 23

Moved by Citizen Representative Caltagirone

That the Minutes of the 2019 July 23 Regular Meeting of the Audit Committee be confirmed.

MOTION CARRIED

5. CONSENT AGENDA

5.1 DEFERRALS AND PROCEDURAL REQUESTS

None

5.2 BRIEFINGS

None

6. POSTPONED REPORTS

None

7. ITEMS FROM OFFICERS, ADMINISTRATION AND COMMITTEES

7.1 Calgary Police Commission Finance and Audit Committee Annual Report, AC2019-0629

A document entitled 'Calgary Police Service Financial Statements' dated 2018, December 31, was distributed with respect to Report AC2019-0629.

Moved by Councillor Gondek

That with respect to Report AC2019-0629, the following be approved:

That the Audit Committee receives the verbal presentation and distribution from the Calgary Police Commission for information.

MOTION CARRIED

7.2 Calgary Parking Authority Annual Report to Audit Committee, AC2019-0630

A revised Attachment 5 was distributed with respect to Report AC2019-0630.

Moved by Citizen Representative Dalton

That with respect to Report AC2019-0630, the following be approved:

That the Audit Committee receive the presentation from the Calgary Parking Authority for information and the Corporate Record.

MOTION CARRIED

7.3 Green Line LRT - Project Governance Update (Verbal), AC2019-1107

Moved by Councillor Carra

That with respect to Verbal Report AC2019-1107, the following be approved:

That the Audit Committee receive Verbal Report, Green Line LRT - Project Governance Update, for information.

MOTION CARRIED

7.4 Human Resources Challenges and Opportunities (Verbal), AC2019-1095

Committee, by general consent, suspended Section 78(2)(a) of the Procedure Bylaw, 35M2017, as amended, to complete the remainder of the Agenda prior to the scheduled lunch recess.

Moved by Councillor Gondek

That with respect to Verbal Report AC2019-1095, the following be approved:

That the Audit Committee receive the presentation from Human Resources for information and for the Corporate Record.

MOTION CARRIED

7.5 Supply Management Warehouse and Inventory Audit, AC2019-1027

Moved by Citizen Representative Lambert

That with respect to Report AC2019-1027, the following be approved:

That the Audit Committee:

1. Receive report AC2019-1027 for the **Corporate Record**; and
2. Recommend that Council receive Report AC2019-1027 for the **Corporate Record**

MOTION CARRIED

8. ITEMS DIRECTLY TO COMMITTEE

8.1 REFERRED REPORTS

8.1.1 Comprehensive Public Sector Pension Review, (C2019-0568), AC2019-1041

A Supplementary Report was distributed with respect to Report AC2019-1041.

Moved by Councillor Gondek

That with respect to Report AC2019-1041, the following be approved:

That the Audit Committee recommends Council direct Audit Committee to provide final recommendations on how to best achieve the intent of Notice of Motion C2019-0568 at the 2019 November 18 Combined Meeting of Council.

MOTION CARRIED

Moved by Councillor Gondek

That Committee reconsider its decision with respect to Report AC2019-1041

MOTION CARRIED

Moved by Councillor Gondek

That with respect to Report AC2019-1041, the following be approved:

1. That Council approve the Audit Committee request to defer their September Report to 2019 November to allow the Working Group the opportunity to complete their work; and
2. The Audit Committee accept the distributed Report into the Corporate Record.

MOTION CARRIED

8.2 NOTICE(S) OF MOTION

None

9. URGENT BUSINESS

None

10. CONFIDENTIAL ITEMS

Moved by Councillor Farkas

That pursuant to Sections 16 (Disclosure harmful to business interests of a third party), 19 (Confidential evaluations), 24 (Advice from officials), and 25 (Disclosure harmful to economic and other interests of a public body) of the *Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act*, the Audit Committee move into Closed Meeting in the Council Lounge, at 12:26 p.m. to discuss confidential matters, with respect to the following items:

- 10.1.1. Audit Forum (Verbal), AC2019-0993
- 10.1.2. External Auditor (Verbal), AC2019-0994
- 10.1.3. City Auditor (Verbal), AC2019-0995
- 10.1.4. External Auditor 2018-2019 Performance Assessment, AC2019-0937

And further, that Harman Gill and Ivana Cvitanusic, External Auditors, (Deloitte LLP), be invited to attend the Closed Meeting.

MOTION CARRIED

Committee moved into Public Meeting at 1:01 p.m. with Councillor Woolley in the Chair.

Moved by Councillor Gondek

That Committee rise and report.

MOTION CARRIED

10.1 ITEMS FROM OFFICERS, ADMINISTRATION AND COMMITTEES

10.1.1 Audit Forum (Verbal), AC2019-0993

People in attendance during the Closed Meeting discussions with respect to Report AC2019-0993:

Administration: K. Martin. Advice: C. Male. Observer: K. Palmer and C. Smillie. External Advice: H. Gill and I. Cvitanusic.

Moved by Citizen Representative Lambert

That with respect to Verbal Report AC2019-0993, the following be approved:

That the Audit Committee:

1. Receive Verbal Report AC2019-0993 for information; and
2. Direct the Closed Meeting discussions remain confidential pursuant to Sections 24 (Advice from officials) and 25 (Disclosure harmful to economic and other interests of a public body) of the *Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act*.

MOTION CARRIED

10.1.2 External Auditor (Verbal), AC2019-0994

No report was given.

10.1.3 City Auditor (Verbal), AC2019-0995

People in attendance during the Closed Meeting discussions with respect to Report AC2019-0995:

Administration: K. Martin. Advice: C. Male. Observer: K. Palmer and C. Smillie.

Moved by Citizen Representative Caltagirone

That with respect to Verbal Report AC2019-0995, the following be approved:

That the Audit Committee:

1. Receive Verbal Report AC2019-0995 for information; and
2. Direct the Closed Meeting discussions remain confidential pursuant to Section 24 (Advice from officials) of the *Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act*.

MOTION CARRIED

10.1.4 External Auditor 2018 - 2019 Performance Assessment, AC2019-0937

A revised confidential Attachment 1 was distributed with respect to Report AC2019-0937.

People in attendance during the Closed Meeting discussions with respect to Report AC2019-0937:

Administration: K. Martin. Advice: C. Male. Observer: C. Smillie.

Moved by Councillor Farkas

That with respect to Report AC2019-0937, the following be approved:

That the Audit Committee:

1. Receive Report AC2019-0937 for the Corporate Record;
2. Forward the Report and Attachments to Council for information; and
3. Direct the Report, revised Attachments, and Closed Meeting discussions remain confidential pursuant to Sections 16 (Disclosure harmful to business interests of a third party) and 19 (Confidential evaluations) of the *Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act*, to be reviewed by 2034 September 06.

MOTION CARRIED

10.2 URGENT BUSINESS

None

11. ADJOURNMENT

Moved by Citizen Representative Lambert

That this meeting adjourn at 1:05 p.m.

MOTION CARRIED

The following items have been forwarded to the 2019 September 30 Combined Meeting of Council:

CONSENT:

- Supply Management Warehouse and Inventory Audit, AC2019-1027

CONFIDENTIAL CONSENT:

- External Auditor 2018-2019 Performance Assessment, AC2019-0937

The next Regular Meeting of the Audit Committee is scheduled to be held 2019 October 24

CONFIRMED BY COMMITTEE ON

CHAIR

ACTING CITY CLERK

UNCONFIRMED